4-9-2007

Putting the Diplomacy Back in HydroDiplomacy

Ken Moraff

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.umass.edu/wrrc_conf


This is brought to you for free and open access by the Water Resources Research Center at ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. It has been accepted for inclusion in Water Resources Research Center Conferences by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. For more information, please contact scholarworks@library.umass.edu.
Putting the Diplomacy Back in HydroDiplomacy

April 9, 2007
Interstate environmental problems are likely to be large and complex.

Decisions about large, complex environmental problems are always hard – but difficulty is compounded if issues cross state lines.

States have legitimate reasons for different points of view – it’s not just politics.

If we identify the reasons why states disagree, we can address them and increase the likelihood that states will work together.
Why Decisions are Hard

- Uncertainty about problems
  - we don’t have enough data
  - the models aren’t perfect
  - we don’t fully understand the problem’s causes
  - we don’t fully understand the contribution of each cause
  - We don’t have complete information about the problem’s extent
Why Decisions are Hard (con’t)

• Uncertainty about solutions
  – we don’t know how far we need to go (how much overall reduction/treatment/remediation is needed)
  – we don’t know how to allocate responsibility among sources
  – we don’t know how well different solutions will work
Why Decisions are Hard (con’t)

- Concern about cost
  -- cost of remedy is high
  -- affordability issues
  -- cost-benefit issues
Why Decisions are Hard (con’t)

• Political concerns
  -- Is there political will to address the problem?
  -- Is there political opposition to the remedy?
How well do we understand the problem?

- know little
- wait and see; further study
- take action
- know a lot
Decision depends on more than one factor

How well do we understand the problem?

- Cost of solution
  - low
  - high

- Know
  - little
  - a lot

- Wait and see; further study
- Take action
Cost of solution

Uncertainty about extent

Uncertainty about cause
Cost of solution
Uncertainty about extent
Uncertainty about cause
Severity of problem
SEVERITY OF PROBLEM

COST

POLITICS

UNCERTAINTY RE: CAUSE

UNCERTAINTY RE: EXTENT

UNCERTAINTY RE: SOLUTION

SEVERITY OF PROBLEM
SEVERITY OF PROBLEM

COST

POLITICS

UNCERTAINTY RE: CAUSE

UNCERTAINTY RE: EXTENT

UNCERTAINTY RE: SOLUTION

UNCERTAINTY RE: EXTENT
SEVERITY OF PROBLEM

UNCERTAINTY RE: CAUSE

UNCERTAINTY RE: EXTENT

POLITICS

UNCERTAINTY RE: SOLUTION
SEVERITY OF PROBLEM

POLITICS

UNCERTAINTY RE: CAUSE

UNCERTAINTY RE: SOLUTION

UNCERTAINTY RE: COST

UNCERTAINTY RE: PROBLEM
COST

POLITICS

UNCERTAINTY RE: CAUSE

UNCERTAINTY RE: EXTENT

UNCERTAINTY RE: SOLUTION

UNCERTAINTY RE: EXTENT

SEVERITY OF PROBLEM
Downstream state:

• Need to fix the problem
• We know enough to act (even if there are uncertainties)
• Cost is affordable
• Can’t let upstream sources evade responsibility
Upstream state:

• There are too many uncertainties – need further study
• Don’t know relative contributions of different sources
• Don’t know how effective different actions would be
• Don’t fully understand extent of problem
• Acting too quickly could waste resources
• Costs are high – need more data before investing in solutions
• Downstream sources haven’t done enough to address their contribution
Disagreement is normal

• Level of confidence in data – don’t trust other side’s data as much as your own
• Analysis of data includes judgment calls – influenced by which side you’re on
• Cost estimates – more conservative if it’s your money
• Political consequences different for each side
How to bridge the gap?

- Collaborate re: data collection and analysis
- Start early – before positions get dug in
- Downstream state must aggressively address their own contribution to the problem
- Cooperate re: strategy to address problem, especially sequencing of actions in both states (treat as regional problem)
- Consider phased approach / adaptive management
Remember:

• It’s supposed to be hard

• Expect disagreement

• Take early steps to facilitate states working together