

3-1-2001

Poliglossia in Women's Films: Carlota Joaquina Notes on the Presence of Languages in Film

Jose Gatti

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.umass.edu/democratic-communicue>

Recommended Citation

Gatti, Jose (2001) "Poliglossia in Women's Films: Carlota Joaquina Notes on the Presence of Languages in Film," *Democratic Communiqué*: Vol. 17: Iss. 1, Article 2.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7275/democratic-communicue.192>

Available at: <https://scholarworks.umass.edu/democratic-communicue/vol17/iss1/2>

This Research Article is brought to you for free and open access by ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. It has been accepted for inclusion in Democratic Communiqué by an authorized editor of ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. For more information, please contact scholarworks@library.umass.edu.

2

Poliglossia in Women's Films: Carlota Joaquina Notes on the Presence of Languages in Film

José Gatti

for Arlindo Castro

What is the language spoken in Brazilian cinema? The link between Brazilian cinematography and Lusophony (Portuguese-speaking) seems obvious. The hypothesis behind these reflexions, however, takes as its departure point the fact that Lusophony is a multidimensional complexity, one which includes different modes of speech and goes far beyond the limits of the official language, be it from Portugal, Africa, Asia or Brazil. Besides, the initial question may serve the investigation of other audiovisual media, such as television, and it can possibly help define the contours of a *Brazilian spectatorship*. Such definition, in its turn, can be useful for the research of those media, since it encapsulates a series of articulated phenomena: consumer and audience behavior, cultural identification and the focus of my attention here, *reading strategies of audiovisual texts*. These *notes* are gathered in three different sections: the first one deals with the presence of languages in international cinema; the second traces a history of the subtitling versus dubbing debate in

Brazil; and the third proposes a textual analysis of a key film in order to understand of this problematic currently: the comedy *Carlota Joaquina, Princesa do Brasil*, directed by Carla Camurati in 1994.

I believe that the challenge of defining a Brazilian spectatorship requires an examination of the presence in the media of Lusophony, and, as a counterpoint, the presence of other languages as well. In order to do that, I would like to refer to the notion of Mikhail Bakhtin, for whom a language unfolds into different modes of languages. The Russian thinker, in his work *The Dialogic Imagination*, gives us the theoretical tools in order to understand this unfolding process. Bakhtin was one of the most productive researchers in this area, even though his work refers exclusively to written literature and he supposedly never wrote about cinema. Bakhtin uses the terms *poliglossia*,¹ or the multiplicity of national or ethnic languages in the discourse of the novel, and *heteroglossia*, which designates different forms of the same language, that is,

The internal stratification of any single national language into social dialects, characteristic group behavior, professional jargons, generic languages, languages of generations and age groups, tendentious languages, languages of authorities, of various circles and passing fashions, languages that serve the specific sociopolitical purposes of the day, even of the hour²

In film these two concepts can be seen in dialogic interaction (to use another term favored by Bakhtin), in which heteroglotic variation often serves to establish conventions of polyglot content to the audiences. As I intend to show below, this phenomenon has already been well established in the Anglophone audiovisual media since the 1930's and eventually emerges in Brazilian films. Another source I refer to is Benedict Anderson's cogent work, *Imagined Communities*³, in which he discusses the role played by languages in the formation of regionalities and nationalities. Anderson speaks of a *print*

Gatti: Poliglossia in Women's Films: Carlota Joaquina Notes on the Prese
capitalism in order to define such a role, and this notion is related to the historical period that begins in the 16th century and continues until today. I would like to propose here the concept of *audiovisual capitalism*, that might help us think about the renewed role of languages and language modes in this moment of a supposed "globalization." This process necessarily involves the expansion of audiovisual media (cinema, television, internet, etc.) which makes up the core of the ideological apparatus of late capitalism.

1. From Jazz to the Sputnik

But before I deal with the role of Lusophony in Brazilian cinema, I would like to record some of the narrative practices used by hegemonic cinemas, especially the Anglophone, in the representation of languages.

During the first three decades of the history of cinema the presence of different languages did not seem to be problematic, since it could be overcome by the metaphoric wealth of visual images and by the titles. This situation would change when sound came in: the production of the first sound film, by the way, had already to deal with the problem of poliglossia: *The Jazz Singer* (Alan Crosland, 1927) features characters who speak and sing in two different languages and two dialects. Until then, the best films of the silent period had little dialogue and therefore few titles, making it reasonably easy to present *non-Anglophone* characters (if we restrict our examples to Anglophone cinemas), since the titles that appeared on a dark background were invariably in English and were fairly dissociated from the action. In other words, the audiences enjoyed the action scenes and enjoyed the titles which, in their turn, could spell out the dialogue or *comment* on the scenes. Such was the case, for instance, in the films directed by D. W. Griffith, which often showed titles that commented on the plot instead of simply transcribing the dialogues spoken by the characters.

For the Lusophone audiences, these titles were translated and inserted in place of the original titles. Therefore the

national, ethnic and social depiction of the characters depended exclusively on the contextual elements of visual images and plot development. Costumes, props and other details of the mise-en-scène shed light on these categories, sparing voice tones, accents and sociolinguistic levels. The titles could eventually suggest such differences, though without the precision achieved by sound films.

The Jazz Singer can be seen as an example of the transitional period that signaled the end of the silent era and the definitive establishment of a “speaking” cinema. The very subject of the film refers to the dimension of sound: the main character is torn between the sacred duties of a synagogue cantor and his taste (or calling) for a profane jazz. Even though this is considered to be the first sound film, it reveals the problems brought about by the use of titles. *The Jazz Singer* is actually a hybrid product, one with “silent” as well as “sound” elements, for it was hastily finished by Warner Brothers in order to present the new sound technology before rival studios could. The film was thus made within the boundaries of the conventions of silent films, except for the musical numbers. After the characters speak, we read titles; when the protagonist, Al Jolson, sings we hear his recorded voice. That is why this film exemplifies the ways silent films dealt with characters of different nationalities. The cantor’s parents are first generation Jewish immigrants from Eastern Europe, who kept their language despite the Anglophone environment. Presumably they spoke Yiddish, a language so common that even Yiddish films were produced in the United States in those years.⁴ The titles in *The Jazz Singer*, however, do not differentiate between English or Yiddish speaking dialogue and are obviously in English. As for the musical numbers, they are the locus of both poliglossia and heteroglossia: when the protagonist sings in the synagogue, to replace his father for Yom Kippur celebrations, he sings in Hebrew; when singing jazz, however, his English may sound with an urban, “white” accent or, for the performances in blackface, with a rural “black” drawl.

A few years later Hollywood’s industries had already established narrative conventions for the depiction of languages

<https://scholarworks.umass.edu/democratic-communicue/vol17/iss1/2>
 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7275/democratic-communicue.192>

Gatti: Poliglossia in Women's ~~Films~~ ^{spring 2001} ~~Films~~ Carlota Joaquina Notes on the Prese
 and accents for sound films; some of these solutions remain in use to this day. The first sound movies were loaded with dialogue. Many of them were hasty adaptations of Broadway plays. In fact, Hollywood needed screenwriters who were prepared to write sound pictures. In 1931, Rouben Mamoulian directed one of the first films to make creative use of sound: the musical *Love Me Tonight*, written by Rodgers and Hammerstein. In this movie, diegetic, incidental and musical sounds are blended in a way that results in a fantastic world, narrative resources that were to be developed *ad absurdum* by authors such as Busby Berkeley, Stanley Donen and others in the following years. But *Love Me Tonight* is especially interesting here: its story takes place in France, which required the building of Parisian streets in California. The characters are mostly identified as French, but speak and sing in English. It seems that only one character is played by a French actor, the popular Maurice Chevalier (whose character is called Maurice). His leading lady was the also popular Jeanette McDonald (whose name is Jeanette in the film). However, Chevalier is the only one who speaks English with a French accent -- a trademark he kept throughout his career. The producers of *Love Me Tonight* did not seem concerned with other elements that might emphasize the *Frenchness* of the mise-en-scène (as Roland Barthes might have put it⁵), and the cast could keep their own accents. Myrna Loy, for example, speaks Western American English, as Charles Butterworth speaks the stage English of British overtones that was quite popular amongst serious actors in Hollywood at the time. The lyrics play with French and English words, and many of the rhymes are parodies of the ways Anglophones struggle with French pronunciation, a strategy which highlights the *North Americanness* of the production. Despite its self-parodic style, *Love Me Tonight*, however, was an exception in Hollywood whose productions were guided by verisimilitude and realistic conventions. For writers and directors, the depiction of different language groups thus posed a challenge.

In that search for verisimilitude, Hollywood filmmakers established some conventions that are still in use. In order to

avoid subtitling, the basic formula prescribed the characters to speak in English with a corresponding “foreign” accent. In this formula, poliglossia (national languages) is expressed through heteroglossia (accents). That allowed for the hiring of foreign actors and actresses who could play different nationalities, as long as a vague accent (usually of subaltern peoples) was kept. That was the case with Dolores del Río, a Mexican actress who played a Brazilian lady in *Flying Down to Rio*.

A film that can reveal the political weight of this process is *The North Star*. This work was directed by Lewis Milestone and written by Lillian Hellman in 1943 as part of the war effort. The film was made before the Cold War had begun and tried to make the American public sympathetic towards the fate of Soviet citizens under Nazi occupation. The story takes place in a small Ukrainian village where all the characters don traditional Ukrainian peasant garments (the initial scenes show typical harvest festivities), behave as ideal Soviet citizens (collective farms, public education, equal opportunities, etc.), and speak current English with a generic North American accent, a device that makes an exotic environment sound familiar even if the public is aware that the characters would speak Ukrainian in real life. Such exoticism might even pass unnoticed by part of the public, especially when one takes into account that the cast was very popular at the time: Anne Baxter, Walter Huston and Farley Granger, among others. But when the German characters step into the narrative, conventions take a different turn: the Nazis invade the country, bomb civilian targets, torture, kill and, of course, speak. Actor Erich von Stroheim, who plays a Nazi commander, speaks in English with an unmistakable German accent which signals foreignness to both contexts: that of the diegetic Ukrainian village and, at the same time, that of the North American public. His accent and behavior, therefore, make him the object of instant rejection.

This narrative device would become fairly usual in Hollywood films. *The North Star* features Ukrainian characters as if they were native Anglophones, which reveals the ideological core of that narrative strategy. For the average North American moviegoer, a “native” English accent (i.e., U.S.) is a positive

<https://scholarworks.umass.edu/democratic-communicue/vol17/iss1/2>
 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7275/democratic-communicue.192>

Gatti: Poliglossia in Women's ~~Films~~ ^{spring, 2001} Carlota Joaquina Notes on the Prese attribute, whereas the exophone accent may convey lack of adaptation to the North American way of life and characterizes *the Other*. In the film industry, these conventions were not abandoned until recently. Not surprisingly, there has been a steady campaign *against* multicultural criticism in the 1980's and 1990's.⁶ In the context of Anglophony such criticism aims at the recuperation of non-hegemonic speech modes, something unacceptable to the more conservative sectors of North American media and society. During the Reagan and Bush administrations, the United States saw an emphasis on the traditional "white" values of North American society.

Milestone's film was characterized by reviewers as Soviet propaganda after the war, since it had lost its purpose as an anti-Nazi pamphlet. I would rather see it as a vehicle for the propagation of Anglophony itself, which cinema has helped spread around the world during the 20th Century. Other films and television programs used the same device; that is, when foreign characters speak English with an accent among themselves it is understood that they are speaking a foreign language. That phenomenon is also magnified by the fact that the North American public is not used to reading subtitles. Thus, many non-Anglophone films are kept out of the North American exhibition circuit. That was made evident when the Australian film *Mad Max* was broadcast on U.S. television: it was dubbed in *North American English* in order to be understood. Since then, Australian and New Zealander productions aiming at the North American market prepare their casts to speak with a "lighter" accent, in an effort to keep both the local flavor and dialogues that can be "understood" by most Anglophone audiences. In Brazilian films accent variations abound, but foreign characters are seldom shown speaking foreign languages. One such example, *The Sputnik Man* (*O Homem do Sputnik*), is a parody of Hollywood conventions, skillfully directed by Carlos Manga in 1958. In this film popular comedians Oscarito and Zezé Macedo play the couple whose chicken coop is hit by the Sputnik, the pioneer artificial satellite, a conquest of Soviet technology that was widely publicized at that time. As they try to sell the satellite to

the highest bidder, the couple goes to Rio de Janeiro and draws the attention of the press and international spies. Soviet, North American and French spies are shown in a parodic and stereotypical way. The Soviets are seen as arrogant and oppressive in a scene shot in high and low angles, with dim lights and a close-up of the communist symbol redesigned with a sickle and a *pick* instead of the hammer (in Brazilian slang, *picareta* or pick is a term that defines a swindler). Formally, the Soviet display austerity, seriousness and an inflexible party line, but in their intimate moments they are shown secretly enjoying champagne, Coca-cola and longing for “dark-skinned girls”. The North American spies, on the other hand, chew gum and drink Coca-cola all the time. Their proverbial ignorance about Brazilian geography is revealed when one of the characters remembers that “Brazil is the capital of Buenos Aires.” In addition, the North Americans believe that they will trade the Sputnik for “cigarettes, nylon stockings and other gadgets with the Indians.” The French spies, in their turn, are seen doing their paper work in bed, and the dialogues are marked by double meaning and eroticism. Their secret weapon is “*la femme*” and their target is the privilege of promoting “the *frrrst* fashion show on the *Moon*.”

The narrative of *The Sputnik Man* works in multiple directions: the parody of *the other* (in this case, the representatives of foreign powers), the parody of *our own* ideas of the other and what we suppose to be *their* ideas about us. Thus, in the tradition of the Carioca *chanchadas* (or musical comedies of the 1940's and 1950's), Manga mimicks the formula of Hollywood films for the depiction of “foreign” languages. Therefore, the characters speak *Portuguese* with accents, that is, what are supposed to be Russian, English and French accents. As an example, it is worth mentioning the famous scene in which the secretary cum spy Bébé (a parody of the popular star Brigitte Bardot), played with perfection by actress Norma Bengell, seduces the character played by Oscarito. In a musical number which serves as the pretext for a strip-tease, the spy exaggerates her French pronunciation of words in Portuguese, drawing laughs from Lusophone

<https://scholarworks.umass.edu/democratic-communique/vol17/iss1/2>
 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7275/democratic-communique.192>

Gatti: Poliglossia in Women's Films: Carlota Joaquina Notes on the Prese audiences.

But even in a Lusophone cinema such as that of Brazil, the English language played a decisive role in both our filmmaking *and* our film viewing. My proposal, from here on, is to examine how the depiction of languages may have molded Brazilian spectatorship itself.

2. Seeing or reading cinema?

The search for a national cinema and a national film language has been a concern of Brazilian critics and filmmakers since the beginning of the 20th century. As early as 1910, even though Brazilian production absolutely dominated the market at the time (the so-called Belle Époque of Brazilian cinema), newspapers complained about the bad translation of the titles in foreign films.⁷ However, after the First World War, when Hollywood accomplished its first conquest of foreign markets (including Brazil, of course), the quest for a national cinema became informed by an anti-imperialist discourse which included a defense of our linguistic uniqueness.

The Brazilian press of the time criticized the technical inadequacy of our films in comparison with the superiority of Hollywood products,⁸ and there was a steady disappointment in the mushrooming of documentaries that portrayed an exotic and uncivilized Brazil.⁹

The shift from silent movies to talkies that began in 1929, caused a celebration that was registered in the press. In Brazil the debate over the introduction of sound pictures suggested new possibilities for a national cinema, because the potential of dubbing and subtitling was absolutely underestimated. After all, that was the opportunity for Brazilian cinema to conquer its own audience, given that the Brazilian public would not be able to understand the dialogues in the films. In January 1929 the *Diário Nacional* stated:

... The appearance of sound movies brings to each people the unavoidable need for the nationalization of film art. We too, will face the contingency of creating

our own cinema. The “Movietone” was, therefore, the Waterloo of North American cinematography. ... The commercial intuition of American cinema has failed, with the introduction of the “Movietone”. Brazil will finally have its cinema.¹⁰

On the other hand, writer Afrânio Peixoto called attention, in 1929, to the danger of the “Americanization of the world and its sovereign nations,” since the United States controlled the markets.¹¹ But his warning was not much noticed at first. In a process that resonates with the hopes for a “whitening” of the population, as a result of the massive immigration of European workers,¹² the struggle for a national language was the official policy of the Vargas administration (1930-1945).¹³ At that time intellectuals, artists and educators were summoned to build a national art, a national education, etc. The Brazilian Portuguese language (an agenda proposed by modernist artists) played a central role in that process. That is well examined in Benedict Anderson’s work, which shows how the creation of national languages helped political movements for independence in colonial situations.

When sound films were introduced in Europe, some producers decided to invest in films made in different language versions. Brazilian filmmaker Alberto Cavalcanti worked in that project: he was responsible for the refilming of French films in Spain with a Spanish cast, using the same props and the work of the same technicians, since dubbing and subtitling were not considered technically feasible. In Brazil, that impossibility caused a temporary burst of nationalist euphoria.

But we already know how that story ended. Subtitling technology was quickly developed and that made reading subtitles mandatory for understanding dialogue. Dialogue was a crucial element of the so-called Hollywood classic narratives. Even with the dissemination of badly edited and badly lit films, but stuffed with dialogue, the 1930’s saw the establishment of Hollywood’s hegemony in our market. The Brazilian audiences

<https://scholarworks.umass.edu/democratic-communique/vol17/iss1/2>
 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7275/democratic-communique.192>

Gatti: Poliglossia in Women's Films: Carlota Joaquina Notes on the Present went through a veritable process of re-education, one that marginalized most of the illiterate population. The reading of dialogues in the lower quarter of the frame defined the local mode of filmwatching: spectators *read* the text and later scrutinized the rest of the picture, that is, if they found enough time for such scrutinizing.¹⁴ So subtitles redefined the narrative, since the transcription of dialogues could not be faithful to the spoken text. Such method, one that undergoes the problems of any translation, requires the selection of a dialogue fragment that will be shown with the shots that correspond to those lines. Subtitles also level poliglottic and heteroglottic differences, erasing tones, accents, ethnic and gender characteristics, etc. The reading of subtitles, in fact, redirects the attention of the audience and reassembles the filmic text, making spectatorship in Brazil a whole different event, say, from that in the United States.

Another phenomenon that came about from that re-education was the carelessness of theater owners with the maintenance of their sound systems, since the audience did not need to hear the dialogue. As a result, Brazilian films have traditionally suffered severe criticism of the quality of their sound, when the problem is, in fact, in the theater facilities. That was one of the reasons why so many Brazilian artists fought for the dubbing of films in the 1960's and 1970's as a means of assuring better projection conditions and keeping more jobs for dubbers and technicians.

But the establishment of subtitling did not restrict the expansion of Brazilian cinema, which kept the loyalty of the illiterate public that made up the majority of the population. The public found, on the screen, a direct identification with their lifestyle, their visual world and their speech. That speech, however, was not always "Brazilian." The Lusitan accent was common in the cast of Brazilian films until the mid 1960's due to the presence of Portuguese artists as well as the special status enjoyed by that accent in Brazilian stage productions during the first half of the 20th century. The Portuguese accent -- sometimes a slight overtone -- was a sign of serious acting, one that marked the affiliation with metropolitan roots. The

phenomenon was analogous to that of the “British” English of Hollywood actors in the 1930’s. The maintenance of a Portuguese pronunciation was typical even in popular music. Performers such as Carmen Miranda (herself a Portuguese citizen), Francisco Alves, the Batista Sisters and others cultivated a similar mode of speech. The Lusitan accent in many Brazilian films does not always identify the ethnic origin of a character, but reveals the ethnic origin of *the cast* and thus the ambiguities of the performance. A good example is the comedy *Chico Fumaça* (Victor Lima, 1955), in which a Portuguese actor plays the part of a Syrian-Lebanese vendor. We should not forget that Brazil was often toured by stage ensembles and stars from Portugal until the middle of the century. Names such as Carmen Santos (actress, director and producer), Chianca de Garcia, Jaime Costa and others left their mark in Brazilian cinema. That exchange, which was also fertile in literature, eventually faded into insignificance.

During the 1950’s Brazilian television networks established the standard of dubbing for foreign shows. The subtitles presented reading problems (especially before the introduction of color) and, through the dubbing, television conquered the illiterate audiences that still resisted the reading of dialogue in films. The original language(s) of programs and films exhibited on TV would not be leveled by subtitling but instead reinterpreted by the talent of generations of translators and dubbing artists. And as television grew into the vehicle of the masses, film theaters were progressively emptier -- in fact, a world tendency. This fact, linked to the progressive cuts of government subsidies, led to the eventual end of film production in Brazil during the Collor administration (1990-1993). Nevertheless, cinema would be renewed in Brazil and many filmmakers visualized the expansion of the exhibition markets.

3. *Carlota Joaquina* and the *Retomada*

When *Carlota Joaquina* was released in 1994 it became an instant box office hit, surprising even those who hailed

Gatti: Poliglossia in Women's Films: *Carlota Joaquina* Notes on the Presence of the *retomada*, or comeback of Brazilian cinema. The film is a satire of one of the best known periods of Brazilian history: that of the coming of the Portuguese Court to Brazil in 1808. The period deserved more than one film version, including *Independence or Death* (Carlos Coimbra, 1972), widely shown as "the official historical version" due to its realism. *Carlota Joaquina*, on the other hand, does not compete with historic-realist films. The film directed by Carla Camurati (and co-written by Melanie Dimantas) does not try to convince the audience with a *mise-en-scène* based on verisimilitude. On the contrary: the theatrical quality of the film is made evident by the use of backdrops, allegorized costumes and minimalist accessories. That apparent poverty of resources (it does not matter, here, if the scarcity of funds contributed to the film style) resulted in a particular work, one that disassembles historical myths through parodic and carnivalesque techniques. Besides, its release coincided with a moment in which the Brazilian population was especially suspicious of official discourses.

At the same time, *Carlota Joaquina* is not a conventional "Brazilian film", which is, in part, a result of its poliglossia. The film begins with a fading male voice that tells, in Spanish, a story of the creation of the world; we hear bagpipes in the background (Galician? Scottish?) and see images of the open sea as the credits roll. The language refers to the national origin of the main character, a Spanish princess. But all of a sudden the film is redirected towards another linguistic realm, in a move that surprises the audience who expects to watch a movie about the history of Brazil. On a cloudy cliff by the gray sea there appear two characters: a young Scotsman (who naturally dons a kilt!) and a young girl (apparently dressed for school). In order to dispell the girl's bad mood, the young man decides to tell her the "story of a princess-girl." Thus, the Brazilian film that stands as the emblem of the *retomada* is narrated in voice-over, in British-sounding English! *Carlota Joaquina* features, in this sense, a narrative strategy that may have been instrumental in its dialogue with the Brazilian public. The film takes the audience through an unexpected voyage, one that departs from *cinema* (seen here as the hegemonic

cinema, that is, *foreign cinema*) towards *Brazilian cinema*, on a path that juxtaposes Anglophone sounds and *corresponding subtitles*, adjusting the narrative to the standard conditions of Brazilian spectatorship. Little by little, the Portuguese language--and its various accents--takes over the flux of the narrative. In analogous fashion, the diegesis departs from an Anglophone geography towards another one, of Lusophone predominance. It should be useful, now, to map the poliglossia in *Carlota Joaquina*.

After we hear Spanish and English, we hear Italian and Portuguese. These two languages mark two moments of the princess's biography: her mother was Italian and her husband is the heir to the Portuguese crown. But such apparently poliglottic harmony, one that should attest to the normalcy of film viewing (according to the formula *English voice with subtitles*) and to the verisimilitude of a historical narrative (Spanish princess, Italian mother and Portuguese husband) is absolutely disturbed by the heteroglotic panel of various accents. Carlota's father is played by the Spanish actor Enrique Hurrutía, whose Castillian, severe accent enhances the voice of the powerful king and contrasts with the accent of the little princess, who is played by Brazilian actress Ludmila Dayer. She also plays the Scottish girl with her voice dubbed in English. Most of the other characters who speak Italian, Spanish or Portuguese are played by a Brazilian cast. When the Portuguese Royal House flees from Napoleon and transfers the court to Brazil, the accents multiply as they get in touch with Indian, African and "Brazilian" characters. The adult princess--a brilliant performance of Brazilian actress Marieta Severo--speaks, throughout the narrative, Spanish with Brazilian accent or Portuguese with Spanish accent. This variety of speech modes emphasizes the theatrical style of the film. *Carlota Joaquina*'s concept also includes painted landscapes, drownings in fishbowls that stand for the ocean and extreme close-ups that serve as synecdoches.

In this sense, *Carlota Joaquina*'s narrative is permeated by foreign languages spoken by Brazilian voices that allow for the emergence of a *subtextual Brazilian Lusophony* that

Gatti: Poliglossia in Women's Films: Carlota Joaquina Notes on the Presence of English in Brazil, 2001
becomes the dominant linguistic presence. The languages of colonizers and colonized get mixed up. And since there is no language *without* an accent, it is worth mentioning the efficient performance of the *Scottish* narrator, played by Carioca actor Brent Hieatt, whose family is of English origin.¹⁵ His education was that of many South Americans of British origin, whose Anglophone accent is known, in England, as *South Atlantic*: a tone that denotes the emigrated.

Carlota Joaquina is thus very far from the films whose stars carefully cultivate accents (which is the case with the versatile Meryl Streep and some members of the TV Globo telenovela casts), in service to the ultimate goal of verisimilitude. The film is also far from other poliglottic experiments in recent Brazilian films. The effort towards the penetration of international markets led many Brazilian filmmakers to try various strategies such as English-speaking films with an international cast (such as *A Grande Arte*, by Walter Salles); or with an Anglophone Brazilian cast (*The Monk and the Hangman's Daughter*, by Válder Lima Jr.); or at least with plots that require Lusophone and Anglophone characters (*Jenipapo*, by Monique Gardenberg; *Como Nascem os Anjos*, by Murilo Salles; *Bossa Nova*, by Bruno Barreto). The results vary but, according to Bakhtin's idea, none of them display the *living language* of *Carlota Joaquina*, a language made up by several other languages which contaminate each other, become transformed and are multiplied.

José Gatti
CP10030
88062-970 Florianópolis SC
Brasil
gatti@matrix.com.br

Part of these Notes were researched with the support of Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina and Cinemateca Catarinense.

A first version of this text was presented at the II Conference of Socine, Sociedade Brasileira de Estudos de Cinema, at UFRJ, Rio de Janeiro, in 1998.

Notes

¹ *The Dialogic Imagination*, translated by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981).

²Op. Cit., p 263

³ London: Verso, 1983

⁴Lester Friedmann, *Hollywood Jews*.

⁵*Image, music, text*

⁶A good example of that campaign is the work of William Safire, in his Sunday column in The New York Times Magazine. See the article in the October 18, 1996 issue.

⁷In Jean-Claude Bernardet and Maria Rita Galvão, *Cinema: o nacional e o popular* (São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1983), p. 46

⁸Paulo Emílio Salles Gomes, Humberto Mauro, *Cataguazes, Cinearte* (São Paulo: Perspectiva, 1972)

⁹Oito Estudos de Cinema Brasileiro, org. Maria Rita Galvão, (Rio: Embrafilme, 1978)

¹⁰ Bernardet and Galvão, p. 46

¹¹*In Um Sonho, um Belo Sonho*, quoted in Bernardet and Galvão, p. 46

¹²Lília Moritz Szwarcz, *O espetáculo das raças* (São Paulo: Cia. Das Letras, 1994)

¹³This problem was more acute in rural regions where public education was a responsibility of the communities and not the state. That was the case with the German and Japanese communities in Southern Brazil. The trauma caused by enforced Lusophony can be felt to this day.

¹⁴This issue is being researched by Sabine Gorowitz for her upcoming M.A. dissertation at Universidade de Brasília.

¹⁵ I would like to thank my colleague, Professor José Roberto O'Shea, for the information.