A culturally relevant symbol: Participant engagement in a volunteer tourism music-conservation youth education program

Lana M. Olsen

Arizona State University at the Downtown campus

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.umass.edu/ttra
A culturally relevant symbol: Participant engagement in a volunteer tourism music-conservation youth education program

Introduction

International volunteer-led travel educational programs in the global South tend to focus on health intervention and wellness, sports, and other areas such as environmental care or empowerment through music making. Daraja Music Initiative (DMI), a US based nonprofit working in Moshi, Tanzania, indicates they are promoting an “awareness of conserving Mpingo - commonly referred to as African Blackwood… by actively engaging students and the community with the power of music” (DMI, 2018). While it may be understood DMI is a music-conservation themed nonprofit leading annual trips to Tanzania, several questions arise in response to DMI’s statement. For example: How is DMI engaging these students and various community members through their volunteer tourist-led program? How does traveling to volunteer impact volunteer tourist engagement in this youth-focused program?

Research was needed to explore the concept and theory of engagement in general, as well its application to the study of volunteer tourism. Additional research was also needed to incorporate youth perspectives of a volunteer tourism program. The purpose of this study was to obtain perspectives from volunteer tourist teachers (VTT), program youth, and adult residents to gain a pluralistic understanding of what engagement means to each key stakeholder. It also sought to explore the concept of engagement within the context of volunteer tourism using a newly created Engagement Theoretical Framework to explain volunteer tourism programs.

Literature Review

A review of literature to explore participant engagement in a volunteer tourism youth education program was conducted in two stages. The preliminary literature review oriented the researcher to the topic (Creswell, 2014), assisted in formulating interview questions and data collection protocol, and guided coding during data analysis. The second-stage literature review determined how informant themes were similar to or different from literature or previous research findings. The literature review uncovered three key themes having linkages to the concept of engagement within the context of volunteer tourism.

Tourist Participants. Three main groups of participants are featured in volunteer tourism literature: volunteer tourists, sending organizations, and host community residents. Volunteer tourists, coming from all demographic groupings and skillsets (Butcher & Smith, 2010; Lo & Lee, 2011; Zahra & McGehee, 2013), generally pay to volunteer their time for an international community development project (Tomazos & Butler, 2012). Some volunteer tourism studies have focused on the volunteer tourist (Knollenberg, McGehee, Boley, & Clemmons, 2014), such as motives to volunteer (Olsen, Vogt, & Andereck, 2017) or their trip expectations (Andereck, McGehee, Lee, &
Clemmons, 2012) and experiences (McIntosh & Zahra, 2007). Sending organizations 
create and manage project opportunities for potential volunteers. Three of the most cited 
organizations in volunteer tourism literature are university placements abroad, non-
governmental organizations (NGO), and religious groups (Hammersley, 2014; McGloin 
& Georgeou, 2016). Host community residents typically represent global South 
community development projects (Guttentag, 2009; McGehee, 2014; Raymond & Hall, 
2008; Sin, 2010). Studies featuring community residents (particularly youth) as primary 
stakeholders in an international community development project are limited (Canosa, 

Program Types. Sending organizations may create opportunities for volunteer 
tourists to participate in international community development programs through pillars 
of sustainability (economic, environmental and economic) (Devereux, 2008; Sharpley, 
2000). Short term and medium-term volunteer tourists tend to work in projects featuring 
conservation (Beh, Bruyere & Lolosoli, 2013), infrastructure improvements (McGehee & 
Andereck, 2009), medical assistance (Snyder, Dharamsi & Crooks, 2011), and education 
for skill development (Butcher & Smith, 2010). Long-term programs commonly feature 
volunteers, such as Peace Corps members (Conran, 2011; Palacios, 2010) who work on 
humanitarian crisis projects. Some volunteer tourism programs promote youth 
development (Roth & Brooks-Gunn, 2003), but these are typically aimed at volunteers 
not residents. A growing field of research within volunteer tourism, focusing on 
community children and program outcomes of this proposed poverty alleviation medium, 
is “orphanage tourism” (Freidus, 2017).

Host Community Voices. A small number of studies have placed emphasis on 
host community voices in the development and management of volunteer tourist-led 
projects in their community (Hammersley, 2014; McGehee, 2014; McGehee & 
Andereck, 2009; Zahra & McGehee, 2013). When research studies have included 
community voices, they appear to be about “the subaltern [lower class] rather than studies 
with and from a subaltern perspective (Grosfoguel, 2007, p. 211). Further, multiple 
perspectives have typically excluded the “voices of women and children” (González, 
González & Lincoln, 2006, p. 5). Simply said, “young people’s voice, engagement and 
participation in tourism research and specifically within host communities” (Canosa, et 
al., 2016, p. 326) appears to be absent from volunteer tourism literature.

Engagement. The concept of engagement may be defined as concentration (flow) 
in projects/tasks with an authentic outside focus through the process of collaboration 
(Alexander & Bakir, 2011). It can be thought of as a “meta’ construct” (Fredricks, 
Blumenfeld & Paris, 2004, p. 60) encompassing the dimensions of emotional 
engagement, cognitive engagement, and behavioral engagement for all those involved. 
Constructs under emotional engagement include: enjoyable (Sinatra, Hedy & Lombardi, 
2015), dedication (Seppala et al., 2009), sense of belonging (Appleton, Christenson, & 
Furlong, 2008) or psychology sense of community (Viento, Perkins, Smith, & Santinello, 
2005), and appreciation of success (Fredricks & McColskey, 2012). Cognitive 
engagement may appear as: motivation (Fredricks, et al., 2004), investment in learning 
(Greene, 2015), effort/persistence (Greene, 2015) or absorption/flow (Seppala et al.,
achievement (Sinatra, Heddy & Lombardi, 2015) or future aspirations (Appleton, et al., 2006). Behavioral engagement may include: time on task (Appleton et al., 2008), and participation (Reschly & Christenson, 2012) or collaboration (Jarvela, et al., 2016). The emerging engagement theory appears in literature such as job satisfaction and the workplace (Warden & Benshoff, 2012); job burnout (Maslach & Leiter, 2008); marketing and customer engagement (Gambetti & Graffigna, 2010); tourism planning (McCabe, Sharples, & Foster, 2012), and student learning both inside and outside the school classroom (Kuh, 2009; Lawson & Lawson, 2013; Shernoff & Vandell, 2007). Few research studies have featured all three dimensions of engagement (Kearsley & Schneiderman, 1998; O’Neill, 2005), particularly in voluntourism scholarship.

Methods

To study volunteer tourism, the researchers chose to work with Daraja Music Initiative (DMI) a US-based nonprofit promoting music and conservation education to area youth in Moshi, Tanzania. Each summer since 2010, DMI has provided an interdisciplinary approach to sustainability through music education (DMI, 2018) conducted by volunteer tourists and by planting Mpingo trees (African Blackwood), the wood of which is used to make clarinets, in an urban area of Tanzania.

During the period June 5 to July 21, 2017, music and conservation education programming was offered to select students from two Moshi schools (1 primary and 1 secondary). Music teaching ranged from beginning violin to advanced clarinet, and conservation education through field trips, tree plantings and in-class activities. The 6-week program included 16 volunteer tourists as teachers, 86 students, 27 musical engagements, with over 340 Mpingo and various fruit trees planted (DMI, 2018). Participation in the program varied. Some students, volunteer teachers and community members engaged with DMI for their first time, while others had been partaking since the nonprofit’s beginning (DMI, 2018).

Cognizant of Swahili to English language barrier, a documents translator and interview/focus group interpreter were hired to assist with translation issues (Nomlomo & Vuzo, 2014; Shimpuku & Norr, 2012). The Moshi translator, a recent graduate from a prominent American university, provided translation support during formulation of English to Swahili interviewee and focus group questions. These translated questions appeared both in English and Swahili for informants to read if necessary. A Moshi interpreter was hired to interpret interview and focus group questions from English to Swahili and Swahili to English for Swahili-speaking adult residents and program youth. The hired interpreter assisted with translation (where needed) throughout data analysis.

From June 26 to July 23, 2017, the primary researcher conducted 13 in-depth interviews and four focus groups lasting between 60 to 120 minutes each. A mix of 13 program youth, adult residents, and VTTs were interviewed. Two youth focus groups consisted of a total of six females and 13 males between 13 to 20 years old, whereas two VTT focus groups consisted of six females and two males for a total of 29 focus group participants. Of the total ten volunteer teachers who participated in the study, nine are professional
musicians or music educators. All interviewees and focus groups members, with the exception of two outsiders, were affiliated with DMI. Consultation between researchers was obtained via email while the primary researcher was in the field.

A combination of deductive and inductive approaches to code development (Bernard, Wutich, & Ryan, 2017) was utilized through thematic analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2006). The deductive approach was confined within the researcher-developed Engagement Theoretical Framework. Before data collection commenced, a preliminary codebook based on the literature review was organized within this Framework, while a more inductive approach was applied during and after data collection. Information from study sources were sorted and thematic chunks (including direct quotes) placed into emerging categories with reference to memos written during collection stage (Creswell, 2013).

After collection, data were identified, classified, and coded using the inductive approach (Bernard et al., 2017). Consultation of emerging codes took place between the primary researcher and co-authors both in-person, and through email and phone correspondence. Researcher memos were re-examined to understand category relationships and development of themes, and use of diagramming employed (Orcher, 2014). To further validate the data, two VTT member checks were completed and an inter-coder agreement followed between researchers.

Results

Three major themes (connection, communication, and hope), related to participant engagement in a volunteer tourism music-conservation youth education program, were evident in interview and focus group data that either concur or differ from literature themes as applied to volunteer tourism.

Connection. Regardless of participant, one way this nonprofit engages each person is through factors related to program connection. Several participants’ reasons for wanting to be connected to DMI relate to previous research on motivation (Fredicks, et al., 2004), volunteer tourist motives to volunteer (Olsen, et al., 2017), or residents’ reasons to participate in a development project. Many community, youth, and volunteer representatives are connected because they have relationships with program members or were “asked to join.” Several community and youth participants suggested they want to connect with “them, (because they are) coming from America,” and may offer tangible benefits. Other connection factors, however, differed. The nonprofit consists of programming content (music and conservation) primarily connecting with skill-to-program matched volunteers. These skilled volunteers, along with other participants, appear to want to connect with others in the “clarinet (or other instrument) world.” This is a unique type of program, which is different from academic literature reporting on other types of volunteer tourism sending organizations. This also differs slightly from engagement literature on individual “sense of belonging” (Appleton et al., 2008) or “psychological sense of community” (Vieno, et al., 2005), because of the cohesive nature of this unique music-conservation “group (or) club.” A number of youth study participants are engaged with the nonprofit because of volunteer musician teacher’s
“skills” or “qualifications” or connection to music content, and not aspects related to conservation. Community residents tend to connect with DMI primarily because of environmental or economic benefits for their community.

**Communication.** According to the earlier engagement definition, one of the basic elements of engagement is collaboration (Alexander and Bakir, 2011). A discussion or focus on collaboration or participation with community members appears in community development, tourism, and volunteer tourism literature (McGehee & Andereck, 2009; Vogt, Jordan, Grewe, & Kruger, 2016). Some community members suggest DMI’s “cooperation between people and the community” appears as a positive feature of DMI’s ability to communicate “with students and the community.” However, according to one community member, “(community DMI partners) don’t talk, don’t talk... (with each other).” While it seems DMI encourages communication with the community, this tends to be a short-lived when planning appropriate conservation curriculum with the community. Two community interviewees voiced, it would be good “for... (a local) teacher (to) know what DMI is teaching in science,” because it appears disrespectful. In other words, “why would somebody come from so far away with the same idea (as a community expert)?” Misunderstandings related to language barrier and DMI not fully explaining the program to community residents occasionally occurs. However, the unique-theme program focusing on an object (tree, instrument) and participatory movement (playing, planting) has helped “children...understand the (English) language more than we were teaching English lesson(s) in our classes.” In terms of volunteer training, volunteer tourist teacher training primarily focuses on musician preparation versus cultural norms training. The need for pre-departure volunteer tourist training is a theme in some literature (Hammersley, 2014; Tomazos & Butler, 2009). As a community member voiced: “it’s really offensive to have short, shorts,” so a good solution as suggested by another community member is to have volunteers “trained by someone who lives in TZ.” Community members are not trained, according to almost all community members interviewed.

**Hope.** A motivational trait appearing in cognitive engagement literature is future aspirations (Appleton, et al., 2006). Many community participants, particularly the youth “say they will be part of DMI forever” because “I can see my future through DMI.” They are helping “us pursue our dreams and give us opportunities and will “take any opportunity that is given.” Desiring for a better future is the basis of programming for volunteer tourist-led community development programs as indicated in previous literature. But for some DMI participants, it is something more than motivation for future dreams. It relates to the concept of hope (Ciarrochi, Parker, Kashdan, Heaven, & Barkus, 2015), or elements of “hope theory” (Snyder, Lopez, Shorey, Rand, & Feldman, 2003; Van Ryzin, 2011). Hope is considered to be a “generic personality trait comprised of agency (the trait component) and pathway (one’s response repertoire and strategies, the state component)” (Cariñio & Rhodes, 2002, p. 126). Many students are deeply engaged in DMI because they see beyond the momentary benefits this organization brings to their lives. The information, tools and relationships formed gives them confidence to “take on the world” and “hope if you want to be a musician” to “support life.” As one community member voiced with respect to thoughts associated to the personality trait hope: “If
something don’t come to you, don’t blame [but work hard] ...there is something that will come to you in the very next while.”

The primary reason for engagement of students, volunteers, and community members in this volunteer tourist youth education program is the Mpingo (tree), the symbolic bridge between community residents and DMI volunteers. Through volunteers traveling to this area to teach, this culturally relevant symbol helps to connect, and aids in the communication between and gives hope to, participants. Study participants suggested it was either the instrument that engaged them with the tree, or what the tree represents that engaged them to music and its’ instruments. A study of signs (or symbols) called “semiotics” (Mick, 1986), relating to meaning of tangible symbols (Rowland & Schweigert, 2000) or things (Csikszentmihalyi and Rochberg-Halton, 1981) may help to explain why DMI members are engaged with the program. Community members tend to engage in this program because of what this symbol, the national tree of Tanzania, means to them: environmental conservation and a hope for future possibilities in their community. Almost all volunteer tourist teachers engage in DMI because of their passion for music, and desire to sustain a community in which the wood for the clarinet is grown. As one volunteer teacher said, “this connecting my instrument with the tree in which it comes and try and grow a respect through these educational outreach programs, through direct contact with the communities where this product comes from is just one small way in trying to make a bigger difference.”

Discussion and Conclusion

Study participants are engaged in this volunteer tourist-led youth development program because of elements similar to research on tourist participants, (international community development) program types, and engagement literature. All tourist participants (VTTs, adult residents, and program youth) tend to be engaged through motivation to participate in a development project. Many VTTs are engaged because they have relationships with program members due to repeat volunteering experiences in this community. Relationships tend to fall under the dimensions of emotional and cognitive engagement (Croom, 2015; Klem & Connell, 2004), and has as appeared as a volunteer motive to volunteer in volunteer tourism research studies (Gray et al., 2017; Hammersley, 2014). Adult residents tend to be engaged because of economic benefits associated with Western representation of volunteer tourists and the sending organization.

For this study, a connection may be through relationships, or possibly through collaboration with others. Collaboration is an indicator of the behavioral dimension of engagement (Järvelä et al., 2016) and appears in community development, tourism, volunteer tourism and sustainability literature (Albrecht, 2013; Devereux, 2008; McGehee & Andereck, 2009; Vogt et al, 2016; Westoby & Kaplan, 2013). This nonprofit seems to encourage communication between its’ members and the community. However, this tends to be short-lived in terms of DMI planning appropriate conservation curriculum with the community. Interviewees desiring for a better future through this program was common theme in this study and in precious literature.
Differences between this study and previous research are participants may be engaged for reasons related to programming content (music and conservation) and skill-to-program matched volunteers. This is a unique type of program, which is different from literature reporting on other types of volunteer tourism sending organizations. In addition, because it’s a program focusing on an object (tree, instrument) and participatory movement (playing, planting) predominately through English instruction, some children have been learning English at a faster rate. Participants tend to be emotionally engaged because of the cohesive nature of this unique music-conservation group, which is different from literature on individual “sense of belonging” or “psychological sense of community”. In terms of DMI training, some volunteer tourist teacher training takes place before departure and while in county. However, this differs slightly from literature on volunteer tourist pre-departure training because emphasis is placed on pre-departure musician teacher training but almost none on the culture in which they will teach. Desiring for a better future is the basis of programming for volunteer tourist-led community development programs as indicated in literature. But for some DMI participants, it is something more than motivation for future dreams. It relates to the concept of hope or elements of “hope theory.”

A noteworthy difference between academic literature and interviewee responses is engagement in a volunteer tourism program (connection, communication and hope) appears to be achieved through a culturally relevant symbol. The culturally relevant symbol, the Mpingo tree (national tree of Tanzania and the wood for which the clarinet is grown), has linkages to the study of semiotics (Mick, 1986). The power of music is achieved through the symbolic representation of the tree. In addition, the tree is the brand, and it helps to identify DMI by bringing all program aspects towards a single focus. Contributions of this study to literature include: volunteer tourist and community member engagement plays an important role in the planning, and the sustaining, of volunteer tourism community development programs; program youth perspectives about program impacts may result in prospective youth leadership and future adult civic engagement; program skill matched volunteers are likely to be repeat volunteers which leads to group cohesion and program sustainability; and the major theme of hope appears to be a significant motive for program participation in a community development project. In terms of deep meaning ascribed to culturally relevant symbols, this unique finding contributes to engagement research by understanding there are multiple dimensions involved in a diverse group of participants engaged in a specific community program.
References


Media.


