

**UMass Amherst Libraries
Vendor Evaluation Scorecard
Evaluating Vendors, Aligning Values**

~ Version 1.5 ~

2/15/19

The UMass Amherst Libraries aspires to vendor partnerships that support its stated mission and values (<https://www.library.umass.edu/about-the-libraries/strategic-plan/>). Fundamental to all vendor relationships is that the resource or service it provides shall contribute to the teaching, learning and research mission of the University. In addition, the Libraries seek to contribute to a global scholarly communication system that is open to and representative of a wide range of participants, perspectives and purposes. Given the Libraries mission, values and limited financial resources, it will apply additional criteria to guide its decisions about which providers choose.

The Libraries acknowledge that not all its vendors will meet its expectations for best practices on every point, nor will each criteria apply to every vendor. The Libraries will use this evaluation process to work singularly and collaboratively to achieve as close an alignment of values as possible. Library staff will communicate expectations of vendors to the UMass Amherst community and to library vendors. They will provide a rating of each criteria based on:

- documentation provided by the vendor
- testing based on standards, best practices and guidelines
- company and/or market analysis
- literature, community and registry reviews
- documented user feedback, and/or
- documented staff experience.

These criteria ratings will inform an overall score, as well as scores for each value set. The Libraries will share with each vendor a report of its scores and ratings, and it will outline any further actions it intends to take.

Collaborations & Partnerships

- Compliant with standard/best practice/guideline, e.g.:
 - Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) Core Practices - <https://publicationethics.org/core-practices>
 - FAIR Data Principles - <https://www.force11.org/group/fairgroup/fairprinciples>
 - Knowledge Base and Related Tools (KBART) - for title list exchange with accurate holdings, previous titles, coverage dates - <https://www.niso.org/publications/rp-9-2014-kbart>
 - Metadata - for description and discovery - consistent use of MARC21, RDA and/or other nationally or internationally recognized standards (CCO, Dublin Core, MODS, ...)
 - Provider neutral records
 - Recognized system match point such as OCLC # or vendor #

Acquisitions Institute 2019: Developing a Vendor Scorecard as a Tool to Re-Allocate Acquisitions Dollars and Transform Scholarly Communication

- Accurate URL
- Title, author (if applicable), publication information
- Controlled access points and authorized forms of names, subjects, genre terms
- Correctly coded information (fixed fields and LDR)
- Open Discovery - <https://www.niso.org/standards-committees/odi>
- OpenURL - for cross-platform linking - <https://www.niso.org/publications/z3988-2004-r2010>
- Privacy guidelines - <http://www.ala.org/advocacy/privacy/guidelines/ebook-digital-content>
- Shared Electronic Resource Understanding (SERU) - in lieu of a license - <https://www.niso.org/publications/rp-7-2012-seru>; <https://groups.niso.org/workrooms/seru/registry/>
- Simple Web-service Offering Repository Deposit (SWORD) - <http://swordapp.org/about/>
- Standardized Usage Statistics Harvesting Initiative (SUSHI) - <https://www.niso.org/publications/z3993-2014-sushi>
- Transfer Code of Practice - for publisher changes/acquisitions - <https://www.niso.org/standards-committees/transfer>
- Universal Design for Learning Guidelines - <http://udlguidelines.cast.org/>
- Usage data - COUNTER-compliant - <https://www.projectcounter.org/>
- Users' Digital Privacy - <https://www.niso.org/publications/privacy-principles>
- Voluntary Product Accessibility Template (VPAT) - <https://www.section508.gov/sell/vpat>
- Web Accessibility - <https://www.w3.org/TR/WCAG21/>
- Compliant with federal and Massachusetts law, e.g.:
 - Privacy, e.g. FERPA (<https://www2.ed.gov/policy/gen/guid/fpco/ferpa/index.html>), Massachusetts Fair Information Practices Act (FIPA)
 - Accessibility
 - Recognizes Public Records Law, e.g. does not require non-disclosure agreement
 - UMass cannot indemnify private party, per Article 62 of Massachusetts Constitution
- Platform/resource integrates with compatible tools, e.g.:
 - Authentication, e.g. Shibboleth, IP, Athens, UN/PW
 - Data export
 - Digital Object Identifiers (DOI) - <http://www.doi.org/>
 - ORCID - <https://orcid.org/>
- Respectful of staff time, e.g.
 - Acknowledges inquiries and problem reports within 48 hours
 - Responds to pricing or trial requests within 7 business days
 - Provides renewal orders or invoices at least 45 days prior to term end date
 - Provides accurate invoices with detailed product names/components which match the order form and website
 - Provides for public reference metadata documentation related to: contact information, policies and standards, location of records, updates to records/sets

- Provides for public reference: sales and technical support contact information, title lists and user documentation
- Provides at least 30 day notification of product name changes
- Does not change product name or re-configure product components more frequently than biennially
- Does not remove collection content more frequently than biennially
- Does not request sales visits more than biennially
- Does not contact (phone, email) regarding “special offers” more than quarterly.
- Flexible and responsive to Libraries’ requests for terms, e.g.:
 - Works with library and consortia to identify institutional authors and article submissions. See Efficiency and Standards for Article Charges (ESAC) resources (<http://esac-initiative.org/guidelines/#implementation>) and workflow guidelines (http://esac-initiative.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/ESAC_workflow_recommendations_1st_draft20march2017.pdf)
 - Provides indemnification for third party copyright infringement claims
 - Provides walk-in public access to resource

Diversity & Inclusion

- Is signatory to the Coalition for Diversity & Inclusion in Scholarly Communications Joint Statement of Principles - <https://c4disc.org/principles/>
- Management has representation from different genders, ethnicities and geographic regions
- Editorial boards or advisory boards have representation from different genders, ethnicities and geographic regions
- Authors represent different genders, ethnicities and geographic regions
- Demonstrates philosophies, policies, practices and procedures that ensure equitable access to opportunities and resources for all

Innovation & Creativity

- Supports provisions for broad uses of platform/resource for research and teaching, e.g.:
 - content mining
 - content reuse (e.g. figures, images, brief excerpts)
 - course reserves
 - digital rights free
 - downloading
 - interlibrary loan
 - multiple output options
 - printing
 - searching within document
 - visualization
- Provides flexible acquisition models, e.g.:
 - approval plan

- single title
- evidence-based
- selective packages
- demand driven
- Multi-year
- Volume discount

Openness & Transparency

- Provides open metadata, freely available via FTP, web-based download interface, email, or through a knowledge base such as OCLC's Worldshare Manager Service.
- Provides transparent pricing, fees and other charges and cost basis for them
- Provides at least 30 day notification and reports prior to collection content changes
- Does not ask for non-disclosure agreement
- Provides accurate payment histories for previously purchased or subscribed content
- Provides open access to UMA author works within subscribed content
- Allows immediate availability of UMA author works within university institutional repository through harvesting or automatic deposit
- Does not require UMA authors to waive Open Access Policy
- Notifies Libraries when contacting UMass Amherst faculty

Sustainability & Stewardship

- Provides archiving and preservation alternatives
- Provides perpetual access to purchased or subscription content
- Operates to remain financially viable without excessive profit making
- Operates a stable platform with <2% downtime
- Supports retention of author's rights and unlimited author reuse (see SHERPA/RoMEO - <http://www.sherpa.ac.uk/romeo/search.php>)