Assessing Stakeholders Perceptions on Private Tuition in Zanzibar

Mshauri Abdulla Khamis

University of Massachusetts Amherst

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.umass.edu/cie_capstones

Part of the Accessibility Commons, Bilingual, Multilingual, and Multicultural Education Commons, and the Education Economics Commons


This Open Access Capstone is brought to you for free and open access by the Center for International Education at ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. It has been accepted for inclusion in Master's Capstone Projects by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. For more information, please contact scholarworks@library.umass.edu.
ASSESSING STAKEHOLDERS PERCEPTIONS ON PRIVATE TUITION IN ZANZIBAR

By

MSHAURI ABDULLA KHAMIS

A capstone project submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER’S OF EDUCATION IN INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION POLICY RESEARCH AND ADMINISTRATION

University of Massachusetts at Amherst

May 2012
Acknowledgements

I am grateful to my academic adviser Dr. Gretchen B. Rossman for her precious advice, encouragements and support for the whole time of my studies and by proofreading this work. I am also indebted to a Director for Center for International Education (CIE), Professor David R. Evans, who helped me in improving my writing skills and his enviable editing skills of this work, is enormous. I shall always be thankful to all CIE faculty members, who read my work and gave me constructive inputs and irreplaceable advice. Many thanks to other CIE staff who directly or indirectly helped me until I managed to produce this report.

I would also like to thank the following friends who read and commented on various aspects of this capstone study including Dr. Leah Kaira and Nancy Gachigo. I would specially like to thank Mr Mohammed Abdalla Said for his supports during the data collection and Benjamin Oganga for his valuable comments and discussions on the issues pertaining private tuition in Tanzania. I would be irresponsible if I would not recognize those who consulted, especially Mr. Ricardo Gomez who devoted his time for this work. I would also like to thank all of my fellow CIE Masters Candidates of 2010 to 2012 for their mutual support and shared friendships during all times of our studies at the University of Massachusetts.

I also sincerely would like acknowledge USAID-Tanzania for a grant that enabled me to pursue my Master’s studies, The Ministry of Education and Vocational Training of Zanzibar for giving me a permission to go for my studies in the US and their valuable support during the data collection and of course being tolerant to me until I accomplished my studies. Last but not list, special thanks to my lovely family members particularly my husband, my mother and my father, my in laws and my sons for their supports, courage and being patients for the whole two years that I was away from them.
Dedication

I dedicate this work to my lovely sons Abubakar, Abdulbar and My husband and to all who consider education as useful tool for human development.
Table of Contents

List of Tables ................................................................................................................................ vi
List of Figures ................................................................................................................................... vi

I. Introduction .................................................................................................................................. 1
   Motivation and rationale for the study ......................................................................................... 1
   Context of the Study .................................................................................................................... 2
   Education structure of Zanzibar ................................................................................................. 5
   Problem Statement ....................................................................................................................... 8
   Research Aims and Objectives .................................................................................................... 11
   Research Questions ...................................................................................................................... 11
   Significance of the Study ............................................................................................................ 12
   The organization of the capstone study ...................................................................................... 13

II. Literature Review ..................................................................................................................... 14
   Definition of private tuition ........................................................................................................ 14
   The Nature and Scope of Private Tuition .................................................................................... 17
   The Rise of Private Tuition ......................................................................................................... 20
   Implications of private tuition .................................................................................................... 27
   Summary ..................................................................................................................................... 30

III. Methodology ............................................................................................................................. 31
   Research design ......................................................................................................................... 32
   Data collection techniques .......................................................................................................... 33
   Selection of the Participants ........................................................................................................ 35
   Invitation process ....................................................................................................................... 37
   Research Instruments and Data Collection Process .................................................................. 37
   Validity and Ethical Issues .......................................................................................................... 42

IV. Data analysis and Discussion of the Study Findings ............................................................... 45
   Stakeholders Perceptions on the Advantages of Private Tuition ............................................... 45
   Stakeholders’ perceptions on the disadvantages of private tuition ........................................... 53
   Factors that influence the growth and access to private tuition ................................................. 59
   Limitations of the Study ............................................................................................................. 65

V. Recommendations and Conclusion ......................................................................................... 66
References.................................................................................................................................... 71
Appendices.................................................................................................................................... 74
Appendix 1: Human Subject Review .............................................................................................. 74
Appendix 2: Informed Consent Forms ............................................................................................ 75
Appendix 3: Application letter to the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training Zanzibar ................................................................................................................................................... 78
Appendix 4: Permission letter from the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training Zanzibar .............................................................................................................................................................. 79
Appendix 6: Questions used in the Focus Group Discussion ........................................................... 81
Appendix 7: Sample of questionnaire ............................................................................................ 82
Appendix 8: Disadvantages of private tuition as developed by sub-group in the NGT Discussions ................................................................................................................................................... 85
List of Tables

Table 1: Schools participated in the study by district ............................................................... 35
Table 2: Summary of the approaches for data analysis ............................................................. 42
Table 3: Deterioration of the cultural values of the private tutees ............................................ 86
Table 4: Increase gap between those who have and who have not among learners ............... 86

List of Figures

Figure 1 Flow of Education in Zanzibar .................................................................................. 8
Figure 2: The concurrent triangulation design Adapted from Creswell, 2009; p.20 ............... 32
Figure 3: Advantages of private tuition developed and rated by students ................................ 46
Figure 4: Advantages of private tuition developed by parents ............................................... 49
Figure 5: Advantages of private tuition developed by head teachers .................................... 51
Figure 6: Consensus statements from participants ................................................................... 52
Figure 7: Stakeholders’ perception on private tuition as a causative to students’ lack of time to do revision ......................................................................................................................... 54
Figure 8: Private tuition perceived as a contributor to the deterioration of cultural value, ethics and attitudes of the students .................................................................................. 57
Figure 9: Factors that perceived to influence the growth of private tuition in Zanzibar ........ 64
I. Introduction

This study investigated the perceptions of key education stakeholders on the issue of private tuition in Zanzibar. The key stakeholders invited to participate in this study were parents, head teachers, Advanced School Students (ASSs) and Senior Education Officer from the Ministerial level. The study sought their perceptions on factors that influence the growth of and access to private tuition, its advantages and disadvantages. The purpose of this chapter is to present a general overview of the study. The chapter has seven sections: the motivation and rationale for conducting this study; the context of the study including my personal working experience with the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MoEVT) Zanzibar; the research aims, objectives and research questions; significance of the study; methodological framework; the organization of the research study; and summary of the main issues articulated in this chapter.

Motivation and rationale for the study

The motivation and rationale to undertake this research on private tuition in Zanzibar was drawn from the three bases: first from my personal working experience and beliefs that private tuition has implications for students and entire education sector; second, research evidence and reviews of the literature on the effects of private tuition in other countries; and third, the provisions in Zanzibar education policy for providing quality of education to all Zanzibaris.

My personal experience with the education system of Zanzibar leads me to undertake this study. The fact is that I spent all of my educational life from standard or grade one to undergraduate degree in Zanzibar, Tanzania. I was also a teacher for almost ten years from 1992
to 2002 in the same education systems and settings. At the time I decided to work on this topic, I was an educational planner at the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MoEVT) in Zanzibar, where one of my responsibilities was to plan for quality education which is accessible to all in Zanzibar.

I believe that private tuition is a phenomenon that has many positive and negative implications for access to and provision of education services, as has been discussed by many scholars around the world. However, there is no particular study that traces the positive and negative sides of private tuition in Zanzibar. I was therefore interested at this topic in order to assess the perceptions of key education stakeholders on the advantages and disadvantages of private tuition and their perceptions on the factors that influence the growth of and access to private tuition in Zanzibar.

**Context of the Study**

Zanzibar is located in the Indian Oceans about 40 kilometers off the cost of Tanzania mainland. It has 2,640 square kilometers. Zanzibar has 984,265 inhabitants, with annual birth rate of 3.1 percent. Children under 15 years of age make up 44.3 percent of the total population (ZSGRP, 2010, p. 40); this implies a high burden of children in dependency age which sets a limit on household savings and reduces the ability of women to participate in the labor force (MoEVT and ZEDCO, 2007). 54 percent of the population is in age 15 to 55 years of age group and 51 percent is female and 68% lives in rural (MoEVT, 2006, p. xiii). Zanzibar’s population therefore is comparatively young, with more than half the population under 18 years of age (MoEVT and ZEDCO, 2007, p. 10). The rapid growth of population indicates the high demand for quality education services and employment generation in Zanzibar.
Zanzibar is a low income state and its economy depends mostly on services and agriculture, although in recent years the tourism sector has shown promising growth. According to the poverty study, about 22 percent of Zanzibaris live below the food poverty line. Poverty rates are high in rural compared to urban areas. Poverty is a major constraint to the level of education that students can achieve: though education is an indirect cost to the family, it may be one among the burdens especially to poor households with many children. Education therefore is expected to play a key role for reducing income poverty, and it is a corner stone for economic growth, cultural and social development.

The Revolutionary Government of Zanzibar (RGoZ) recognizes the importance of education for achieving the overall development goal for improving the quality of life of Zanzibaris. It has initiated several national policies such as Vision 2020, Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (ZSGRP) and structural reforms. The RGoZ is also embraced international goals and conventions including Education for All (EFA), Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), and the Convention on the Rights of Child (CRC) Special needs education, access and equity (MoEVT, 2006, p. 1). All of these efforts aim to reinforce the direct connection between the quality of education provided at all levels and the socio-economic growth that may be achieved through the provision of quality education and guarantee universal basic education for all school age children.

The high population growth rate of 3.1 percent in low resource countries like the case of Zanzibar can undermine growth and poverty reduction efforts. Rapid population growth also means that the size of population, its age structure, the age dependency burden, labor force supply, rural and urban distribution and densities have implications for development (ZSGRP,
Therefore, education must provide quality education that offers knowledge, skills and competences to the learners and that benefits the Zanzibaris' society.

Parents as well consider better education for their children as an investment which has direct positive benefit on family and socio-cultural improvement. Culturally, Zanzibar appreciates the extended family approach with moderate power distance at the household level to the national settings. Therefore, parents participate well in the provision of education services through their school committees. They value education as an asset to bring bright futures for their children, family and community in general. One of the rates of return to education is getting a good paying job that enables a graduate to look after their parents and relatives.

However, the financial constraints faced by the RGoZ leads it to devote 4.5 percent of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) which is about 18.5 percent of government expenditure to education sector which is not sufficient. Moreover, the MoEVT spend 81 percent of its located budget in the recurrent expenditures (MoEVT & ZEDCO, 2007). Despite the fact the RGoZ struggle with the limited resources to the education sector to achieve both national and international goals, there are some successes of education. There is a massive expansion of the basic compulsory education services in all areas of the country which results in the increasing of gross enrolment rate (GER) of primary education 118.5 in 2011. Gender parity has been also achieved at primary and lower secondary. Students with special needs also enrolled. In 2011 for example, there are 4300 children with different special needs enrolled (MoEVT, 2011, p. 67). At lower secondary (grade 9 to 12), a total of 77,671 students accommodated (41640 female and 36031 are male) and advanced secondary level are 4,182, out of them 2,138 are female (MoEVT, 2011, pp. 140 – 141) for both public and private schools. Though passing rate of both lower secondary and advanced secondary education is unpredictable. In 2007 for example, the
percentage of pass rate was 79.2 and 79.8 for grade 12 and grade 14 respectively, whereas in 2010 was only 71.1 percent for grade 12 and 77.4 percent of grade 14 (MoEVT, 2011, p. 94 and 97).

There are also challenges faced by the MoEVT as were revealed by various studies done in the education sector. These included low representation of women at university level compared to those girls attending in basic education, inadequate library services, shortage of qualified science and mathematics teachers at all levels of education and the like (MoEVT, 2006). The MoEVT therefore developed a new education policy which started its implementation in 2010. This policy formulated for a more holistic approach in which the Sector Wide Approach (SWAP) was applied to ensure that it realigns with the government’s efforts on accelerating socio-economic development and strategies for poverty reduction. The policy also directs to the harmonisations of the development interventions to achieve the vision 2020, EFA and MDGs goals.

**Education structure of Zanzibar**

The current education policy introduces twelve years of basic education. The new policy universalizes four years of lower secondary and two years of pre-primary education for all school age children. According to this policy, the starting age for formal schooling is age 4 starting pre-primary schooling to 15 years of age, end of grade twelve. Therefore, the education structure is 2+6+4+2+3 and above. The policy therefore directs every child to start two years of pre-primary, 6 years of primary education, 4 years of lowers secondary education. Test and school examinations are used to measure students’ performance to select those who meet the performance standards to continue to another grade. After 6 years of primary education, there is a national examination to enter four years of lower secondary education. Those who excel in
their primary examinations are enrolled in the special streams based on their qualification (see figure 2 below). The aim is to have young people who grow up in their specialization from lower secondary education to the university level, if they can make it. Those who cannot meet the standards continue with ordinary grade 9 to 12. Both students in special stream and ordinary classes sit for the national Certificate of Secondary Education Examination (CSEE) after 4 years of lower secondary schooling. Those who qualified are selected to continue with 2 years of Advanced Secondary Education (ASE). After these two years of ASE, students sit again for national Advanced Certificate Secondary Education (ACSEE). The qualified students are selected to join three years or more to college or university depending on students’ qualifications. For those who could not reach the standards after four years of lower secondary education may join private schools at their own costs.

The education structure is highly based on written tests and examinations to continue for further studies; it is therefore associated with the high demand for private tuition in Zanzibar. The fact is that Zanzibaris are aware that education is important for individual, social and economic development. They look for better education services that enable learners to pass the examinations. Some formal schools in Zanzibar offer private tuition in and out of their school buildings, to their own formal students and neighbouring schools. Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MoEVT) officials are aware that private tuition is organized in formal schools and it takes place in different settings in Zanzibar and parents may or may not willing to pay for private tuition.
Tertiary education: Age 18+ for 3+ year education

Colleges/VETA

NE

Form
Form 1
Form 2
Form 3
Form 4
Form V
Form IV

Unbiased stream: Age 14 to 16

Selected biased stream: Age 12-16

Primary level
Official age 6 to 11

Pre-primary 2
Pre-primary 1

Population age 7-13
Of Primary

Key
Old Policy
New Policy
Common Feature
NE= National Exams

Entry age: 4 years
Problem Statement

Every year, thousands of students complement their education with private lessons after school hours. They do this for several reasons; for example, to improve their performance in specific subjects, to prepare for higher educational levels, or in the hope of passing national examinations. Others hire private tutors as a sign of social status or due to peer pressure. Private tuition is usually defined in the literature as “extra lessons after school” (Foondun, 2002, p. 487). In some cases it is also defined as “learning activities for the clientele of the formal school which take place outside of the regular school instruction program for a fee or as a community service” (Foondun, 2002, p. 487). Private tuition has recently become a growing phenomenon around the world (Bray, 1999, 2003; Foondun, 2002; Nath, 2008).

Several studies (Bray, 1999, 2003, 2007; Foondun, 2002; Nath, 2008; Silova, 2010; Smith, 2008), have shown that private tuition has both positive and negative implications not only for the education sector but it also has socio-economic and socio-cultural impacts (Bray, 1999, 2003; Foondun, 2002; KWOK Lai-Yin, 2004; Marimuthu et al., 1991).

A study by Dang and Rogers (2008) showed that in Asian societies, students who attend private tuition have greater opportunity to perform better in their examinations. This may lead them to have great opportunity for higher education to universities entrance. In Mauritius for example, the students who excel at end of primary cycle examinations are posted to the best secondary schools. Furthermore, those who outshine in the Cambridge Higher School Certificate Examinations are offered scholarship to British, French or Australian Universities. Students admit that they would never performed like that without extra private tuition (Foondun, 2002, p. 487).
Bray (2003) and Dang and Rogers (2008) also state that even the slow learners can learn well and increase their academic performances when they have access to private tuition than students who do not have access to this service. They add that private tuition also seems to enhance self-esteem and shape the attitudes towards academic study, diligence, and social order.

On the other hand, private tuition can have less positive implications. Low payment and lack of incentives to teachers compared to other disciplines which have same qualifications that teachers hold is stated as cause that influence teachers to run their own private tuition classes in order to earn more income that may help to satisfy their family needs and promotes employment (Biswal, 1999; Bray, 1999, 2003; Nath, 2008; Silova, 2010). This leads some students to receive private tuition from their formal school teachers and again during their traditional classes. Teachers who are involved in the provision of the Private Tuition perform less during their formal school hours as strategies to attract their students to join their private classes where they devote their time and energy for better results of their students (Biswal, 1999; Bray, 1999). Bray (1999, 2003) also mentions the downside of this is that students who could not pay for extra tuition are unfairly treated because teachers are paying more attention to their private tutees or those who absorbed the lesson quickly. In addition to that, parents are indirectly forced to pay for the private tuition of their children because it is found that they are encouraged to enroll their children to Private tuition when they find that their neighbor’s children attend private tuition (Bray, 1999, 2007). Parents believe that schools fail to provide education in quality manners. So that, without enrolling their children in the Private Tuition, their children may get undesirable examination results.

As part of her education policy, the Revolutionary Government of Zanzibar (RGoZ) declared and implemented fee free basic education for all since September, 1964. High
enrolment rates caused by high birth rate and other economic factors weakened the capacity of the RGoZ to cater to the demand of educational institutions as well as learners and their teachers. Then in 1992, the Revolutionary Government of Zanzibar allowed private investors to invest in education. Thus, the private schools emerged. The private tuition existed for many years in Zanzibar, but because there is no data to prove that I believed that the growth of paid private tuition realized in 1992 when the popularity of private tuition is evident from the mushrooming centers for private tuitions and increasing number of students who are attending private tuition classes. This commodity is highly demanded by students who want to prepare for national examinations. Most attendants of private tuition therefore are students in grades six and seven, form two, form four and advance secondary to tertiary education. Students in these levels of education are eligible to sit for national exams. Students in primary education for example, sit for final exams of end of primary cycle of education. This examination selects students who perform better to join special secondary classes (in special stream such as science, computers, foreign languages and so on) that allow them to consequently study four years of lower secondary education. Those who do not meet the standards for special classes enrolled in two years of junior secondary education. After two years of junior secondary education, they have to sit for standardized exams to continue with two years of senior lower secondary, then two years of advance secondary to college or university. For those who do not meet the standards to senior lower secondary, will be out of the formal education system. Their parents are eligible to pay for further studies if they have capacity to do so. Generally, the demand for private tuition increased because of the examinations structures within the education sector.

The Southern Africa Consortium for Monitoring Education Quality (SACMEQ) study report revealed that 44 percent of the standard six students had received some kind of private
tuition, either by paid or not (Nassor & Mohammed, 1998, p. 20). Despite the increasing popularity of private tuition in Zanzibar, no study has been conducted on this topic. Therefore, this study seeks to begin a line of research in this issue, in an effort to gain understanding of the impact and implications of private tuition on the education system and academic performance of students. I do this by exploring the perceptions of the key education stakeholders in Zanzibar including parents, advanced secondary school head teachers, advanced secondary students (ASS) and senior education officers (SEO). The study sought their perceptions on what they perceive to be the factors that drive for the growth of Private Tuition, its advantages and disadvantages to the learners and education sector in general.

Research Aims and Objectives

This research study examines the perceptions of key stakeholders on the factors that influence private tuition as well as the advantages and disadvantages of private tuition in Zanzibar. Therefore, the main objectives of this study were to:

a. Analyze stakeholders’ perceptions on the advantages of private tuition.

b. Analyze stakeholders’ perceptions on the disadvantages of private tuition.

C. Identify and describe factors associated with private tuition and stakeholders’ perceptions on private tuition in Zanzibar

Research Questions

The aims and objectives of the study will be achieved by addressing three key research questions, they are:

1. What do stakeholders see to be the advantages of private tuition to the learners in their learning progression and to the education settings/sector in general?
2. What do they remark to be the disadvantages of this phenomenon to the provision of the education service?

3. What do they perceive to be the factors that drive the growth of and accessing private tuition in Zanzibar?

**Significance of the Study**

This study is significant for many reasons including opening the door for further research on the impacts of the private tuition such as investigating academic performance between students who have received private tutoring and those who did not in Zanzibar, the cost benefit analysis of private tutoring, the impact of private tuition in the community and to what extent it is related to create gap/s to the access to better quality of education between richer and poor, its effects to household expenditures and a like.

The study results also highlight both the advantages and disadvantages of private tuition. The information from the study may help various education stakeholders in Zanzibar make decisions on private tuition. The findings of the study, for example, will help policy makers in the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training to formulate appropriate policies with regard to the implementation of private tuition. Teachers on their side may use the study results to improve their teaching and learning process in order to make education services accessible to all.

Furthermore, parents may also find the results of the study useful. This is because parents pay a lot of money to enable their children to attend private tuition classes. Similarly, the study findings may help students to decide whether it is worthwhile or not to invest their time in attending private tuition classes or make follow up of their studies during school hours and then make revisions, read books and have discussions among themselves or continue receiving lectures from different private tutors.
The organization of the capstone study

The study has five main chapters. Chapter one discusses the contextual and outline of the study. Chapter two is concerned with the literature reviews where it examines studies on private tuition, its causes and consequences. Chapter three based on discussion of research methodology includes data collection methods, data analysis, ethical issues considered during the research and limitations of the study. Chapter four presents the study results that followed by the discussion under each the study findings. Chapter five comprises recommendations and conclusion of the study.
II. Literature Review

Private tuition is no longer a new phenomenon to key education stakeholders, and it has become an entrepreneurial venture that impacts the education sector. However, it has not received great attention from policy and decision makers (Bray, 1999; Dang & Rogers, 2008; Nath, 2008). Private tuition started to flourish in the mid-1990s after the collapse of the former Union of Soviet Socialist Republic (USSR) and immediately after the beginning of privatization of education sector in Zanzibar and in Tanzania at large. The collapse of former USSR is recalled here as a matter of periodization and because Tanzania as a socialist country did not allow existence of private schools. Therefore all schools were run by the state. In the discussion below, one will notice that private tuition has been named differently from place to place, depending on the political-socio-cultural nature of the given society. Private tuition is formally organized in private centers, institutes or academies (Bray, 1999).

For the purpose of this paper, the terms private tuition and extra tuition will be used interchangeably, however, the meaning will remain the same as to private tuition. In this section, the meaning of private tuition and its rise in Zanzibar are explored.

Definition of private tuition

There are many perspectives and meanings given by academia on what is private tuition. As mentioned earlier in the introductory chapter, private tuition is named differently from one location to the other, depending on the political and social economic background of the given country. All this comes as result of the expansion of private tuition and the demand of education worldwide.
Many definitions are in places that try to define the term “private tuition”. It can be defined as extra, fee-paying academic teaching or drilling for full-time students studying in regular school instruction programs at all levels of education (KWOK Lai-Yin, 2004, p. 4). Bray (1999) for example defines private tuition as “the paid extra teaching offered out of school hours, by individuals, institution or an organized group of people for the purpose of enhancing academic performance and bridging the learning gap that the learner might be facing and as a source of income to the tutors” (p. 20) and Foondun (2002) identifies private tuition is an “extra coaching in academic and examinable subjects that is given to the students outside of school hours for remuneration” (p. 3).

The term is used differently in different places. Bray (1999) for example, states that in Anglophone societies, as in Tanzania, private tuition is sometimes referred to as “supplementary tutoring or extra tuition”(p. 22). He continues saying that in other countries like in Japan, for instance, private tuition is a big enterprise which is identified as “Juku as distinguished from Yobiko which mainly serves pupils who have left school but who want an extra ‘block’ of time to study intensively for examinations in order to gain higher grades for entrance to universities” (p. 22). These forms of supplemental tutoring are sometimes referred to as the shadow education system, private supplementary tutoring, extra tuition, and the like (Biswal, 1999; Bray, 1999, 2003; KWOK Lai-Yin, 2004; Nath, 2008).

The term, “shadow system” refers to how this private tuition stands “in the shadow” of the formal education structure. It, therefore, follows the formal education curricula, changes when formal education changes, and would not exist without the presence of the formal schooling systems. Again, it is referred to this way because the public pays more attention to the formal education system than to its shadow “private tutoring” (Bray, 1999; Dang & Rogers,
Private tuition is also known as ‘supplementary tuition’ because it focuses on academic subjects for extra tutoring after official school hours; it also supplements the financial income of the private tutors. Nonetheless, it also called ‘extra tuition’ because it provide more time to the students’ learning in certain subjects which are either already taught or not yet taught in the regular school hours by a formal subject teacher (Bray, 1999, 2003; Nath, 2008).

Private tutoring is currently a huge industry which is practiced in all parts of the world. It exists in both developed and developing countries (Bray, 1999). It is implemented in much of East Asia, particularly in Japan and South Korea and is on the increase in Africa, Central Asia, Eastern, Latin America, Western Europe, North America, and Australia (Bray, 1999, 2003; Ireson & Rushforth, 2011; KWOK Lai-Yin, 2004). However, in the last three continents, private tuition exists but is not recognized as important (Bray, 1999, p. 29) as compared to other continents.

In Zanzibar, private tuition is characterized by the nature of the academics offered at the centers. It is an academically-oriented, monetary transfer from tutees (in some cases) or their parents or guardians to tutors and the content taught is offered to tutees after regular schooling hours. It complements or repeats what the learner has already been taught in the school during regular hours or what the student is expected to learn in his/her class during regular class hours.

For the purpose of this study, the definition of private tuition developed in relation to the context of Zanzibar defines private tuition as any teaching and learning process carried out after or before formal school hours that involves private fee payments between the learners and their tutors. The meaning include both formal school teachers and private tutors as private tuition providers.
The Nature and Scope of Private Tuition

Private tuition is a complex and irregular phenomenon. It is complex because it does not have a direct connection with formal education. It is irregular because most governments face some difficulties to manage, inspect, regulate and control the provision of this service (Bray, 1999; KWOK Lai-Yin, 2004). Therefore its scale, setting, management and reasons for private tuition may differ from one society to another. Bray (1999) for example, contends that “the significant factors which determine the scale of private tuition are cultural, economic, as well as educational factors” (p. 29). All of these factors may affect the organization or setting of the private tuition; either to be offered by one teacher to one student mode, like in England and other countries; in a small group of students per teacher; or in large class settings like in most of the developing countries where there is a shortage of qualified subject teachers with less advanced technology.

In high income states with advanced technology, children receive extra lessons via internet, telephone and other kinds of software packages (Bray, 2006). Bray (2006) discusses the interactive MathTutor.com Company in USA which provides extra math tutoring in the student’s home, and the payment is done online through credit card. This form of private tuition accommodates tutees from different states in USA and other parts of the geographic area, but the private tutor and tutees are unlikely to ever meet in person. As another example, Indian math tutors offer extra education services to American students by using computers connected with the internet. Tutors use White Board software, in both voice and text platforms, so that the tutor and tutees can see each other over the computer and can communicate by using headphone (Bray, 2006, pp. 519–520). Therefore, the mode and supply of private tuition depends more on the
market demand of the formal school subjects, the level of education of the learners, and the availability of the needed tutor (Bray, 1999, 2003).

Private tuition occurs at different levels of education, ranging from pre-school to university levels (Bray, 1999, 2003; Silova, 2010). Dang and Rogers (2008) argue that private tutoring is an important phenomenon not only for upper-secondary students who prepare themselves for university entrance exams but also for students at primary and lower-secondary levels of education. They mention Japan as an example where private tuition is common among upper-secondary graduates (p. 3). They also show that in Vietnam, 29 percent of the students preparing for university entrance examinations join private lessons.

Other studies show that in East African countries, especially Tanzania and Kenya, students attend extra lessons after their regular school hours. About 70 percent and 44 percent of primary school grade six students in Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar respectively receive private tutoring and in Kenya, a study done in 1997 found that 68 percent out of 3233 national sample of grade six students received private tuition (Bray, 1999, p. 25, 2006, p. 517; Nassor & Mohammed, 1998, p. 20).

In East Asia, as another example, a study showed that, about 87 percent of elementary school students, 75 percent of middle school, and 56 percent of high school students received extra teaching after official school hours in different subjects (Nath, 2008). In England as well, it is reported that, about 27 percent of the students receive extra tuition after the regular school day (Ireson & Rushforth, 2011). Taken together, these studies indicate that the demand for extra tuition emerges in many countries at all levels of education.
The study shows that the proportions of learners who are attending extra tuition significantly increases among the students in the higher grade than in lower grades (Bray, 1999; Dang & Rogers, 2008; Nath, 2008). Nath (2008), for example, states that it was 22.3 percent of the grade one primary pupils who received private tutoring in Bangladesh; the percentage increased from the second to the fifth grade as follows: 29.5, 34.3, 37.2 and 38.4 %. Apart from the fact that the number of students who involved in private tuition increases across grade levels, private tuition has been found also expanding over time. For example, the study shows that in Japan, in the year 1976 about 39 percent received private tuition and in 1993, the number increased to 60 percent.

In the same country – Japan - at lower secondary education, the percentage of students who received private tuition reached 22 percent in 1993 from 10 percent of 1976. In Singapore, the percentage of primary school children who received private tutoring increased by 22 percent; from 37 percent in 1982 to 49 percent in 1992. The study in Mauritius reveals also that there is a growth in enrollment rate in private tuition for grade six students as it shows that those who received tuition in grade six primary education in 1986 were 73 percent and that the rate increased to 78 percent in 1995 (Nath, 2008, p. 26).

Most of the students who are in need of private tuition in Zanzibar are not different from the context of England, as explained by Ireson and Rushforth (2011). In Zanzibar, there are four main transition points where most of students enroll in private tuitions. One is when students are in standard six when they prepare to sit for the end of primary cycle exams which will then allow them to enter the two years of lower secondary education, at ages 11 to 12 years. The second point is when students prepare to take the end of lower secondary exams that enable them to enter and sit for the two years of upper secondary school examinations; this is the last cycle of
compulsory basic education and most of the students’ age at this cycle ranges from 14 to 15 years. The third point where many students enroll again in private tuition is when they sit for Advanced Certificate for Secondary School Examination (ACSEE) which if they pass, allows them to join colleges and universities. Good section detailing the scope of private tuition.

The Rise of Private Tuition

Zanzibar, as part of the United Republic of Tanzania that followed a socialist path with close ties with Russia (former USSR) and other socialist states in the world, started to feel the coming of private tuition during and or immediately after the demise of the Cold War that went together with the fall of the Soviet Union in the mid-1990s. This work does not aim to link the rise of private tuition and the collapse of the former USSR but rather to give a timeframe as to when private tuition in Zanzibar is thought to have started. Its link to the collapse of former USSR can be a separate study from this one.

The timing of private tuition in Zanzibar is also associated with the periods of the introduction of Structural Adjustment Programs (SAP) which was introduced by the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank (WB) as a strategy of economic growth in the developing countries. The introduction of SAP in Tanzania contributed to the reduction of government’s spending on education with more emphasis going to the agricultural sector. As a result, teachers’ salaries and allowances stagnated. This affected the quality of teaching and learning in most of the schools in Tanzania and Zanzibar, in particular.

There are different explanations given in the world of academics that might have caused the rise of private tuition both in developed and developing countries. In Zanzibar, for example, the key concepts that tries to explain the coming or rise of private tuition includes the decline of
state education expenditure; privatization of education and increasing spending on education by the parents; cultural and socio-economic issues; declining professional legitimacy of teachers; changing quality of education in mainstream schools; increasing demand for higher education and competition (Silova, 2010, pp. 328–331).

Declining of state education expenditures and increasing private spending on education in Zanzibar is associated with the rise of private tuition. For example in 1991, the recurrent expenditure on basic education was 39.3 percent compared to the recurrent expenditure of 86.0 percent in 1998 (Mohammed, 1999). The decrease of the government’s development budget in education resulted to the introduction of cost sharing in education from the local communities to schools. The parents’ contribution used to purchase chalks, classroom construction and furnishing. Moreover, parents also contribute to the school uniforms exercise books, pens, and other scholastic materials. This had twofold impacts, one, parents were made to think responsively and take care of their school going children. They became aware that, it is their responsibility to make sure that their children learns and learns at best. Two, it reduced the quality of learning in schools as most of the schools lacked the necessary teaching and learning materials like books, shortage of classrooms, shortage of teachers as teachers were not employed and the like (Bray, 2006). As a result, parents started to think of the ‘alternatives’ of how to make their children learn better. The immediate solution was to find someone who could teach their children at home or somewhere else with a small fee of like Tshs.100.00 per day per subject. Parents did not care about the tutor’s qualification of being trained and a ‘qualified teacher’ (Silova, 2010).

Declining in professional legitimacy of teachers and teaching profession in the societies also resulted to the rise of private and extra tuition (Silova, 2010). The situation is not different
as to in case of Zanzibar. Decline in public spending in education resulted to the decreasing real salaries, deteriorating social status and declining authority of teachers in the society (Silova, 2010). Lowly paid teachers’ salaries did not support their needs and removal of teachers’ privileges like monthly allowances termed as ‘teaching allowances’ in 1990s also affected teacher’s living standards. Before the reduction and removal of teaching allowance, teaching allowances supplemented teachers’ salaries and therefore teachers were and remained among the well paid employees by the government before 1990s.

The removal of teaching allowances and the continued low pay salaries among teachers compared to fellow government employees contributed to the lowering of the teachers’ status in the society. This situation not only discouraged and demoralized teachers from teaching but also reduced teachers’ effective teaching in the regular classrooms. Teachers developed absenteeism attitude as well. As a result, teachers had to find the other way of surviving (coping strategy) - creating more income that would cover up their removed teaching allowances and lowly paid salaries by the government. In order that they can be able to meet some of their basic demands like buying food for their families, clothes and paying fees for their daughters and sons, teachers opened up tuition centers where they taught extra classes with small fee per student. Experiences shows that, in order to attract more students in their tuition classes they either did not attend their normal classes or teach ineffectively and ask students who did not understand the lesson to go for extra classes in their private tuition centers. In this respect, “private tuition has become an effective solution to the problems teachers faced and thus counterbalancing their economic hardship and restoring their professional legitimacy” (Silova, 2010, p. 331).

Increased demand and competition for higher education also contributed to the rise of private tuition (Dang & Rogers, 2008; Silova, 2010). Study shows that, in the context of the
reduction of government spending in education and introduction of fees in schools, higher education became expensive and competitive particularly in the state or government funded schools and colleges (Biswal, 1999; Silova, 2010). Higher performance in the national exams determined who is joining government funded schools and colleges. This resulted to the higher competition for students to get chances of being enrolled in government schools. KWOK Lai-Yin (2004), in his study reported that, pressure of passing the school exams forces students to seek for extra tuition in order to have examination skills and “cope with the examination pressure” (p. 7). In this situation therefore, parents had no option than investing in private tuition so that their children could perform higher in their final exams to be able to get chances to the government funded schools and thus be able to avoid higher and expensive school paying fees (Biswal, 1999; Silova, 2010).

*Private investment in education sector and rise of private schools* in Zanzibar can also be associated with the rise of private tuition in the Island. In Zanzibar, private schools were re-introduced in 1992 after being abolished by the government in 1967 under the Arusha Declarations that demanded all schools to be run by the government (Ministry of Education, 2006, p. 20). Under the new Zanzibar Education Policy of 2006, private schools are recognized as important part in the development of education sector. Many private schools were opened as up to 2004 there were 157 private schools in Zanzibar (Ministry of Education, 2006). Therefore, welcoming private investors in education sector in Zanzibar is associated with the opening up of private tuition centers or academic centers as they became legal and allowed to operate under education policy. At the beginning, some of these centers acted as places where those who graduate basic education and do not qualify to senior secondary education could get trained and then sit for National Certificate of Secondary Education Exams (CSEE). Eventually, they turned
to be centers for extra lessons operating out of normal class hours and mostly taught by the regular classroom teachers, graduate and senior secondary school leavers (in some cases).

The underlying assumption that private tuition can offsets the governments’ failures to provide quality education services. It is assumed that private tuition supplements or bridges the gap of the governments’ failure to provide quality education. Nath (2008) reports that the demand for private tutoring is driven by the perception that governments have failed to provide quality education to all school age children. This comes due to the fact that public schools are not very well equipped and miss important features for students to learn effectively. Most of the public schools reported to have shortage of qualified teachers, teaching and learning facilities and good care to the learners. Nath (2008) exemplifies the education system in Korea and Bangladesh that they provide low quality of education to the primary school graduates (p. 56). In Bangladesh, for example, Nath (2008) mentions that only 29 percent of the children of 11 to 12 years of age had basic primary level competences, the remaining were semi-literate or illiterate. Therefore, people feel that the amount of teaching and learning in these schools is inadequate. As such the general public looks into private supplementary tutoring to bridge the gap (Nath, 2008, p. 56). The insufficient delivery of public education service also is experienced in Zanzibar. Nassor & Mohammed (1998) for example, reveal that there are shortage of both qualified teachers and teaching and learning facilities that may help student to learn well and perform better in their education. They state that about 16.8 percent of the grade six teachers did not receive any teacher training and 17 percent attended short courses of less than one year (p. 23). Furthermore, it is revealed that only 26 percent of the standard six of primary classes have library services and only 21 percent of the primary schools have access to computer, where 48
and 47 percent of the grade six students own text books for reading and mathematics respectively (Bray, 1999, 2003; Dang & Rogers, 2008; Nath, 2008; Hungi, et al., 2009).

*The level of education of the parents, household income and the household settlements of the education stakeholders* are considered the major factors that determine the demand for extra tuition (Bray, 1999, 2003; Dang & Rogers, 2008; Nath, 2008). The influence of household income to private tuition depends on the characteristic of the household. (Dang & Rogers, 2008) reference that in Egypt, the demand for extra tuition is influenced by the wealth of household, while in Turkey and Vietnam, the demand for this service is determined by the household expenditure. Parental education and the location of household settlement are other factors that influence parents looking for private tutors of their children. Most of the private tutees are more likely from wealth families. They also live in urban areas and their parents are more educated than those children live in rural settings (Bray, 1999, 2006; Dang & Rogers, 2008; Silova, 2010). In Central Asia particularly in Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Kazakhstan, for example, (Silova, 2010) informs that 48 percent of students whose parents have higher education have access to extra tuition compare with 28 percent whose their parents have no such level of education (p. 331). Bray (1999) also reports that urban bias on accessing private tuition exists in some countries, such as in Cambodia, Malaysia and Egypt. In Cambodia, for instance, 61 percent among the urban public primary schools in the sample, their students receive extra tutoring compare with only 9 percent of the students in the public primary schools located in the rural areas. With regards to Malaysia, 59 percent of the students have access to private tuition compared with 28 percent in the rural school age children (p. 30). In the case of Egypt, the Household Survey of 1994 declares that 65 percent of the urban primary students and to 53 percent of the rural primary level students attend private lessons. The same situation experienced
in Kenya that private classes are much more in urban than in rural. Moreover, in some societies boys are more enrolled in extra tuition than girls (Bray, 1999, p. 24, 2006, p. 517).

*Parents’ expectations on the rate of returns to the education for their children* are perceived as another factor that encourages them to enroll their children in private tuition (Bray, 2006; Dang & Rogers, 2008). This also increases the demand of private tuition in some subjects, such as science, mathematics and languages that are realized to be the leading subjects in the market of private tuition in many countries like in Sri Lanka, Singapore, countries in Sub-Saharan Africa, just to mention a few (Bray, 1999; Ireson & Rushforth, 2011).

*Peer pressure among parents or influence from other parents* is also considered as another factor that leads to high demand for private tutoring in some societies. Education is increasingly demanded, and its importance is being realized day after day. It is assumed that the increasing demand for education and the scarcity of education or learning resources might have resulted in the development of private tuition. (Bray, 1999) mentions that parents in Asian communities, particularly in Taiwan, are more likely to enroll their children in private tutoring when they find that children in their neighborhoods are enrolled in that programs because parents do not want their children to be left behind (Bray, 1999, p. 45). They instead allocate their children to the private tuition in order to get good grades that may lead them to continue with their further education, therefore, extra tutoring is used as a supplement for academic achievement (Bray, 2007). Nath (2008) also shows that, in India, the private tuition is welcomed by the majority because it provides opportunity to slow learners or “weaker students to make up their deficiencies”, therefore, more efforts will help them to do their schools better (p. 56). This is also shown by the study done by Warkentien and Grady, (2009) in the USA that students who don’t make Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) for three and more years are assigned to receive
supplementary tutoring to increase their academic performance (p.2). In Israel as well, Dang and Rogers (2008) indicate that government has been financing the remedial tutoring program for underperforming high school students since 1999. For the purpose of increasing the number of students who earn baccalaureate certificates by providing them with increased instructional time. The program identifies five students from the grade tenth to twelfth in each school, who are mostly judged likely to fail their matriculation exams. Then the classroom teachers are assigned to provide after school tutoring in the subjects in which these students are weak (author, date, p. 11).

**Implications of private tuition**

Private tutoring has positive and negative implications for both the consumers and suppliers of this service. What could be perceived or revealed as a positive impact of private tutoring could also have a negative results in another context. Hence, the implications of extra tutoring have some support/relatiion with factors that influence demand for private tuition. Studies find that private tuition enhances academic performance of the students attending the private tuition. Dang and Rogers (2008) for example, report that the extra tuition in different studies shows that it has significant positive impacts to learners in India, Japan, Kenya, Vietnam and on the other hand has negative impacts to learners in countries like Korea and Singapore (p.10). Below is a case of a study done by Banerjee et al., (2007) in India in a remedial tutoring program financed NGO called Pratham that proved also that private tuition increases performance among students enrolled with this program.
Private tuition helps underpaid teachers to re-establish economic independence and professional legitimacy by providing opportunities for them to generate additional income (Silova, 2010, p. 330; Bray, 2006). This may encourage teachers to build up their service attitude. Most of the students, especially in developing countries, receive extra tuition from their formal subject school teachers (Bray, 1999, 2006; Nath, 2008; Dang & Rogers, 2008), as in Nigeria, India, Central Asia, and Lebanon (Bray, 2006, p. 519; Silova, 2010).

Some studies reveal that in some contexts, some teachers blackmail their students by distorting the school curriculum. They cover only some portion in the annual curriculum during official school hours and then require students to attend their private tuition classes in order to be taught the remaining part of the school curriculum (Bray, 1999, 2006; Dang & Rogers, 2008; Banerjee et al., 2007) find that this tutoring program improved student test scores by large and statistically significant amounts. Children randomly assigned to the treatment group improved their test scores by 0.6 standard deviations in the second year, while control children remaining in the regular classroom did not benefit. Overall, the test scores of children whose schools benefit from this program improved by 0.14 standard deviations in the first year and by 0.28 standard deviations in the second year. However, these gains fell substantially one year after the program ended; suggesting that more research is needed on the long-term impacts of such programs.

**BOX I**

**Pratham** is a large Indian NGO—financed the implementation of a two-year tutoring program in schools in two major cities in India that cater to poor children. This remedial education program was targeted at the weakest children, those in grades 3 or 4 that had not mastered the basic skills. These students were taken out of their classroom and given two hours of additional instruction each day by young women from the community—private tutors, in effect, rather than formal teachers.

Banerjee et al. (2007) find that this tutoring program improved student test scores by large and statistically significant amounts. Children randomly assigned to the treatment group improved their test scores by 0.6 standard deviations in the second year, while control children remaining in the regular classroom did not benefit. Overall, the test scores of children whose schools benefit from this program improved by 0.14 standard deviations in the first year and by 0.28 standard deviations in the second year. However, these gains fell substantially one year after the program ended; suggesting that more research is needed on the long-term impacts of such programs.
Biswal, 2009; Silova, 2010). In addition, Biswal (2009) clarifies that in a situation where most of
the formal teachers are the main suppliers of education service, they become monopoly over
supplying private tuition to their students. This means that teachers “have full discretion in what
they supply”, the power of teachers on deciding what to be taught in their formal classes may
lead them to be less accountable in official school hours.

Therefore, there is a possibility that teachers corrupt their own students by decreasing
their effort on teaching students in their formal classes and supplying private tuition after school
hours for a fee. This is a corruption because students supposed to be taught effectively during
school hours but they are forced to pay for their own right to education in the extra time tuition
(p. 223). Thus, policy and decision makers and school inspectors need to give special
consideration this phenomenon.

Furthermore, it has been found in some studies that private tuition exacerbates socio-
economic inequalities. Silova (2010) identifies that in two studies conducted in Eastern Europe
and Central Asia, 67 percent of the respondents believe that private tutoring is expensive (Silova,
2010, p. 332). Therefore, the students from poor households cannot afford to pay for private
tuition. Thus, lack of payment limits their access private tuition classes. On the other hand, the
studies shows that, while poor families cannot afford private tuition for their children, wealthy or
well to do families can afford to hire better private tutors for their children (Bray, 1999, 2006;
Silova, 2010). Under this situation where other family members cannot pay for the private tuition
while others can, the private tuition is considered to create a gap between those who have (the
haves) and those who have not (the have not). It is therefore accessible to those who can pay for
it and not otherwise.
Summary

Private tuition has both positive and negative consequences in every society that practices it. Private tuitions may increase students’ performance and provide great opportunities for further studies to the learners. It also helps to increase teachers’ income, strengthen academic closeness and good relationships among private teachers and their students.

Alternatively, private tuition can be a source of students’ failure, may create enmities between school teachers and students or teachers and community as well. It may be a like fire burns all development efforts within a society. When teachers are assigned to teach students in their respective schools, for example, and the government pays running costs for the provision of education service in a quality and equity manner. But teachers, instead of being accountable, shrink the services in order to make students pay for the service out of their schools on payment basis.

This situation exists in the most of the developing countries including Tanzania Zanzibar and has caused a lot of problems from the household level to the national level. The major challenges, such as majority who are poor with number of dependent children, will remain poor. Parents from poor households will never afford to pay for the education of their children. And sometime parents themselves did not have opportunities to invest in education. Therefore, the country may produce low-performing human capital that will not contribute to economic development. Furthermore, the country may fail to achieve Education for All goals, national poverty reductions strategic plan, and other national and international commitments.
III. Methodology

1. The purpose of this small study was to explore the perceptions of the key education stakeholders (advanced secondary school students, parents, head teachers and senior education officers) on private tuition in Zanzibar. This study sought to answer the following main research questions:

   1. What do stakeholders see to be the advantages of private tuition to the learners in their learning progression and to the education settings/sector in general?
   2. What do the stakeholders remark to be the disadvantages of this phenomenon to the provision of the education service?
   3. What do the stakeholders perceive to be the factors that drive the growth of and accessing private tuition in Zanzibar?

   These questions were investigated through a mixed methods research design that consisted of focus groups conducted through nominal group technique (NGT) and questionnaires administered to twenty-one stakeholders (seven students, six parents, and eight head teachers) as well as interviews conducted with two students, two parents, and two senior education officers (SEOs) in Zanzibar. Data were collected at the end of July and first week of August, 2011. Mixed methods approach was the most reasonable approach for answering these questions because it allowed the researcher to collect useful information on different perceptions held by key education stakeholders. This chapter presents the research design, procedures used to select participants, research instruments that were used for data collection, data analysis approach, and ethical issues of the study.
Research design

This study followed Creswell’s model of concurrent triangulation. Concurrent triangulations involve collecting qualitative and quantitative data simultaneously. According to Creswell (2009), the concurrent triangulation strategy gives both qualitative and quantitative methods equal emphasis during the data collection process. This approach was chosen because it allowed comparison of the information gathered during the group discussions, survey questionnaires, and interviews. The second reason is the method provides an opportunity for the researcher to merge the data collected quantitatively and qualitatively (Creswell, 2009). In the current study, qualitative results in form of direct quotes are presented to support or counter quantitative results. The link and relationship between qualitative and quantitative illustrated in figure 2 below:

![Diagram of concurrent triangulation design]

**Figure 2: The concurrent triangulation design** Adapted from Creswell, 2009; p.20
Data collection techniques

The study was organized into two phases. In the first phase, focus group discussions were conducted using nominal group techniques were conducted, and the data generated were used to design questionnaires. This phase involved three groups of education stakeholders namely, Head teachers, Parents, and Advanced Secondary School Students.

The first phase focused on generating ideas around the three main research questions. The first question was about the perceived advantages of private tuition to the learners in Zanzibar. The second question was the perceived disadvantages of private tuition, and the third question asked factors that drive the growth of private tuition in Zanzibar.

NGT is a structured method of four to nine members for brainstorming that encourages contribution from every participant. As Scott & Deadrick (1982) state, NGT “is extremely useful tool when the judgment of several individual clarified and aggregated into a group decision” (p. 26). It is also useful in a situation where some of the group members are much more vocal than others, or if some group members think better in silence. NGT is also useful when the group does not easily generate ideas or when the issue is controversial or there is heated conflict. Generally, it provides room to every stakeholder to participate in the study and reduce dominance among the group members (Scott & Deadrick, 1982).

In this study, the NGT was conducted to investigate what the key education stakeholders perceive to be the advantage and disadvantages of private tuition, and what do they perceive to be the factors that drive the growth of and accessing private tuition in Zanzibar. The group interaction therefore, was worthwhile for generating relevant information. In the process, group members had the opportunity to discuss and share views with each other. Interviews were also
conducted by the researcher in order to probe and collect detailed pertinent data from the three groups of stakeholders.

The group members generated ideas into a statement form, as their perceptions of the advantages, disadvantages and factors that drive the growth and access to private tuition. Each statement from sub groups was treated as a variable. The variables were used to generate a Survey Questionnaire (SQ). The SQ comprised 3 Likert type and 4 open response questions for each group. Participants responded to each Likert type question on a 5-point scale ranging from 1 to 5 where 1 was “strongly agree” and 5 corresponded to “strongly disagree”. The participants individually rated each question based on their perception. The open response questions provided a room for the participants to express their suggestions concerning the private tuition.

The second phase of this study involved structured interviews with two senior education officers, two advance secondary school students, and two parents. The interviews were carried out to probe for detailed information on some ideas that emerged from the stakeholders during the group discussions. Interviews were also conducted to get firsthand information regarding the implementation of private tuition.

**Scope of the study**

This study was done in public schools in the Urban West Region in Zanzibar (refer to Figure 2 in appendices). This area was chosen because it is where most of the paid private tuition classes occur and the practice is rapidly expanding. At the time of this study, the Urban West region had eleven public schools into two school districts that had Advanced Secondary Classes (ASCs). Eight schools were chosen for the current study. The schools were chosen in such a way that the two districts were equally represented Thus, four secondary
schools from Urban District and all four secondary school with Advanced Secondary Classes (ASCs) from the West District were selected (see Table 1 below).

Table 1: Schools participated in the study by district

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Schools involved in the study by Districts in the Urban West Region of Zanzibar</th>
<th>Total number of students in eight schools by gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Urban District</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haile Sellasie, Kiponda, Lumumba and Ben-Bella</td>
<td>985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West District</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chukwani, Commercial Mombasa, Mwanakwerekwe ‘C’ and Kiembe-Samaki</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sample and Sampling Technique

This study applied purposive sampling in order to collect information that fulfilled the purpose of the study. This type of sampling allows a researcher to develop several cases that enable him/her to define points of variation with respect the phenomenon being studied (Gall, Gall, & Borg, 2003, p. 179). The participants therefore were selected based on their perceived importance to the topic with the assumption that they have knowledge and experience on private tuition.

Selection of the Participants

The participants were recruited for the study after the study materials were approved by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) of the University of Massachusetts at Amherst (UMASS) and the (MoEVT) in Zanzibar. The key education stakeholders recruited to participate in this study were chairpersons of the school management committees (CSMC) as representative of the parents who pay for private tuition for their children; head teachers of secondary schools as
representatives of teachers; school presidents or members of the cabinets of the students’ governments who represented the interest of the advance secondary students; and two senior education officers (SEO) from the ministerial level where education policies and decisions take place. The participants were interviewed to assess their perceptions on the factors that drive the growth of and access to private tuition, its advantages and disadvantages.

The CSMC were chosen not only because they pay for their children’s private tuition, but they are also responsible for supervision of the education services at the community level and act as coordinators between their communities and MoEVT. They represent the interests and issues of the parents to schools administration. The CSMCs are also responsible for making some decisions related to development of their schools as described by the Education Act of Zanzibar. More information about the responsibilities of the SMCs can be found in the SMC Roles and Responsibilities module. Eight Chairpersons of the SMCs, one from each selected school were invited to participate to the study. However, only six (4 females and 2 males) showed up and were involved in the study. Due to the time constraint on my side, it was not possible to recruit other parents to replace the absentees.

Head teachers were selected because of their knowledge about the Zanzibar education system. As supervisors, decision makers and key implementers of education policy, head teachers formed a critical component of the study. Government school leaders particularly presidents or vice presidents from the eight schools were invited to participate in the study. They were selected because they themselves are students who participate in private tuition. They therefore represent the interest of other students as key consumers of the private tuition services.
The study involved two Senior Education Officers (SEOs) to give their perceptions on private tuition. They are important in this study because of the two main reasons. First, their perceptions are important because they may influence policy formulation and educational reforms. Furthermore, their contribution may be used to make comparison with other stakeholders’ perspectives and to generate recommendations.

**Invitation process**

I visited the eight schools in person. I had short meetings with school head teachers discussing the purpose of the research and searching information such as the gender representation in the SMC, students government and School administration and convenient time for the stakeholders particularly members of the SMC to participate in the study. Then invitation letters which explained the purpose of the study, time, venue and participants benefits were sent to the targeted participants via head masters’ office. Then I made follow up by calling the CSMC to check if they had received the invitation. For the students, follow up visits were made to the school to meet the school presidents and confirm that they had received the invitation letters. Although there were follow ups made to ensure that the invitations had been received, participation in the study was completely voluntary. The people invited were free to decline their participation in the study.

**Research Instruments and Data Collection Process**

The study was done in the MoEVT conference room which was convenient to the researcher and participants as well. The MoEVT is located on a main road which made it easily accessible to participants. Use of the MoEVT conference room helped to reduce costs as there were some resources such as flip charts, printer and projector that were available at no cost to the
researcher A research assistant was also available to help with typing responses during the
discussion and printing questionnaires. Three main instruments were used to collect data from
key stakeholders namely, focus group interviews using the NGT techniques, questionnaires and
individual interviews.

The meeting began with self-introductions of both participants and researcher. Then the
researcher communicated the purpose of the study, the role of participants and their
compensation for participation. After this, the NGT (Scott & Deadrick, 1982; Castiglioni, et al.,
2008), was implemented in six steps as follows: The first step of NGT involved participants
independently generating ideas and presenting them in written form. In this step, students, head
teachers and parents received a question paper with three main research questions. After each
question, a reasonable amount of space was provided for the participants to use to write down
their responses (see Appendix 6). The researcher also read aloud each question to the group to
ensure that the questions were well understood. About ten minutes were allocated for each
question. At the bottom of the page, in the question paper of students and parents, there was
additional statement which asked the group members to volunteers themselves participating in
the structured interview by filling the coupon. The coupon asked them either to circle “Yes” if
they were interested in participating in the interview or “No” if they were not.

The second step of the NGT was a round robin discussion. In this step, participants read
aloud their responses to the three questions in turn. The ideas generated were posted on news
print without discussion or comments. Then thorough discussion for each statement took place.
Discussion brought common and clear understanding of each individual statement to the group
members. Members agreed to remove all repetitive ideas and others were merged to get one clear
statement.
After gaining group consensus, the research assistant typed and printed all ideas generated in the previous step. The participants were then presented with this set of ideas and were asked to rank them using a 1 to 5 likert-scale based on what they perceived as the priority. The most important statement/idea received a rank of 5 and the least important received a rank of 1. In the fifth step, the data were processed and analyzed to arrange the statements in the order of importance based on the participants ratings. The sixth step involved provision of feedback to the participants of their most and least favored items (Castiglioni et al., 2008; Scott & Deadrick, 1982) on the leading factors of the growth of and access to private tuition, its advantages and disadvantages in context of Zanzibar.

The ranking step enabled me to statistically analyze the stakeholders’ perceptions on the most and least important factors that influence private tuition from all groups. The questionnaires also captured qualitative information through open-ended questions such as participants’ recommendations on the topic to stakeholders. After group discussion research assistant printed the questionnaires. So that, every participant received a copy of user friendly questionnaire. It has three pages and written in a native simple language to make every participant understand the question effectively. The results from the questionnaire used to probe detailed perceptions in the interview.

I organized structured interviews after nominal group and participants return questionnaires to collect more perceptions about factors, advantages and disadvantages of private tuition. Thus, interview questions are structured to collect pertinent information and triangulate the information to have accurate results.
Data Analysis

Data analysis for this study was done by classifying, comparing, weighing and combining of the raw data from the field work to extract meaning and implications. Marshall and Rossman (2006) refer to this approach to data analysis as analytic procedures. These authors identify organizing and immersion of the data, generating themes, coding, analyze and interpret data then produce report as the major steps in analytic procedures. Similarly, Harrell and Bradley (2009) also mention the same steps as organizing, analyzing and coding the raw data.

The deductive analysis approach applied to analyze qualitative data collected during the individual interviews and Nominal group discussions. The deductive analysis allowed me to collect the perceptions of the key education stakeholders on private tuition and viewed at the responses of the participants by using the same research questions (Harrell & Bradley, 2009). The data collected in the interview sessions and from the focus group discussions were attributively and substantively coded based on the research topics. According to Harrell & Bradley (2009), attribute codes “reflects the respondents or focus group participants and often convey demographic data about individual or group” whereas the substantive codes “reflect the content of the session” (p. 103).

Therefore, data of each group were summarized, analyzed, translated, and then produced the report (Harrell & Bradley, 2009; Simon, 1999). Deductive analysis also applied as was explained by Harrell and Bradley (2009) and Rubin and Rubin (2005) that first is the recognition of the theme, clarify and synthesize ideas, categorizing the variables and describe the results and insert relevant quotations (if necessary) to provide detail information of the topic as stated by
interviewees. The approaches were chosen due to the objectives of the study to identify the advantages, disadvantages and factors drive the growth of private tuition.

Participants during their round table discussions summarized their ideas on the advantages, disadvantages and factors that influence the growth of private tuition into statement that categorized as advantages, disadvantages and factors. Then the statements were tested in the questionnaires through individual rating. The data from the questionnaires then analyzed by computing the frequencies and percentages of the respondents from statements which led to the identification of the most advantages, disadvantages of private tuition and the dominant factors that drive the growth of and accessing private tuition in the Zanzibar society.

I analyzed my data using substantive codes rather than attributive code by coding the main research themes namely factors that influence the growth and accessibility of private tuition, advantages and disadvantages of private tuition in Zanzibar. I describe the study results and insert necessary quotations to provide detail information of the topic as stated by interviewees. I also used Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) software to compute the frequencies and percentages of the respondents for each variable. That also enable me to identify the most and the least dominant factors that influence the growth of and accessing private tuition, advantages and its disadvantages as were rated by the key education stakeholders in the Zanzibar. I applied these methods because they gave me opportunity to describe the results by looking at the common variables generated by three groups of the key education stake holders. I also made comparisons and differentiated the percentage of the respondents. The methods also allowed me to describe the insight ideas of the education stakeholders through interviews.
Table 2: Summary of the approaches for data analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main research questions</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Data collection Method</th>
<th>Source of data</th>
<th>Data analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What do key education stakeholders in Zanzibar perceive to be the advantages of private tuition?</td>
<td>• Perceived advantages</td>
<td>Nominal Group Techniques</td>
<td>• Parents</td>
<td>Bradley and Harrell and Simon approaches practiced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Disadvantages</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Advance Secondary Students</td>
<td>• Summarize data of each focus group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Perceived factors</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Advance Secondary Schools Head teachers</td>
<td>• Analyze the summaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. What do key education stakeholders in Zanzibar perceive to be the disadvantages of private tuition?</td>
<td></td>
<td>Questionnaires</td>
<td>• Parents</td>
<td>• Translate the results and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Perceived factors</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Advance Secondary Schools Head teachers</td>
<td>• Write reports.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Advance Secondary Students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Two MoEVT Senior Education Officer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Two Advance Secondary Schools</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Two Parents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. What do the key education stakeholders perceive to be the factors that influence the growth of and accessing private tuition?</td>
<td></td>
<td>Interviews</td>
<td>• Two MoEVT Senior Education Officer</td>
<td>Deductive analysis applied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Two Advance Secondary Schools</td>
<td>as was explained by Bradley and Harrell and Rubin and Rubin approaches applied, they are:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Two Parents</td>
<td>• Recognition of the theme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Clarify and synthesize ideas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Coding/categorizing the items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Describe results and insert quotations (if necessary) to provide detail information of the topic as stated by interviewees.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
students (two from each school with equal gender representation) were invited to the pilot phase. The aim of this exercise was to measure clarity and feasibility of the questions and NGT if they could generate the intended data for this study. The pilot was also used to test the approximate time needed for NGT. When students did pilot testing by responding to the research questions using NGT (followed the steps explained under the sub title research instruments and data collection methods), I had a frame of the questionnaire which had four main sections. They were: 1) personal characteristics of the participants of each sub group, 2) factors that influence the growth of and accessing private tuition, 3) advantages of private tuition, and 4) disadvantages.

After that pilot testing, the researcher made some changes in the frame work of questionnaire to include another section that will capture the perceptions (recommendations) of the participants on what need to be done that could increase the strength of private tuition and reduce the negative implications to private tuition. Moreover, researchers added fifteen more minutes to make half an hour for the first step of NGT when individually participants generated ideas of the three research questions. Their feedbacks were important for validating the study results. Furthermore, the mixed methods enabled researcher to triangulate data by making comparison and contrast the research results collected in NGT, questionnaires and interviews as well.

In terms of ethical issues, researcher submitted Human Subject Review form to the IRB for approval. Participants were voluntarily involved in the study. All participants received the informed consent form to sign one week before the study took place. They were informed (in written form) their benefits of participating in the study. The parents informed concepts form also developed for the students under eighteen but there were no participants who was under eighteen years of age. Researcher assured the safety and security and all that discussed during the
interviews are autonomously treated in a confidentiality manner. Furthermore, researcher was neutral, active listener and focused to the questions grasping the responses and level of understanding of the topic to the interviewees.
IV. Data analysis and Discussion of the Study Findings

This chapter presents the results of the study collected through nominal group discussion, to survey questionnaires, and interviews with students, parents and senior education officers. The results from the questionnaires were embedded with the findings from the interviews to support the arguments or present different perceptions of the stakeholders. The presentation of the findings is organized into three sections that reflect the three main research questions (see page 28). The first section discusses the perceptions of the participants on the advantages of the private tuition. The second section is a discussion about the disadvantages of private tuition; and the third section discusses the factors that influence the growth of and access to private tuition as perceived by advanced secondary level students, parents, and head teachers. The leading statement/s of each group is identified based on the highly rated using likert scales as “strongly agreed” and “agreed”. Statements that are common (cut across) in all groups are also presented. In addition, interviews with two advanced secondary students, Ali and Mzuri; two senior education officers, Mayukam and Ampane; and two parents, Bwamsa, and Mawazo (all are fictitious names), helped to triangulate the information from the nominal group exercise and the rating activity also presented after results of the likert scale exercise.

Stakeholders Perceptions on the Advantages of Private Tuition

This section identifies and describes the perceptions of the key education stakeholders about the advantages of private tuition. Each group of stakeholders rated a set of eight statements on a five-point agree-disagree scale. The statements had been previously agreed upon by the participants during the nominal group discussion (see page 31). Figure 3, Figure 4 and Figure 5
below that show the ratings on the advantages of private tuition by students, parents and teachers respectively.

For students, the three most important advantages of private tuition are: a) it helps complete syllabus, b) it contributes to increase teachers’ income, and iii) it creates academic competition. Four students (57%) strongly agreed with these three advantages and two students (29%) agreed with the first two statements (see figure 3 below).

![Figure 3: Advantages of private tuition developed and rated by students](image)

Six (86%) students in this capstone study perceived that private tuition helps complete syllabus. It helps them to cover topics of subjects that they did not have opportunity to study during their official school hours. Thus, five (71%) out of seven believe that private tuition prepare them for their exams. Five students (71%) also agreed that they build confidence in their learning when they have access to private tuition. All seven (100%) students who involved in
this small study agreed that private tuition create competitions among learners. Students identified and rated other advantages of private tuition including creation of job opportunities in teaching, it gives students extra opportunity to revise topics that covered during regular class hours, and it increases subject awareness

In the interview with a female student called Mzuri, on why did they (students) perceive that increasing teachers’ income was one among the advantages of private tuition? Her perceptions were as follows:

*When teachers increase their income, they can be happy and concentrate on teaching us effectively, which has impact to our learning achievement. Otherwise, they may quite teaching and find another job that will pay them higher than teaching. We will be losers, because most of the teachers especially mathematics and science teachers who left teaching profession to me were good teachers*

Mzuri also identified that students perceived that private tuition increase subject awareness because in their private tuition classes private tutors give them plenty time to learn, “I mean we learn practical, we feel more comfortable because private tutors engage us in the lesson”. She exemplified that their private tutors listen to their ideas, and when student complaints that s/he does not understand the lesson, tutors change their methods of teaching. “Teachers are so friendly than some formal teachers in the normal classes”.

Mzuri and other six students who participated in this study receive private tuition. They start attending private tuition when they were upper primary level (Grade six and seven). When Mzuri was interviewed on who pay for her private tuition. Mzuri responded that she pays private tuition fees with the money she gets from her “fiancé”. She mentioned that though this man is
her cousin, no one knows their secret relationship. Mzuri explained that she is a good cook as she bakes cakes, biscuits and various kinds of snacks that she sells to her customers who place orders. Neither Mzuri’s parents nor her teachers who have idea about Mzuri’s other source of income than that from her business. She cheats her parents that she pays for her private tuition from her business alone. While the truth is that the man (her fiancé) opened a bank account for Mzuri and he deposits money every month in Mzuri’s account. Mzuri spends this money as private tuition fees.

When Mzuri was asked how much does she pay, she mentioned that she attends three different tuition classes in a week and the modes of payments vary from tuition to another. She clarified that one of her private tutor needs his payment at the beginning of the months and they pay 1,600 Tanzania Shillings is equivalent to 1.3 US Dollar. While other two tuitions that Mzuri attends, teachers ask them to pay 300 about 2 cents of US Dollar per session.

The question for education stakeholders especially to teachers, parents, policy and decision makers and educational planners is that how many students struggling paying to private tuition? Is this not the source for putting students in high risk of social challenges that may impair students in their learning progress?

Other statements as perceived by students as advantages of private tuition are; it creates learning environment where learners compete to each other, it creates job opportunities which parents also perceived this as well (See figure 3 and 4). The quality of learning therefore is called into question. This situation may need further study such as how private tuition influences students’ attitudes, what is the level of education of private tutors, do they have attended teacher training programs and who exactly pay for private tuition of private tutees.
To parents who participated in this small study, all six (100%) perceived that private tuition helps students to complete syllabus on the topics that they could not cover during formal school hours and increases subject awareness. Five of them (83%) perceived that private tuition increases teachers’ income and students’ performance and it helps slow learners to cope in their learning difficulties. Moreover, five parents (83%) agreed that private tuition is helpful tool for students to increase their academic performance. They also consider private tuition contributes to uplift slow learners and low achievers, but not as to the way private tuition would contribute to the completion of syllabus, increasing of subject awareness and increasing teachers’ income. On the other hand, three parents (50%) do not see any private tuition as contributive to increasing good relations as do to seven teachers (88%), who regards private tuition as contributing to strengthen good relationship with their students (Refer figure 5 below).
Both two interviewees with parents Ms. Mawazo and Mr. Bwamsa in their interviews were asked, why do they (parents) perceive that increasing teachers’ income was one among the advantages of private tuition? Mawazo stated that: “Teaching is not an easy task and teachers are not paid well, I guess. Therefore, teachers have to increase their income through private tuition. We pay for private tuition because we need our children to learn more than us”. Bwamsa response on the above question was not much different from Ms. Mawazo. To him, teachers need to receive an extra income as support to their efforts. The extra payment to the teachers is like a motivation to perform their work well. He mentioned that “lawyers, doctors, nurses and others have sources for extra incomes, so teachers also use their education to earn more money”.

But when they were asked if they afford to pay private tuition fees to their children? They responded that even if they cannot, they should find means to pay. Otherwise their children will not have capacity to academically compete with their peers. They also mentioned that they are afraid if their children do not have access to private tuition they may not do well in their studies.

These ideas from parents – Bwamsa and Mawazo - show that parents believe that head teachers have all rights to receive extra payment if they provide private tuition to their students. But do parents have ideas on how teachers teach during official school hours and why formal teachers provide private tuition to their own formal students? It could be parents’ perceptions relates to the findings mentioned by Bray (1999) that parents are indirectly forced to pay for private tuition for their children. This also can be inferred that parents have faith in private tuition for their children doing better in their schooling than depending only on the formal education. Further study in this area is needed.
Figure 5: Advantages of private tuition developed by head teachers

Seven head teachers (88%) value private tuition has an advantage of increasing and strengthening good relationship between learners and their teachers. Five (63%) head teachers regard private tuition as it contributes to active learning among learners. While four (50%) of head teachers agreed that private tuition is seen as contributing to teachers’ income, completion of syllabus and increasing subject awareness to students. Head teachers also perceived that private tuition helps other teachers and learners to identify quality teachers as many students will be attending in his/her private tuition class and perform well in their final exams. The meaning here is that, head teachers recognize those factors as advantages of private tuition but not valued as to the way they value the contribution of private tuition in strengthening good relationship with their students. Based on this statistics, it seems like teachers here regard private tuition not as an important source of income and other factors but as the service to their learners. The question here is, if teachers regard private tuition as a way of showing or building good relations with their students and facilitate active learning and not as an important source of increasing...
their income, will they (teachers) be able to offer private tuition without any form of payments? This question suggests another area for research.

There are three main factors perceived by all three groups of the stakeholders to be the advantages are of the private tuition in Zanzibar. They are increasing subject awareness and understanding of learners; helping learners to complete syllabus and increasing teachers’ income (refer in Figure 6).

**Figure 6: Consensus statements from participants**
This data indicates that, there are two angles or ways at which private tuition is viewed as a source of income, that is, on the consumers (parents and students) side and on the suppliers (private tutors) side. On the consumers (parents and students) side, more than half of them strongly agreed that private tuition generates more income to private tutors. The consumers or clients they perceive that teachers provide private tuition for increasing their financial incomes may be because they (consumers) pay for the service. To the suppliers’ (private tuition tutors) side, they agreed but not strongly agreed as to the parents and students (consumers) who pay for the private tuition.

**Stakeholders’ perceptions on the disadvantages of private tuition**

About twenty one statements were identified as perceived disadvantages of private tuition by three groups of stakeholders. The discussion of this section focuses on the common disadvantages of private tuitions as identified by the participants. Disadvantages of private tuition as perceived by each group are presented in Box 2 in appendix 8. Three disadvantages of private tuition were found to be dominant to all groups of stakeholders. They are students’ lack of time to revise their lessons; deterioration of cultural values, ethics and attitudes of the students (tutees) and increasing gap between rich and poor on accessing quality education services.

**Students lack of time for revision.** This disadvantage was revealed by all students, parents and head teachers in their respective focus group discussion. The study shows that each group of the stakeholders had different perception on whether private tuition can be considered disadvantage on the ground that it makes students to lack time for revision. Four (57%) students for example, disagreed that private tuition affects their time for doing revision while seven head teachers (88%) and all six parents (100%) participated in this small study agreed that private tuition affects students’ time for doing revision of their subjects. The variation on their
perceptions can be interpreted in two strands, one may be students think that if they say that private tuition affects their time for revision and then parents and the government may put a ban on running private tuition to give students time for self-studies (See figure 7 below).

![Lack of time for students to do revision](image)

**Figure 7: Stakeholders’ perception on private tuition as a causative to students’ lack of time to do revision**

**Private tuition deteriorates the cultural value, ethics and attitudes of the students.**

Stakeholders also perceive that private tutors are more concerned on following their tuition fees than learner’s attendance and academic development. Thus stakeholders mentioned that private tutees can be affected by peer pressures and lose their learning goals. Some students misuse their time for being in private tuition classes and engage themselves with bad behaviors like love affairs while still at school which perceived to be a bad culture according to the Zanzibar contexts. This can be seen clearly from the responses given by one of the respondents named
Gentle when was asked his opinion on what is he highly ranked as disadvantage of private tuition and his replies were;

_I really hate the behaviors of some female learners in our private tuition classes. They come to the class as if they are going to attend wedding ceremony, their too much perfumes, make-up and tight dresses confusing learners’ concentration. The most detriment is when their parents drop them to school for private studies, other motor vehicles come and pick them. Then they sometimes come back when we have already end up the class. They wait for their parents to come and pick them to home._

He continued saying “I think they are forced to attend private tuition by their parents. If they know the value of getting good education they could not behave like that”.

This implies that in the private tuition classes there is no follow up of the attendance and learning development of the students. Thus, parents, teachers and students perceived that private tuition contribute to the deterioration of the cultural values, ethics and attitudes of the learners. Besides, head teachers stated that private tutors are more concerned with their income than academic achievement of the tutees (See Box 2 in appendix 8).

Ali also said that “Private tuition weakens the ethical issues of some formal teachers.” For example, some formal teachers who have established their own private tuition classes force their students to join their private tuition classes. If students refuse, teachers create unnecessary conflicts with their students. He mentioned that teachers treat their students who do not attend their private tuition classes as their enemies. They completely forget their roles and responsibilities as teachers. From Gentle’s experience with private tuition, he said the some of the teachers if you don’t go to their private tuition classes they would grade you low in their class.
tests just to punish you and show you that you need to attend his or her private tuition class to achieve higher grade.

It can therefore be interpreted that private tuition in some cases it creates conflicts and misunderstanding between teachers to their students who don’t attend their tuition classes. This observation is also supported by Bray (1999, 2003) and Silova (2010) that formal teachers ask their students to join their private tuition classes after official school hours. They sometime threaten their students with low grade if they turn down. If this situation exists, it means that it will hinder the equity and access to quality education to the students from poor household. It also implies that private tuition reduces the morale of teaching and teaching ethics in their formal classes by treating nicely those who attend private tuition than those who do not (Bray, 1999, 2006; Foondun, 2002; KWOK Lai-Yin, 2004).

Miss Mayukam (senior education officer) perceives that teachers who create conflicts with students are “authoritative, they afraid being challenged thus the reason of creating conflict with their students”. She added that teachers always supposed to be happy, cooperative with their students and not be bothered by the students who attend private tuition, if they are there to make students learn. She continued that some teachers have inferiority complex they are not ready to learn neither from their colleague nor to their students. Teachers must know that they are not the only source of information, this kind of behaviors obvious make Miss Mayukam to perceive that teachers consider their income rather than students’ learning.

Private tuition increases the gap between rich and poor on equal access to education service. Students as direct beneficiaries of private tuition perceived that some of their formal teachers who offer extra tuition do not teach effectively in their formal classes as they do in their
private tuition classes. This disadvantage is also mentioned by parents who are payers of the private tuition.

Figure 8: Private tuition perceived as a contributor to the deterioration of cultural value, ethics and attitudes of the students.

They believe that when formal school teachers are the one who offer private tuition, they may not teach effectively in their formal classrooms. Parents may have perceived this after having discussion with their children about their academic development and teacher’s performance in their schools. Silova (2010) for example, revealed in his study done in Central Asia and Eastern Europe that, private tuition accessed more by the students who estimated their family welfare is higher than those from lower socioeconomic families. This infers negative effects to the national and international educational and developmental goals.

Mr. Ampane (senior education officer) also agreed that private tuition cause some problems to the poor in the access of quality education in an equity manner. He exemplified that
if teachers are not performing well in their classrooms and contact hours are not effectively utilized. On the other side a child from poor family cannot afford to pay for extra tuition due to the high level of poverty exist at the household level. Private tuition is counted to be the source of increasing gap between rich and poor. However, teachers should understand this situation in order to reduce the gap. The Ministry also should equip schools with better teaching and learning facilities and parents through school management committee should have very close relationship with teachers and students as a mechanism to help the sustainability of the development projects in their schools.

Education stakeholders also identified other concerns as disadvantages of private tuition including private tutors sometime do not follow formal syllabus approved for specific level of learners and or sometimes they do but they do not follow the formal syllabus accordingly (refer Box 2 appendix 8). Six teachers (75%) agreed that private tutors do not follow the respective syllabus. They argued that, private tutors do not follow syllabus and they only teach the topics that they master. Topics of the subjects are taught not in sequential order to enable learner grasping and linking knowledge from one topic to the next. Parents also perceived that students in private tuitions, are taught by under or unqualified teachers and thus private tuition classes do not follow standards of teaching and learning techniques as all six teachers agreed on that.

Mr. Ampane interviewed on his perceptions on the issue of private tuition taught by unqualified teachers and they do not follow approved syllabus, he mentioned that education nowadays is a social commodity. That is a commercial which investors attract consumer that they provide good education. He mentioned that Ministry of Education realizes that there are some unofficial institutions that provide private education. He personal know a student's studies in one of the best secondary schools, this student had access to private tuition but their private
tutors did not attend any teaching professional training. Therefore, they just teach students to solve examinations questions without clear understanding of the subject content.

He commented that Ministry decided to change some of the policy and its plan to at least help to solve the problem by improving teaching and learning environment. Ministry therefore, decides to increase contact hours by abolishing double shifts system. This effort may also reduce pupils’ classrooms ratios (overcrowded) and MoEVT plans to measure students’ performance in different ways not only in written exams.

Factors that influence the growth and access to private tuition

During the study, education stakeholders developed several statements as factors that influence the growth of and access to private tuition in Zanzibar. However, my discussion on this section is based on the common and main factors across all of the three groups of stakeholders, that is, the factor that are highly rated by each group. My discussion goes further to the comparisons of the stakeholders’ perceptions on the factors that influence the growth of private tuition as well as the advantages and/or disadvantages of private tuition.

There are three identified common factors namely teachers’ low salary, shortage of qualified teachers and incompletion of syllabus in the required academic calendar.

**Low salary of teachers:** All of the three groups of the stakeholders perceived that teachers’ salaries are very low and thus they establish private tuition as supplements to their income so as to be able to at least meet their basic needs. Five (83%) of the six parents participated in this small study agreed that low salary is important factor for the growth of private tuition in Zanzibar. In relation to the advantages, four parents (67%) also strongly agreed that one among the advantages of private tuition is to increase income of teachers. This can be
interpreted that parents perceived that even though private tuition helps to enhance students’ learning but, on the other hand it is like an investment to teachers as they use private tuition to increase their income.

Teachers in their nominal group discussions also identified that low salary of teachers is one among the other factors that influence the growth of private tuition. But, in individual rating of this factor, only two teachers (25%) strongly agreed that low salary to the teachers is an important factor for the growth of private tuition and five (63%) teachers remained neutral meaning that they may agree or may not agree with this factor. This can be interpreted that majority of teachers were not willing to disclose their exact perceptions on this factor. This situation can be also interpreted that, teachers are either hesitated to agree that they are receiving low salaries and that they operate private tuitions because of low payments or income made basically from the salaries. They want may be want to justify that they provide private tuitions as a service to their students and not as a significant source of their income. They do not want to showing that they are not happy with the payments they receive possibly because of the nature of the many governments in Africa where workers are not very much free to express their opinions at work places.

To the students, data shows that two students (27%) agreed that low salary is an important factor for teachers to offer private tuition but four (57%) of them rated on not important factor. This data may be interpreted that this group of seven students strongly perceived that private tuition increases teachers’ income but they do not agree that teachers conduct private tuition because of the low salaries. This result should be treated with care taking into consideration the fact that students might not be aware of their teachers’ salaries and to students even if teachers may consider what they get as low, to students that may be a lot of
money since they do not work and gain any income. On the other hand, students may consider private tuition as a service offered by their teachers and not because teachers have low salaries.

Interview done with Mr. Ampane to seek his perceptions on teachers’ low salary and if it can be considered as the factor for growth of private tuition in Zanzibar. Mr. Ampane says “low salary moonlights teachers to private tuition”. However, he highlights that it could be a corruption in the education system. If teachers do not teach effectively and then force their students to join their tuition for extra income, is not acceptable”.

**Shortage of qualified teachers:** On average this factor is highly accepted to be a leading factor by all groups of the stakeholders participated in this small study. All seven students (100%) agree that it is the shortage of teachers that influences the growth of private tuition. To parents as well all six (100%) who participated in the study rate that shortage of qualified teachers is an important factor for the increasing demand of private tuition. Teachers on their side, five (63%) agree that shortage of qualified teachers is a factor that perpetuates the growth of private tuition. Although, two (25%) out of eight marked as not important factor.

These figures can be construed that parents require quality education to their children. Thus, they pay for private tuition and make follow up on the education of their children. Parents believe that private tuition helps their children to cover the required topics in the syllabus. To teachers, it can be translated that every teacher perceived the factors of private tuition by looking at his/her school environment. Four teachers (50%) participated in this capstone study for example, extremely agreed that shortage of teachers is an important factor, may be because they have a shortage of qualified teachers in particular subject areas in their schools. They therefore, experienced a good number of their students attend private tuitions. For the two 25% teachers
perceive that shortage of teachers it is not an important factor, it may be interpreted that they have enough qualified teachers at their school who teach effectively during school hours but they organize private tuition to make sure students finish the syllabus within the required time. Or that they provide private tuition just to increase their income and build good academic relationship with their students.

To the students, they agreed that shortage of qualified teachers is the main factor for them to involve in private tuition. All seven students (100%) perceive that shortage of qualified teachers is an important factor for the growth of private tuition especially to the science, maths and language subjects. This means that students who are eligible to sit for national and end grade examinations experienced the problem of shortage of qualified teachers. Thus, the main factor for them is to look for capable teachers in their respective subjects in order to supplement their learning gape and be able to perform better in their final exams.

The same factor used in the interview with the two senior education officers to assess their perceptions on shortage of qualified teachers, they did not directly agreed that shortage of qualified teachers is the direct factors that influence the growth of and access to private tuition. For example, when Mr. Ampane was interviewed, on if the shortage of qualified teachers is the leading factor for the growth of private tuition and why private school students seek for private tuition, he stated that it shortage of qualified teachers could be a contributing factor but not strong factor. To him there are two main factors that increase the demand for private tuition in Zanzibar. The first one is that parents are not satisfied with the quality of education offered to their children in the schools as he was quoted saying “Interesting thing is that even students from the private schools considered to have best and enough teachers are still enrolled in private tuition”. To him the second main factor is high competition to higher education opportunities
which are mostly attained by those who qualified well in the national examinations that is those who passed with divisions one and two. To him, therefore, every parent is investing in private tuition to make sure that their children at the end pass their exams and get good divisions that would enable them to get access to higher education. Another interviewee from the Ministry, Miss Mayukam added that the high pressure for private tuition is more from parents rather than students themselves.

Other factors that were discussed by the stakeholders in their nominal groups were shortage of teaching and learning materials; overcrowded classrooms; parents’ mistrust on the quality of education offered in the formal schools; peer pressures among students; creation of employment opportunities and the like as shown in the figure 9 below.
Figure 9: Factors that perceived to influence the growth of private tuition in Zanzibar

Generally, students and their parents seem to be more concerned on the quality education that they perceived it enable students to excel in their final examinations and to acquire admission to the higher education institutions. Therefore, the shortage of qualified teachers perceived to be leading factor of the growth and access of private tuition. Thirteen (62%) of the study participants (five students, four teachers and four parents) supposed that shortage of qualified teachers is extremely important and five (24%) participants (two students, two parents and 1 head teacher) agreed that it is an important factor. Private tuition is evident to be an investment for teachers to increase their income and thus be able to support them on meeting
their basic needs. This also perceived by all three groups of stakeholders participated in this small study. But the private tuition has also downsides to the learners and the society as well. Participants identified some of the disadvantages including lack of time to the students to revise what they have learn in school and even in their tuition classes. It deteriorates cultural values and increase gap of access and equity to education between rich people who can afford to pay for private tuition and poor who cannot do so.

Limitations of the Study

This study has some limitations that are worth to be noticed such as, shortage of time and as a result not being able to involve as many stakeholders as possible. In addition to that, during the time of data collection, that was July and August, 2011 almost all schools were closed because of the month of Ramadhan. Because of the situation I explained above I did not have opportunity to recruit reasonable number of advanced secondary students, secondary school teachers and parents in the study, thus, the small sample size may affect the generalization of the study results beyond the geographic area of the study.
V. Recommendations and Conclusion

This chapter presents suggestions to improve private tuition so that it become more advantageous to education stakeholders in Zanzibar than it is today. Although study has very small sample size compared to the general population of Zanzibar which is represented in this study by individuals from advanced secondary school teachers, advanced secondary school students, senior education officers and parents though, my recommendations are based on the findings from the field and from some suggestions offered by the participants during the study (see appendix 7 in part V). The following are my recommendations;

Firstly, the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MoEVT) has to equip schools with teaching and learning facilities such as textbooks, computers with internet connections, comfortable desks to the children, electricity, and hygiene facilities like supplying safe water in schools. The availability of education facilities can physically and psychological motivate teachers to plan and teach well in their time on tasks and influence students learning.

Secondly, MoEVT also needs to change policy of teaching approach from teacher centered to learner centered approach and mode of evaluating students’ performance. Instead of using written examinations that influence rote learning, it can use oral, practical or group project approaches as ways or approaches of evaluating students’ performance. Evaluation activities should focus on building students’ capacity on creativity, through thinking and clear understanding of the subject content. This need to go simultaneously with the implementation of students centered approach that may help teachers to engage students in learning and students may have freedom to discuss their ideas from what they have learned. If this approach will be used it will not only help in improving students’ performance but it will also help in reducing the rate of tuition and as a result it may automatically die in Zanzibar. This is because, students has
been found lovely to private tuitions because of the approaches used by the tutors and friendly learning environments and relationship built between the learner and the tutor.

Thirdly, MoEVT has to make the teaching profession valuable by improving teaching and learning environment in all levels of education. It should focus on constructing and furnishing more classrooms and concentrate on schools expansion in order to reduce pupil classroom ratio. This must go together with the hiring qualified teaching force that master content knowledge of subjects. It should also provide different models of ongoing professional development programs either in schools or through teacher centers. This may motivate the existing teachers to sustain their profession. The new and former teachers must be trained on practicing relevant pedagogical skills and active teaching techniques that facilitate and improve students’ learning in their specific subjects.

Also, teachers’ salaries and other teachers’ benefits have to be reviewed and adjusted after a specific period of time, and specific measures should be in place to reward teachers who perform well in their classes and school settings in general for the development of the children (learners). MoEVT should regularly remind teachers on their code of conduct and their roles and responsibilities to the students, community and employer. Also they should be informed on their benefits and privileges if they perform well. These interventions may create positive working competition among teachers and make them aware on what to do and what not to do.

Furthermore, I recommend that, in the establishment of the independent body, it should have full mandates of school inspections in order to improve access, equity and quality of education in Zanzibar. Therefore the body need to foster the adherence to the rules and regulations of teaching, remind teachers on their code of conducts, their roles and responsibilities and propose rewarding system for teachers whose performance are better and those who perform
in a low standards to be assigned to mentors. This may improve teaching and learning process during school hours and reduce the growth of private tuition.

Private tuition centers and providers should be registered and monitored at the district levels. The monitoring of the private tuition is not an easy task as many scholars have mentioned. But under close collaboration between MoEVT, DEOs and parents through their School Management Committees it may be manageable. Parents have to make follow up to their children when they are going to private tuition classes. They need to observe how, what and when their children learn and who teach them. DEOs in their sides, may supervise the private tuition that exists in the school premises. They need to know the schedule of private tuition, who is responsible for the implementation of the private tuition and if the private tuition use the respective curricula to the particular grade. Furthermore, the MoEVT should decentralize the administrative work such as decision making to the District level whereas the District Education Officers (DEOs) and District planning officers may work together to monitor their respective districts with close collaboration to head teachers. Their main tasks may include developing rules and regulation for private tuition in order to control the exploitation may be caused by private tuitions, supporting teachers to improve their teaching methods and be able overcome challenges that they face in their teaching career. The establishment of good working relationship may influence the district government to allocate resource to the schools from the district revenues and monitor the provision of education services within their district.

I lastly recommend further research on the following areas: The relationship between receiving private tuition and student’s performance, why teachers provide private tuition to their own formal students, who receive mostly receive private tuition and who pay for private tuition fees for them and what is going on in the private tuition classes?
Conclusion

From the lessons learned from this small study, I can conclude that, in a low resource contexts like in Zanzibar where there are not enough math and science teachers, poor learning and teaching facilities, overcrowded classrooms or higher student-teacher ratios, and things like that, private tuition is unavoidable in such circumstances. In such circumstances, private tuition helps learners to bridge the gap of what they could not meet in class or what he/she did not understand well from his or her teacher. It helps learners to extend their networks of friendships because they can meet other students from different schools and be able to share materials and knowledge among and between themselves rather than just relying on materials from the same and a single source or teacher.

What I want to emphasize here is that private tuitions are not bad at all, but private tuitions need to be monitored and watched out by the government officials and all key education stakeholders because, if not monitored, teachers may rely on teaching private tuition classes rather than the required normal classrooms and thus not be able to give equal chances to those who cannot pay for the private tuitions, that is, the poor. The questions of equality to the access of private tuition classes and quality of education offered at these centres are very important if not crucial in relation to Zanzibar’s context where the majority are poor and thus not able to pay for private tuition fees. I am insisting on the question of quality and equality because, if private tuitions are considered to be contributing factors to student performance as we have seen in this small study, then those who do not have the chance to attend private tuition will very likely not be able to pass national exams. Thus, the majority of drop outs and failures will be those from poor families. The Zanzibar’s society will thus be made in such a way that the educated will be those from “abled” families and less educated from poor families. My recommendations above
will therefore allow the existence of “socio-economic friendly” private tuitions and not the opposite.


Appendices

Appendix 1: Human Subject Review

Please Print or Type: Mshauri Abdulla Khamis
Principal Investigator: Mshauri Abdulla Khamis
Student: Mshauri A. Khamis
E-Mail Address: mkhamis@educ.umass.edu
Concentration: International Education
Local/Cell Phone: +255 777 422 211
Faculty Sponsor: Gretchen B. Rossman

SPIRE ID#: 26096174

* NOTE: If you are a student you need a faculty sponsor.

Proposed Research Title:
Assessing stakeholders’ perceptions of private tuition in Zanzibar, Tanzania

Please answer the following questions:

1. How will human participants be used?

   Approximately 24 key education stakeholders of Zanzibar (parents, students, and teachers, 6 to 8 subjects from each group) will be interviewed in focus groups using nominal group techniques to discuss their perceptions concerning factors which influence private tutoring; specifically, the advantages and disadvantages of extra tuition which is charged after official school hours and is offered on a fee-for-service basis.

2. How have you ensured that the rights and welfare of the human participants will be adequately protected?

   The study population will voluntarily participate in the study. The information (data) collected will be treated as confidential and anonymous. The participants will be asked to sign an informed consent form if they are willing to participate in the study. The parents/guardians will be asked to sign an informed consent form for their children (students) under eighteen years of age who will take part in the study. Besides, the participants will also be informed that anyone is free to withdraw him/herself without any penalty by doing so.

3. How will you provide information about your research methodology to the participants involved?

   They will be informed about the purpose and procedures of the study and their role as participants of the study before taking part in the interview. Furthermore, brief information about the study will be presented during the group interview.

4. How will you obtain the informed voluntary consent of the human participants or their legal guardians? Please attach a copy of your consent form.

   As I mentioned in section 2, participation in this study will be voluntary. The research subjects and parents/guardians of participants who are under 18 years of age will be
informed of the purpose and procedures of the study and then they will be asked to sign an informed consent form.

5. How will you protect the identity and/or confidentiality of your participants?

All ethical issues will be considered, including voluntary participation, informed consent of the participants, confidentiality, and anonymity. Also the study will be conducted according to guidelines issued by the University of Massachusetts, Amherst. Participants therefore will not be asked to write their name anywhere for this study and their information will be kept confidential. The researcher will also insist that participants do not to repeat the comments made during the interview outside the group either during the study or at some time in the future.

Appendix 2: Informed Consent Forms

A: Informed consent for participating in the study for teachers and parents

You are being requested to participate in a study on understanding stakeholders’ perceptions on the factors influencing private tuition, and about the advantages and disadvantages of private tuition. Private tuition refers to the extra tutoring after official school hours, which is provided by entrepreneurs and individuals for the purpose of making profit. Private tutoring is mushrooming in Zanzibar, although the recent Education Policy highlighted fee-free basic education to be offered to all in Zanzibar. This study, therefore, focuses on understanding various peoples’ perceptions (parents, teachers and students) on this phenomenon.

Your voluntary participation is highly encouraged and appreciated. You are expected to spend about 30 to 45 minutes in a Focus Group Discussion which is a group interview. Please be informed that your participation in this study is kept confidential and your responses will be anonymous. However, the researcher cannot stop research participants from repeating comments made during the FGD outside the group at some time in the future, although requests that you not share comments made with others. You should be also aware that even if you decide to participate, you are free to withdraw at any time without penalty.

If you have any question about the study, please feel free to direct your question to the researcher at +255 777 422 211 or via email mkhamis@educ.umass.edu, or contact the supervisor of the study, Professor Gretchen Rossman, via her email gretchen@educ.umass.edu. If you agree to participate in this study, you are required to sign two copies of this Consent form. Please keep one for your reference. Your refusal to sign means you automatically refuse to participate in this study.

Participant certification:

I have read this Consent form. I am aware that there is an opportunity to ask any question about the study. I agree to participate in this study. By my signature, I confirm that I am above 18 years old and that I have received a copy of this Consent form.

________________________________________                 ______________________
Participant’s Signature                                                    Date
B: Informed consent for participating in the study for students

You are being requested to participate in a study about stakeholders’ perceptions on the advantages and disadvantages of private tuition. Private tuition refers to the extra tutoring after official school hours, which is provided by entrepreneurs and individuals for the purpose of making profit. Private tutoring is mushrooming in Zanzibar although the recent Education Policy highlighted fee-free basic education to be offered to all in Zanzibar. This study therefore, focuses on understanding various groups’ perceptions (parents, teachers and students) on this phenomenon.

Your voluntary participation is highly encouraged and appreciated. To participate in this study, you are expected to spend about 30 to 45 minutes in a Focus Group Discussion which is a group interview. Your participation in this study is completely confidential and your responses will be anonymous. However, the researcher cannot stop research participants from repeating comments made during the FGD outside the group at some time in the future, although requests that you not share comments made with others. Please be informed that if you decide to participate in this study, you will be also free to withdraw at any time without penalty.

If you have any question about the study, please feel free to direct your question to the researcher at +255 777 422 211 or via email mkhamis@educ.umass.edu, or contact her supervisor of the study, Professor Gretchen Rossman, via her email gretchen@educ.umass.edu.

If you agree to participate in this study, you are required to sign two copies of this Consent form. Please keep one for your reference. Your refusal to sign means you automatically refuse to participate in this study.

Participant certification:

I have read this Consent form. I am aware that there is an opportunity to ask any question about the study. I agree to participate in this study. By my signature, I confirm that I am above 18 years old and that I have received a copy of this Consent form.

_________________________________________                 ______________________
Participant’s Signature                                  Date
C: Informed consent for participating in the study for students under eighteen years of age

Dear Parent/Guardian of …………………………

Please be informed that your child is nominated to participate in a study assessing stakeholders’ perceptions on the factors influencing private tutoring, advantages and disadvantages of private tuition. Private tuition refers to the extra tutoring after official school hours, which is provided by entrepreneurs and individuals for the purpose of making profit. Private tutoring is mushrooming in Zanzibar although the recent Education Policy highlighted fee-free basic education to be offered to all in Zanzibar. This study therefore, focuses on understanding various groups’ perceptions (parents, teachers and students) on this phenomenon.

You are requested to allow your child to participate in this study; her/his participation is highly encouraged and appreciated for the success of the project. If you allow her /him to participate in this study, she/he will take about 30 to 45 minutes in a Focus Group Discussion which is a group interview. His/her participation is completely confidential and his/her responses will be anonymous. However, the researcher cannot stop subjects from repeating comments made during the interview outside the group at some time in the future, but she will request that participants not discuss any comments presented during the group interview after discussion session. Please be aware that if you decide to permit your child to participate in this study, you will be also free to withdraw her/him or she/he may withdraw her/himself from the study at any time without penalty.

If you have any question about the study, please feel free to direct your question to the researcher at +255 777 422 211 or via email mkhamis@educ.umass.edu, or contact her supervisor of the study, Professor Gretchen Rossman, via her email gretchen@educ.umass.edu.

If you agree your child to participate in this study, you are required to sign two copies of this Consent form on his/her behalf. Please keep one for your reference. Your refusal to sign means you automatically refuse your child to be involved in this study.

**Parent/guardian consent:**

I have read this Consent form. I am aware that there is an opportunity to ask any question about the study. I am willing to let my child participating in this study. By my signature, I confirm that I sign this informed consent for my son/daughter who is under 18 years old and that I have received a copy of this Consent form.

_________________________________________  ______________________
Parent/guardian’s Signature                                  Date
Appendix 3: Application letter to the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training

Zanzibar

Graduate School of Education,
University of Massachusetts, Amherst

30th July, 2011

The Principal Secretary,
Ministry of Education and Vocational Training,
P. O. Box 394,
Zanzibar, Tanzania.

Subject: Request for permission and support to undertake research study to understand stakeholders’ perceptions on private tuition at secondary level in Zanzibar

The above mentioned topic is concerned

As you are aware, I am currently a Masters student at the Graduate School of Education, University of Massachusetts - Amherst in USA. As part of program requirement, I am required to undertaking a research work to be presented in the form of a Masters Project Paper.

The purpose of this letter is therefore, to request the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MoEVT) to grant me permission to conducting the above mentioned study. The research study involves nominal group discussion with key education stakeholders in Unguja including Secondary school teachers, parents and secondary school students; and then it carries out a questionnaire survey and group interview for teachers and parents, and students respectively. The aims of the study are: First, Understanding stakeholders’ perceptions on the advantages of the private tuition. Second, understand stakeholders’ perceptions on the disadvantages of private tutoring and third, to understand if there is any difference in the students’ academic performance between those who attend in private tuition and those who do not. The findings of this study will be useful for contributing in better understanding of the advantages, disadvantages and its contribution to the academic performance. Such knowledge will contribute in the development plan in the education sector, improve the quality of providing private tutoring and will also help students to understand whether it is a worthwhile or not to devote their time for private tuition classes. A copy for this study will be submitted to the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training once it is completed and approved by the University.

Please find the attached herewith the synopsis of my research proposal

Thanks for your anticipated cooperation and support

Sincerely

……………………………………

Mshauri Abdulla Khamis
Appendix 4: Permission letter from the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training

Zanzibar
Appendix 5:

Figure 2: Scope of the study in Unguja Island
Appendix 6: Questions used in the Focus Group Discussion

The Revolutionary Government of Zanzibar has a policy to offer fee free education in Zanzibar. Despite this policy extra tuition is so flourishing in Zanzibar. As you are among the key education stakeholders in Zanzibar, What do you think could be the leading factors that influence private tuition in Zanzibar? (Please note down at least three factors that you perceive they influence the growth of private tuition.

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

1. It is believed that there are couples of advantages of having private tuition program in Zanzibar. What do you perceive to be the advantages of private tuition in Zanzibar?
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

2. We are aware that everything which has benefits could have its drawbacks as well. What do you perceive to be the disadvantages of having private tutoring in Zanzibar?
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________

Coupon to participate in the interview

After group discussion, I would like to have an interview with two members from your group. The interview will focus more on the statements that we develop during the group discuss to probe more information. If you are willing to be interviewed after group discussion, Please circle “Yes” If you are not interested to participate in the interview please circle “No”. When more than two participants volunteers to participate we can vote to them in order to select two participants.

Thanks for participating in this study.
Appendix 7: Sample of questionnaire

The questionnaire to be filled by Students

The Revolutionary Government of Zanzibar has a policy to offer fee free education in Zanzibar. Despite this policy extra tuition is so flourishing in Zanzibar. As you are among the key education stakeholders in Zanzibar you are kindly requested to contribute in filling this questionnaire honestly and responsibly. You are also assured that the information you provide will be treated with high autonomous and confidentiality.

Part 1

1. Please circle your sex
   1. Female
   2. Male

2. Circle your level of education
   1. Primary
   2. Secondary

3. Please circle the age group that you belong in
   1. Less than 18
   2. 18-22
   3. 23-27

4. Do you attend private tuition
   1. Yes
   2. No
   3. both science and Arts

5. If yes, which subjects do you receive extra tuition
   1. Science
   2. Arts

6. Please indicate the subjects that you receive private tuition in the space given below

______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
Part 2
Please indicate the factors given below which have been identified that influence private tuition in Zanzibar. They are placed in five-point scale: 1= Not at all important to 5= Extremely important. Please indicate your opinion about how important each factor is in influencing private Tuition in Zanzibar by ticking one among the five possible choices in relation to each statement.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Some formal teachers are not clearly understood</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Increase teachers’ income</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Shortage of teacher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Syllabus are not covered</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Popularization on the betterment of tuition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>School Administration do not provide respective supervision to their teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>Teachers do not teach effectively at school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>Shortage of teaching and learning materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>Students’ desires from peer pressures</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.10</td>
<td>Academic year interfered by unnecessary school leaves/vacation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Part 3
8. It is believed that there are many advantages of extra tuition program. Please read each statement below and indicate your agreement on the advantages of private tutoring using the rating scale provide. SD =1 (Strongly Disagree), D =2 (Disagree), N = 3 (Neutral), A = 4 (Agree) and SA = 5 (Strongly Agree).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>SA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>It helps to complete syllabus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Increase subjects awareness and deep understanding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>Provide Job opportunity to unemployed graduate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>Increase teachers' income</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>Students have frequent revision of their studies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>Students build confidence and personality in their studies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>It creates academic competitions between and among learners</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>It provides plenty of time for students preparing for exams</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Part 4
9. It is also believed that everything which has benefits could have its drawbacks as well. Please read each statement below and indicate your agreement on the degree that you perceive as the disadvantages of private tutoring by using the rating scale provide below **SA = 5 (Strongly Agree), A = 4 (Agree), N = 3 (Neutral), D = 2 (Disagree), and SD = 1 (Strongly Disagree)**.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Tutees disrespect their formal teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Students have no plenty of time for doing revisions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Increases households expenditure to education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>It is associated with truants to some tutees</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>Deterioration of the cultural value and ethics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>Causes early pregnancy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>Contributes to students loss of clear purpose of learning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>Discourage learners who are from poor families</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.9</td>
<td>Syllabus not properly followed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Part 5
10. Please give out your two concrete suggestions regarding private tuition?
   •  
   •  

11. What should the education stakeholders do to strengthen benefits and reduce drawbacks of private tutoring in Zanzibar? Please write only one suggestion to each stakeholder identified below.

**Parents/Guardians**
•  

**Teachers/school administration**
•  

**Students**
•  

**Government through Ministry of education and Vocational Training**
•  

Thank you so much for participating in this study, your time is highly appreciated.
Appendix 8: Disadvantages of private tuition as developed by sub-group in the NGT

**Discussions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Students</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>*Tutees disrespect their formal teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Students have no plenty of time for doing revisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Increases households expenditure to education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*It is associated with truants to some tutees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Deterioration of the cultural value, ethics and attitudes of the tutees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Causes early pregnancy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Contributes to students loss of clear purpose of learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Discourage learners from poor families.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Syllabus not properly followed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Formal teachers do not teach as they are supposed to.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Some tutees are showing off instead of exactly studying.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Students affected by peer pressure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*No follow up of students’ attendance and achievements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*It Creates conflicts between public teachers and private tutors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*It consumes student's time due to the long distance to attending extra tuition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Teachers lose loyalty and teaching commitment in their formal classes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Students taught by unqualified teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Students from poor families are limited to access extra tuition.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*It is difficult to maintain cultural ethics of some of the tutees.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Students have no time to revise their studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Tutees get affected by Peer pressures and thus lose their academic plan.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Parents</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>*Teachers lose loyalty and teaching commitment in their formal classes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Students taught by unqualified teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Students from poor families are limited to access extra tuition.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*It is difficult to maintain cultural ethics of some of the tutees.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Students have no time to revise their studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Tutees get affected by Peer pressures and thus lose their academic plan.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Head teachers</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>*Tutees lack enough time to do revisions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Formal syllabus is not taken into considerations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Formal classroom teachers loose respect from their formal students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*It influences truancy during formal school hours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*It contributes in devaluing cultural values, ethics and students' attitudes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Tutors are more concerned with their income than tutees academic performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*It is used as a measurement to recognize quality teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*May course academic confusion among learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*It may also result to students failures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Causes tiredness to the students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Extra tuition classes do not follow standard teaching and learning techniques.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Increases the gaps between the rich - ‘haves’ and the poor -‘have not’s</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 9: Disadvantage of private tuition as rated by Stakeholders

Table 3: Deterioration of the cultural values of the private tutees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondent type</th>
<th>Deterioration of the cultural value and ethics of the tutees</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.0%</td>
<td>.0%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>50.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head teachers</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.0%</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
<td>25.0%</td>
<td>25.0%</td>
<td>37.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>19.0%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4: Increase gape between those who have and who have not among learners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondent type</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>.0%</td>
<td>.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>.0%</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>50.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head teachers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12.5%</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
<td>25.0%</td>
<td>37.5%</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>23.8%</td>
<td>23.8%</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
<td>19.0%</td>
<td>19.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>