

6-16-2008

Case study: Mapping Muslim Neighborhoods

David DiBiase
Penn State University

Francis Harvey
University of Minnesota - Twin Cities

Dawn Wright
Oregon State University

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.umass.edu/esence>

 Part of the [Geographic Information Sciences Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

DiBiase, David; Harvey, Francis; and Wright, Dawn, "Case study: Mapping Muslim Neighborhoods" (2008). *Ethics in Science and Engineering National Clearinghouse*. 284.

Retrieved from <https://scholarworks.umass.edu/esence/284>

This Case Study is brought to you for free and open access by the Science, Technology and Society Initiative at ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. It has been accepted for inclusion in Ethics in Science and Engineering National Clearinghouse by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. For more information, please contact scholarworks@library.umass.edu.



Case study: Mapping Muslim Neighborhoods

Version 0.3 • June 16, 2008

Authors: David DiBiase (Dutton e-Education Institute, Penn State University), Francis Harvey (Department of Geography, University of Minnesota), and Dawn Wright (Department of Geosciences, Oregon State University)

Reviewers: Michael Davis (Center for the Study of Ethics in the Professions, Illinois Institute of Technology), Chuck Huff (Department of Psychology, St. Olaf College), and Matthew Keefer (Division of Educational Psychology, University of Missouri-St. Louis).

This work was supported by National Science Foundation grant # GEO-0734888. See below for terms of use.

Case (for presentation to students)

A GIS Professional employed as associate director of a research laboratory called the Center for Risk and Economic Analysis of Terrorism Events at a private university in southern California receives an inquiry from an officer of the Los Angeles Police Department (LAPD).

The officer, Commander Michael P. Downing, seeks the laboratory's assistance in a "community mapping" project whose purpose is to "lay out the geographic locations of the many different Muslim population groups around Los Angeles," and to "take a deeper look at their history, demographics, language, culture, ethnic breakdown, socio-economic status, and social interactions." The community mapping project is to be one component of a counter-terrorism initiative that aims to "identify communities, within the larger Muslim community, which may be susceptible to violent ideologically-based extremism..." (Downing 2007, p. 7). The associate director invites Downing to send the laboratory a Request for Proposal (RFP).

Soon after the telephone contact, the police officer is invited to Washington DC to explain the LAPD plan to the U.S. Senate Committee on Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs. Committee chairperson Sen. Joseph Lieberman cites it, among other similar projects, as an example of effective local-level counter-terrorism strategy.

News of the Senate Hearing and the LAPD plan is reported by the major media outlets including the New York Times, KNBC Los Angeles, and National Public Radio. Within days, representatives of three local Muslim groups along with the American Civil Liberties Union sent a letter to Commander Downing expressing "grave concerns about efforts by the Los Angeles Police Department ("LAPD") to map Muslim communities in the Los Angeles area as part of its counter-terrorism program." The signatories argued that the community mapping project

...seems to be premised on the faulty notion that Muslims are more likely to commit violent acts than people of other faiths. Singling out individuals for investigation, surveillance, and data-gathering based on their religion constitutes religious profiling that is just as unlawful, ill-advised, and deeply offensive as racial profiling (Natarajan et al 2007, p. 1).

Meanwhile, the LAPD's RFP arrives at the University lab. The well-funded project will involve considerable GIS work, involving support for both student interns and professional staff. The potential project's stated purposes align with the Center's mission, which is to "to improve our Nation's security through the development of advanced models and tools for the evaluation of the risks, costs and consequences of terrorism." However, the associate director worries about the unfavorable publicity and possible legal action that might attend the project, particularly since the University describes itself as "pluralistic, welcoming outstanding men and women of every race, creed and background" in its mission statement.

References

Downing, Michael P. (2007). Statement before the Committee on Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs, United States Senate. Washington DC, October 30. Retrieved 12 June 2008 from

<http://hsgac.senate.gov/public/index.cfm?Fuseaction=Hearings.Detail&HearingID=483590e6-9f4e-4aa6-b595-8ca3791e4acb>

KNBC (2007a) LAPD Plan to Map Muslim Communities Angers Some Groups. 9 November. Retrieved 12 June 2008 from <http://www.knbc.com/news/14551575/detail.html>

Lieberman, Joseph (2007). Opening Statement, Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs Committee Hearing "The Role of Law Enforcement in Countering Violent Islamic Extremism" Washington DC, October 30. Retrieved 12 June 2008 from

<http://hsgac.senate.gov/public/files/103007JILOpen.pdf>

Natarajan, Ranjana, and five others (2007) Letter to Commander Downing, LAPD. Retrieved 12 June 2008 from <http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=16162012>

Resources for teachers

Suggested discussion points

1. Which of the GISCI Rules of Conduct pertain to this case?
2. In what sense does mapping constitute profiling?
3. Using public domain data and software provided by the U.S. Census Bureau at <http://factfinder.census.gov> one can map Percent of Persons of Arab Ancestry in Los Angeles, 2000, by census tract. In what sense does this differ from the community mapping project proposed by the LAPD?
4. Should the associate director submit a proposal to provide mapping services to the LAPD?
5. Do the mission statements of the Center and the University provide conflicting moral guidance?
6. With whom might the associate director discuss the ethical implication of the proposed project?

Relevant GISCI Rule of Conduct

Section IV, Number 3: "We shall allow people to know whether they are included in a database and to see the information listed about themselves. We shall encourage them to correct any inaccurate information about themselves. We shall allow them to remove their inclusion unless prevented by law or a greater societal good."

Epilogue

A week after national news stories broke and the letter of objection was received from Muslim leaders and the ACLU, The LAPD announced that the community mapping component of its counter-terrorism plan had been "shelved" (KNBC 2007b). A day later, Chief of Police William Bratton clarified that the plan to map Muslim neighborhoods had "been scrapped; it hasn't been shelved." Chief Bratton had observed at a police cadet graduation ceremony that "I think what we got hung up on unfortunately was a word – mapping" (KNBC 2007a).

Further resources

Text

KNBC (2007b) LAPD To Propose Alternative to Mapping Muslim Communities. 15 November. Retrieved 12 June 2008 from <http://www.knbc.com/news/14605514/detail.html>

Rossmo, D. Kim (2000) *Geographic Profiling*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.

Digital audio

National Public Radio (2007) Plan to Map L.A.'s Muslims Sparks Outrage. 9 November. Digital audio file heard 12 June 2008 at <http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=16162012>

Terms of use

Authors license this work under the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-Share Alike 3.0 Unported License. To view a copy of this license, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/> or send a letter to Creative Commons, 171 Second Street, Suite 300, San Francisco, California, 94105, USA



DRAFT