

1998

Questioning Solidarity: Migrant Women and their NGO Allies in Europe

Laura Agustin

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.umass.edu/cie_capstones



Part of the [Education Commons](#)

Agustin, Laura, "Questioning Solidarity: Migrant Women and their NGO Allies in Europe" (1998). *Master's Capstone Projects*. 165.
Retrieved from https://scholarworks.umass.edu/cie_capstones/165

This Open Access Capstone is brought to you for free and open access by the Center for International Education at ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. It has been accepted for inclusion in Master's Capstone Projects by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks@UMass Amherst. For more information, please contact scholarworks@library.umass.edu.



Center for International Education
285 Hills House South
University of Massachusetts
Amherst, MA 01003



Questioning Solidarity:

Migrant Women and their NGO Allies in Europe

Master's Project

Laura Agustín

Center for International Education

University of Massachusetts, Amherst

December 1998

Advisor: Sally Habana-Hafner





Questioning Solidarity:
Migrant Women and their NGO Allies in Europe

Our reformers have suddenly made a great discovery--the white slave traffic. The papers are full of these 'unheard-of conditions,' and lawmakers are already planning a new set of laws to check the horror. It is significant that whenever the public mind is to be diverted from a great social wrong, a crusade is inaugurated against indecency, gambling, saloons, etc. And what is the result of such crusades? Gambling is increasing, saloons are doing a lively business through back entrances, prostitution is at its height, and the system of pimps and cadets is but aggravated. How is it that an institution, known almost to every child, should have been discovered so suddenly? How is it that this evil, known to all sociologists, should now be made such an important issue? --Emma Goldman, *The Traffic in Women*, 1917

How indeed? What Emma lamented as old news continues to be revealed in 'shocking exposés' eighty years later. She refers to 'a great social wrong'--prostitution and trafficking--and I wouldn't talk that way, but I share her interest in the ironies and her suspicion that the horror diverts minds from something else. The isolation and victimisation of migrant domestic and sex workers in Europe, women who have travelled far from their Third World homes to get there, had occupied my mind for some time. I had realised, however, that my real questions lie with those who want to help

migrant women. Why don't they help more? Why is education so neglected, why are services so limited? Why do NGO programmes with migrant prostitutes have little meaningful impact, since the failure of their interventions facilitates *more* opportunities to precisely the people the NGOs would like to combat: entrepreneurs that they conceive as 'traffickers in women'. What is this Solidarity they are talking about and what's wrong with it?

The particular field study described in this paper took place in Madrid in the spring and summer of 1998; I chose Spain because there are fewer organised education and assistance projects targeted at prostitutes and I thus expected less proliferation of discourses and an easier time of it for myself. This turned out to be true. With three basic discourses to manage and many opportunities to return to the groups proposing them to see how they played out, I was able to analyse better what had before been background confusion.

My own motivation to understand is not purely theoretical. Having spent much of my life as an educator with poor adult women, largely in Latin America but outside it as well, I have been consciously looking for how to create educational options for migrant women for a few years now. If the summer's research was anthropological, because of my own location in the graduate school of a large public university, then it was also Action Research. My Human Subjects Statement gave all the power away to the women.

I had already long ago identified the NGOs as a problem, in Latin America as well as in Europe. For a while, I thought they were my own personal problem, but I got over that. Too many people in too many places, I found once I left Latin America the last time, were referring to the 'NGO Mafia', to the 'careerists', to the 'bureaucrats'.

The NGOs constitute a particular problem in the world of migrant prostitutes, because so many NGO employees identify themselves as progressive, solidary, feminist, socialist and various other such labels. They do not tend to see themselves as conservative, capitalistic, individualistic or selfish, on the one hand, or even as having a significant stake in maintaining the status quo, on the other. Their position is pre-defined as 'good', though the discourse has changed from Charity to Solidarity (and to Empowerment).

The paper begins with the narration of a specific event that took place in the summer of 1998 in Madrid. This event serves as emblem of a situation in the world of NGO work with migrant prostitutes that I had long observed and that was particularly on my mind that day, that summer. To understand how I arrived at that moment and at the conclusions it has led me to, I review the history of the migration of women to Europe, the kinds of work that await them there and their resulting living conditions. Next I present an array of important--and conflicting--feminist discourses surrounding prostitution, trafficking and imperialism; the influence of these on the NGO world, particularly in projects that affect women, is crucial in Spain as everywhere else. A brief presentation of the principle media discourses on the phenomenon of migrants in

Spain is followed by notes on the voices ‘marginalised’ in a study like the present one, those of clients and traffickers of prostitutes. After an ethnography of three groups working with prostitutes in Madrid, I describe the services they offer and return to the event narrated at the paper’s beginning to analyse its meaning.

Of the solidarity referred to throughout my studies and work experiences I hope to show that the concept is used, like the condom, more as an icon than as a real goal. Its proponents conceive the benefits of solidarity for others, not for or among themselves. Identifying themselves as ‘non’ governmental they assume a stance together against it, but their strong values on the development of the Western self, complete with an array of rights including the right to individual free thought and speech impede cooperation among themselves.

The next part of the paper considers education and other services available to migrant women, with particular emphasis on AIDS outreach and anti-trafficking programmes. My conclusion that new and different techniques are needed with this population is justified through an analysis of the educational/communications styles of NGOs, of facilitators/traffickers and of the women themselves. The specific empowering possibilities of cyberspace are documented and explored, along with questions of access to the Internet and my first proposal in these areas. Finally I briefly allude to suggestions for future proposals with electronic mail and mobile communications units.



Prelude to the Moment

Sometimes you're lucky enough to live a moment that suddenly stands out, as it's happening. Events seem to culminate some process that's been going on in your own mind, whatever those processes are that we still know almost nothing about. For everyone else, the moment is just another of millions, but for you it encapsulates, incarnates, embodies what you've been thinking about. And afterwards you can see the moment drawn out as though it had taken an hour, which it didn't, and you see each character as if outlined in black, and the air dances with energy. That's the nature for me of an otherwise business-as-usual random few minutes in the summer of 1998 in the Casa de Campo in Madrid.

I had been in Madrid already for a couple of months, studying migrant Third World prostitutes and their NGO allies. I had been accompanying one such group on its Monday-night rounds to the Casa de Campo (a huge park with a lot of visible prostitution not far from Madrid's centre). Hetaira, a collective of feminist women, had welcomed my participation in these excursions, which I used as a sort of supplement to my free-lance conversations with prostitutes. I had noted in my journal everything the Hetaira women told me, singly and together, about what they were doing, how they thought about it, how they started in the first place. I saw some of these women as potential friends. None of this changed after The Moment, but my project did. So

clearly did I see the problem between the two groups of women--sex workers and their allies--that the entire focus of my research shifted to the latter.





A Moment in the Casa de Campo

part i:

scene : 3 women from hetaira and i accompanying them arrive as usual at the casa de campo just as sex work is beginning for the night shift. it's about 21.30. paloma is driving her car, aurora and ana are in the back seat. the first stop, as usual, is at the junction where a large number of african women work.

the africans i spoke to (and i was able to speak to them in english, which they already speak, rather in spanish, which they are just learning) during these months were always from one of three countries: sierra leone, nigeria or liberia. these countries don't have the same history, the same ethnic groups or the same languages but outsiders see them all as Africa. the women tend all to dress alike for work, which exaggerates their similarity to outsider eyes which see them as very black, very young, nearly all tall and strongly built.

mamen briz, a journalist for página abierta, a leftist magazine of ex-communists, ex-marxists, activists, feminists, objectors to military service, squatters and other 'alternative' movements, had more than once commented that the african women were 'graciosas', meaning funny, happy and gifted at the same time. it must be great for them to be here in madrid, she had commented, with money, after where they came

from. the africans, it should be noted, work with huge smiles on their faces and are very aggressive in going after business, planting themselves directly in front of cars and otherwise very actively pursuing tricks. (other migrants, for example from latin america, behave differently. they may be practically nude by the side of the road but they wave and wait for customers to approach them.)

i had a couple of times signalled my objection to this monolithic construction of the african women and my feeling that hetaira didn't understand about migrants yet but up to that point i hadn't explained myself. i had told mamen when she asked that it was too big a subject for me to just explain in a few minutes in the car.

this evening, a familiar scene occurs: the first prostitutes come running up to get their sacks of free condoms from the hetaira women, and soon there is a chaotic group of twenty or so people gathered. ana, a hetaira worker, says, at a certain moment, 'No, I've already given to you, we can't give more than one sack to each worker.' The african objects that she hasn't received anything, that she is being confused with someone else and that she wants her fair share. ana, the hetaira member, refuses, a refusal based on long explanations about sharing, solidarity and cooperation. the african woman insists, becomes strident, accuses hetaira of unfairness, and ultimately leans on the front passenger door to impede the car from driving off (since i am still outside the car). ana continues explaining that if they give out more than one sack now then there will be women later in the evening who receive nothing. the woman on the car continues insisting she's never received any condoms.

at one point ana asks to see what the woman has in her purse. the woman opens and many many condoms are revealed, all a different brand from those hetaira is giving out. this doesn't deter ana, though, obviously because she believes the woman arrived, took the condoms, put them somewhere and then returned for more.

when this had happened before, though never with such a degree of conflict, i had quietly commented in ensuing conversations with hetaira members that i didn't think it worth arguing about. they however had pointed out that they genuinely don't have enough for everyone (they get these free condoms from a city programme) but that also they don't want to be duped or considered stupid by the people they are trying to work with. hetaira's full name is collective in defense of prostitutes' rights.

hetaira says that giving out condoms is only an 'entrance', a 'way in' to the women, who, they acknowledge, are buying their own as well as everything else they need to do business. hetaira also acknowledges that at the moment they aren't following up this entrance with much else than offers of information, contacts to other available services. hetaira does not have funds or paid employees. they have done other things in their short history of three years in existence but at the moment not.

the argument gets hotter. i back off from the situation, even cross the street, i'm so uncomfortable. i watch ana, with her unkempt overweight rather 'jolly' white person's look, repeat over and over the arguments of solidarity. i observe the african, with her

white satin lace g-string outfit, braids piled up 30 centimetres high on her head and tribal scarification showing on her breasts, direct her hard gaze out to the large number of other sex workers gathered around.

finally the tension breaks, the others get in the car and swing around to pick me up. everyone is talking at once. we stop almost immediately beside another group of africans and the same scene begins again. when ana begins her explanation of the principles of solidarity and cooperation, i abruptly say to her, 'móntate': 'get in the car'.

in the following conversations which take place while contacts are made with unproblematic other african prostitutes, with spanish drug-addicted prostitutes, with ecuadorian transsexual prostitutes and others, voices diverge. paloma is embarrassed and ready to quit; she doesn't want to fight with anyone and also doesn't want to be taken for an idiot. aurora is confused. ana continues to defend the politics of 'convincing' the women of why they need to show solidarity with each other, believes on the one hand it's the only hope for getting them more rights and better working conditions and on the other hand it's her personal necessity, talking that way is ana's work. she identifies the problem as her lack of english and the women's lack of spanish. when i point out that they don't 'hear' me either if i explain the solidarity position in english, ana appears not to understand.

at one point i say, more to myself than anyone else, 'i'll never give out condoms again.'



part ii:

scene: the day after, in hetaira's office in the red-light district. it's hetaira's last collective meeting before the summer break; some time ago they asked me to come and present my own work on this occasion. hetaira members who weren't there last night and whom i haven't met before are present. i make my planned presentation about the process of women from the third world travelling to europe for sex work, handing around pictures as usual. i introduce obviously different norms from other cultures, seeing this as a chance to widen the discussion i assume they will have had on what happened last night. for example, i show a picture of the mama-sans with whom customers have to do business in a lot of asian sexwork situations, older women who negotiate for younger. this picture gets their attention.

hetaira has been preoccupied with valorising sex work and defending sex workers' rights. avoiding the trap of seeing all prostitutes as victims they are blind to other issues, abuses that take place, particular with migrants. i am familiar with the 'stage' they're at and also with how insulting it sounds to say that someone is only at a 'stage'. i don't say it.

mamen directly asks me to explain what i never wanted to explain in the car: why i think it's wrong to view the africans as happy, juvenile, liberated, having an adventure. she tells the others that this has been a little theme between us and that she now wants to

hear about it. so i talk about what happens to migrants in general--culture shock, disorientation, loneliness, confusion, fear, exclusiveness, etc.--and what happens to less educated, less prepared women migrants in particular.

End of the Moment





What Lies Behind the Moment

I was a servant gal away down in Birmingham. I got tired of workin' and slavin' to make a living, and getting a ____ bad one at that; what o' five pun' a year and yer grub, I'd sooner starve, I would. After a bit I went to Coventry, cut brummagem, as we calls it in those parts, and took up with soldiers as was quartered there. I soon got tired of them. Soldiers is good--soldiers is--to walk with and that, but they don't pay' cos why they ain't got no money; so I says to myself, I'll go to Lunnon and I did. I soon found my level there. --"Swindling Sal," quoted in Judith Walkowitz, *Prostitution and Victorian Society*, 1980

What Swindling Sal lived in England in the nineteenth century poor women from the Third World now live in Fortress Europe. As European Union members harangue about closing borders and the problem of 'trafficking in women', untold thousands of Third World women work in illegal, marginalised and dangerous situations in the European sex and domestic industries, simply trying to find 'their level'. 'Traffickers' and employers alike take easy advantage of women who are liable to deportation if they denounce abuse. The majority of European service providers and policymakers view these women as victims, potential deportees and/or possible carriers of HIV/AIDS, rather than as new immigrants or as active subjects with ideas and agency. The goal of my own research has during the past five years been to provide the rationale,

justification and basis for educational and communications services/programmes both for women considering migration and for migrants abroad seeking to better their conditions (and often continuing to migrate). I have spent significant time on the streets of a number of European cities; the current project reflects the more intensive time spent with NGOs in Holland and Spain.

☞ Why do women leave home?

Labour migrations from the Third World to the First are increasingly female. While Structural Adjustment Policies (SAPs) force all elements of Third World societies to search for sources of hard currency, women are affected more than men (Kirmani and Munyakho 1996) and are thus migrating more. For countries that depend on sex tourism the connection with migrations is established; women who work with tourists become familiar with Europeans and are often invited abroad by clients who become boyfriends, husbands and business associates (Enloe 1989; Truong 1990; Matsui 1987)¹. Most women state, as motive for migrating, their intention to send money to their families and hopes to build a house or start a small business. The market-driven theory is well expressed by Siriporn Skrobanek et al:

In many ways, women are the perfect commodity. Demand exists; the supply follows to those places where demand is highest. Great ingenuity and enterprise are deployed in uniting

customers with their requirements. Much wealth is created. Employment is generated. The fact that objects of this marketing are living, breathing flesh and blood and not articles of manufacture is a matter of indifference to the impersonal mechanisms of the market. --*The Traffic in Women: Human Realities of the International Sex Trade*, 1997.

bell hooks presents the same idea in a different way:

One of the basic differences in perspective between the bourgeois woman and the working class or poor woman is that the latter knows that being discriminated against or exploited because one is female may be painful and dehumanizing, but it may not necessarily be as painful, dehumanizing, or threatening as being without food or shelter, as starvation, as being deathly ill but unable to obtain medical care. --*Feminist Theory from Margin to Center*, 1984.

Migrant women also mention a desire to see the world, to live more exciting lives and to have better clothes, food and general quality of life. Many hope to marry and stay in Europe or to become regular immigrants and bring their families to live with them.

Who goes where in Europe?

The traditional way of viewing migrations as though they were well-worn 'paths' on a map has ended. With Filipinas in Iceland, Dominicans in Turkey, Ghanaians in Italy

¹ In the Dominican Republic, the widespread, entrenched existence of sex tourism has led to widespread tolerance and passive encouragement on the part of varied segments of society, sometimes called a national 'actitud prostituida' (prostituted attitude).

and just about any other combination of origin-destination now found, a map showing paths would be a chaotic criss-cross. As far as Europe goes, despite official protestations that borders are closing, migrants are finding ways in from every point (even if they must soon find a way out, as well). Sietske Altink describes recent events leading to European trafficking from a rivalry between German and Austrian criminals in the 1960s which led losing Austrians to traffic in other countries, through Lebanese that took up trafficking after similarly losing, this time in a civil war. Of the moment's paths she says that in Frankfurt women are mostly from Latin America, that women from Uruguay and Argentina are taken through Germany to be married in Italy and that there is a huge number of Paraguayan women in Germany but not in Holland. She further states, in an ever more dizzying mosaic, that certain groups work almost exclusively with each other: Brazilians and Uruguayans work with Italian pimps, in Germany Italians, Uruguayans and Argentineans work with German pimps and Paraguayans in Germany are married to Italian pimps (Altink 1995).

According to the moment's wars, economic policies, movie and television diffusion of images, stories sent home and sheer migrant fantasy, the media will report that any particular group is suddenly increasing. At this moment, the most publicised 'group' is from Eastern European and ex-Soviet Union countries. Counting, however, is impossible and few have tried it. COIN (Centro de Orientación e Información Integral), a Dominican NGO, has estimated that there are 50,000 Dominican sex workers in

Europe² and AMDE (Asociación de Mujeres Dominicanas en España), mentions 5,000 Dominican women working as domestics in Spain (Gallardo, 1995). Counting a moving, semi-hidden population is difficult, but the Dominican migration is now old enough to lend credence to these figures, which include both legal and illegal migrants³. Methods of citing scattered data vary from country to country, even within Europe with the result that comparing numbers is impossible and also misleading. For example, the International Office on Migrations, with headquarters in Geneva, has said that '23% (412) and 14% (117) of the women with visas to work as dancers in Switzerland were from Dominicana and Brazil, respectively' while German AGISRA (Arbeitsgemeinschaft Gegen Internationale Sexuelle und Rassistische Ausbeutung) has cited '75% of foreign prostitutes in Germany are from Latin America and the Caribbean' (Azize-Vargas 1997). In the past five years, most NGOs working with migrant women in Europe agree, there has been a general increase in Latina presence, and from a greater variety of countries of origin, at the same time that European nations and the European Union has escalated its intention to 'close borders' and focused more attention on deportations of illegal migrants. (Wijers and Lap-Chew 1996.)

Migrations often occur in stages, from the countryside to a big city, from there to a neighbouring country or island, sometimes back home before going on to Europe and sometimes directly to Europe from the countryside. Traditional ideas such as 'family reunification' are inadequate to understand these movements. Sometimes it is the

² Commonly cited data compiled by COIN and published in internal documents.

policies of regulated sexwork locations or specific municipalities that determine migrations⁴ (Kempadoo, 1995; Alexander 1996d); often it is the contacts of the moment's trip-facilitators.

Non-middle class women migrating to Europe from the Third World have few legal options. Acquiring a tourist visa may depend, according to variations of country of origin, country of destination, and bureaucrat of the moment, on demonstrating return tickets, travel itineraries, hotel reservations, names and addresses of friends to be visited, credit cards and spending money. Overstaying a tourist visa, or working while enjoying tourist status, are usually grounds for deportation. Current migrants in any case are travelling in order to work and thus try to obtain working papers at the outset.

What work can they do?

Most Third World migrants have little disposable income and are undereducated, making their journeys and adaptations to foreign conditions arduous and dangerous. They are frequently unprepared for what awaits them in Europe. There are only two work options open to migrant women in Europe, in the domestic and the sex industries;

³ Illegal status arises from partially or completely false documents (work permits, work contracts, visas, identity cards, marriage or adoption papers, etc.)

⁴ An example of the first would be Campo Alegre/Mirage in Curaçao, which allows women to work legally for three months before they leave; they may return after a year (Cavalcanti 1985; Kempadoo 1998); of the second a current example would be Groeningen, a city in northern Holland that currently allows prostitution done by women on tourist visas for a period of three months. These policies are subject to constant change. In the summer of 1997, migrants in Holland learned that the largest area of street prostitution in Paris, the Bois du Boulogne, had been closed to sex workers. Whether true, only

sweatshop employment and home piecework are rarely mentioned though they may--probably do--exist among some Asians.

Domestic service Domestic workers may enjoy legal status based on a real work contract, but difficulties and abuses abound. In Spain, live-in maids are typically isolated in large houses on the edge of large cities, such as in the neighbourhood of Aravaca in Madrid.⁵ The delicacy of living in intimate contact with a family that is not one's own can lead to multiple pressures, including to provide sexual service to family members, for increased pay or not. This aspect of domestic labour is often glossed over in attempts to portray the women who do it as Not Prostitutes—still virtuous, it is implied⁶. Even without sexual coercion, the intimacy of daily life in another family's house can be ambiguous if not painful for the outsider, especially when part of her job is to care for a child not her own. Many of these migrants have left their own children behind in the care of others (Gálvez and Todaro 1985; Anderson 1996). Other problems of domestic labour include isolation, lack of privacy and private space and interminable work-shifts.

momentarily true or false, such news directly affects not only workers in the Bois but workers considering going there.

⁵ The Aravaca literature is extensive in Spain. The phenomenon of Dominican women migrating directly from the poor Southwest to work in Madrid, and the resultant formation of ghettos inside well-off neighbourhoods (Pozuelo is another), with the famous Sunday gathering in the Plaza de Aravaca, has become an emblem of migration and non-assimilation. (AMDE 1993; Gregorio Gil 1996; Herranz Gómez 1997; Oso Casas and Machín 1993; Rivas Niña 1992)

⁶ The position of AMDE, the Asociación de Mujeres Dominicanas en España, stated more than once to me in personal communications.

The salary which appeared so large compared to wages at home looks different once abroad, and it is not uncommon for domestics to engage in paid sex work as a second job, occasionally or regularly. This is another reason to avoid the often-made distinction between domestics and prostitutes in discussions about migrants: an opposition is created between Good and Bad Women which obscures reality and divides women from each other.

Sex work Most of those familiar with migrant sex-worker realities now agree that women know that their work will be in some way sexual. What they don't know are the actual conditions of this work. A prostitute may survive in many countries by servicing one or two clients a day or night, in work that includes drinking, dancing and socialising; alternatively the work may mean 'having a relationship' with a client for a week or more. For this worker, to spend twelve hours daily semi-nude in a window or doorway, servicing up to twenty clients with little or no non-sexual contact may be a grave shock which, however, is a common reality in Northern Europe. Extensive interviews with migrant prostitutes demonstrate a vast range of opinion and misunderstanding before migrating as to what work would include (Altink 1995; Barry 1995; Pheterson 1996).⁷

Jobs in the sex industry range from street prostitution (the most problematic for illegals, because the most visible) through peep shows, escort services, brothels, clubs and

phone-sex operations to window work. Holland's famous windows in red-light districts provide tiny, street-level spaces for women to solicit from; rents in such quarters are currently up to f200 (\$100) a day. To pay this exorbitant amount, women must spend up to twelve hours (or even more) working⁸; to save money, they generally live there as well, yet these rooms rarely provide real cooking or washing facilities. In Spain, many women work in '*clubes de alterne*', brothels where they live and work under constant vigilance. Club women are rotated often--every two weeks, every month, every three months--from place to place by those who control them (involuntary migrations). Many of these work sites lie within large-scale sex-tourism zones (for example in Hamburg, Berlin and Amsterdam). Street prostitution itself, the most visible, ranges from work in domestic, intimate-feeling barrios to highways, parking lots and parks.

Some people consider mail-order brides a form of prostitution. Women sign up with agencies who match them with clients to choose from (some reports say women have no choice); prospective husbands similarly get to choose, and often to try out women before marriage takes place. Sometimes the marriage is only an excuse and the woman

⁷ The commonest question asked about these women is if they 'know' what their work will be. In the same way that a migrant can 'know' that she will face 'winter' but not know how the cold *feels* until she is in it, she will not know what European sex work is until she does it.

⁸ Amounts depend on individual situations. Migrants may charge as little as f50 (\$25) or less for certain acts. At \$25 per act, four are needed to pay the rent only; six to survive; more than eight to be able to save and send money home. In the competitive environment of a red-light district, large amounts of time may be necessary to acquire this number of clients. Alternatively, prices may be lowered and more clients acquired, but then more clients will be needed, and perhaps more time spent. Legal prostitutes often complain that migrants ruin the possibility of setting prices that guarantee a decent wage by undercutting and by offering extra services for free. One source for this kind of information is PIC, the Prostitution Information Centre, in the middle of Amsterdam's red-light district.

is passed/sold on to others either abroad or at home. (Altink 1995; Skrobanek et al 1997)

☞ How do migrant workers live?

The situation of too many Third World migrants seems depressing to outsiders, and working conditions are often described as feudal or semi-slavery. To arrive in Europe at all has probably meant acquiring questionable documents (false identities or false work contracts, or both). In the current atmosphere of 'Fortress Europe', women are liable to quick deportation, even from more liberal Holland. Deportations tend to be invisible and not treated in the press⁹. As illegals or quasi-legals, few protest or denounce overt exploitation for fear of being deported. Even agencies involved in helping true victims of trafficking are frustrated by their inability to offer the help women really want, this being, overwhelmingly, permission to continue working safely (Alexander 1996; Altink 1995; Casas 1989; Polanía Molina 1997; Sanghera 1997; Skrobanek 1998; STV 1996).

Few migrants want to return home before meeting whatever goal they had in migrating. Afraid of police and other authority figures, many women remain in perpetual motion, changing towns and crossing borders as they hear of safer or more lucrative work. They usually don't speak or understand much of the languages around them. Whether working legally or illegally, they are often unaware of their rights in foreign countries.

They have little contact with ordinary citizens except as clients and employers. The majority are not telling family and friends the whole truth about how they live. Anxious to avoid being seen by someone from home, they often shun each other and confide in illegal networks (usually male) to do much of their personal business. Their world can become violent at any moment, and the usual supporting family networks are absent. In the case of domestics, painful isolation inside other people's houses is common.

These migrant workers are not different from others the world over¹⁰. They try to adapt and conform while conserving as much as possible of what is familiar (especially their language), behaviour that often causes misunderstandings with natives. Migrants often experience racism against *themselves* for the first time outside of their own countries (Contreras 1994; Rivas Niña 1997; Younis Hernández 1994). The fact that social agencies send migrants contradictory messages does not help (e.g., 'You have rights as a human being but you are an illegal migrant/prostitute'; 'We pity you as a victimised Third World woman but we fear you carry HIV/AIDS').

These contradictions and circumstances offer ample opportunity to unscrupulous business interests. The owner of a house in the red-light district of Amsterdam may set

⁹ On 22 September 1998, however, when Belgian police suffocated a young Nigerian woman they were forcibly deporting, Semira Adamu, the news was sent around the world by Internet, which helped get it into mainstream newspapers.

¹⁰ People often ask what women feel when planning to migrate. The simple answer is that they are excited and eager at the prospect of travelling, just like anyone else. They view themselves as brave, women who are willing to take great risks in order to better conditions for themselves and their families. In the case of women going to Europe there is the added glamour of destinations such as Paris, Madrid, Amsterdam.

whatever price he likes for rental of a window. Someone offering a ride from Prague¹¹ to Germany and Holland—which will include crossing at least one difficult border—may charge anything they like. In many cases there is overt deception about destinations and work-conditions. Abuse is not limited to women's first migrations but continues as long as they are in Europe. As easy targets of exploitation and violence, migrant women unwillingly contribute to the racism currently threatening European social fabrics.

This population, excluded from nearly every normal social benefit, is supplied by irregular, volunteer, criminal or purely commercial providers. An NGO world provides largely health-related services even while recognising that other services are needed more. Many sympathisers encourage women to dwell on unhappy feelings of victimisation. Thus, despite very generally 'open-minded' attitudes to prostitution in Europe (in contrast very generally to the United States), the conditions of migrant women are not better than in less 'progressive' societies. Contradictory policies now present in Europe are counterproductive to all interests: migrant sex workers are often not stopped at borders, but are more and more dependent on, and under the control of, international criminal organisations.¹²

¹¹ The Czech Republic is a current destination of preference, as it is granting tourist visas to Latin Americans. Asians for a long time needed no visa to enter Germany.

¹² The contradiction is between the aims of AIDS prevention and those of migration prevention (Brussa 1996). Within Europe it is easy to cross borders without checks, especially accompanied by citizens of the EU. For citizens of signatories of the Schengen Agreement, free travel is allowed to another member state (Spain, Italy, Portugal, Belgium, The Netherlands, Luxembourg and Germany). (Narimani et al 1996). The complications are infinite and increase the opportunities for police and immigration agents to exercise inappropriate control.

If migrant prostitutes are ever allowed free time, they rarely leave the ghetto, or, in the case of clubs located on provincial highways, the immediate area (Brussa 1998). While they service many clients, women's nonsexual social contact is severely limited.¹³ For those who work in clubs and brothels, problems generally relate to inappropriate control; for those in the escort business, isolation and violence are frequent. Both groups must pay disproportionate amounts of their earnings to others. Streetwalkers, as everywhere in the world, are most vulnerable to all kinds of vigilance, violence and criminality, but being most visible also receive most outsiders' attention.



¹³ There is a dramatic contrast here between prostitutes' reality and that of tourists who visit red-light districts to feel titillated by the sight of them.



A Highly Feminist Subject

When the subjects are domestic workers and prostitutes, what feminists say is of primary importance. In the West, they have been crying out about these jobs constantly at least since the passage of the Contagious Diseases Acts in Great Britain in 1864, 1866 and 1869, throughout the resultant Repeal Movement (Butler 1896; Pankhurst 1913).

There have always been substantial contradictions among those opposing abuse (Walkowitz 1980), and present-day feminists continue to disagree strenuously among themselves on several important issues. This weighs heavily in the world of NGOS and often impedes cooperation and action.

Many women either at the head or in the background (board of advisors, directors) of NGOs in the Third World and Europe are well-known feminists and some are theorists. Kathleen Barry, a United States abolitionist, heads the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women, which now has advisory status with the United Nations. The Director General of Women for the City of Madrid has forbidden people to speak about prostitution more than once in public forums on the grounds that it is 'stigmatising'.¹⁴ The head of Traprock Peace Center in Greenfield, Massachusetts, censored me from the agenda on International Women's Day in 1997 when she realised I would be talking about sex

¹⁴Various personal communications, among them from Walter Actis of Colectivo Ioé and Fanny Polanía of Fundación Esperanza.

work. To understand what goes on in the world of NGOs, it's therefore important to understand the basic differences among those theorising prostitution and trafficking.

'Radical' feminists on prostitution Self-denominated Radical Feminists, in Europe and the Third World as in the U.S.

. . . find distasteful the idea of promiscuous sex for pleasure. They would argue that sex only for physical pleasure is dehumanizing, for it uses oneself and the other person as merely a sexual object and that it doesn't tap the deeper potential for sex which is to be used as a reciprocal deepening of an intimate knowledge of, connection and commitment to another human.--Anne Ferguson, *Blood at the Root*, 1989: 24.

If sex for pleasure is problematic, sex for money is even worse. These feminists argue that if a woman's body is penetrated by a man in a 'non-loving' sexual act then that woman is abused and that she is alienated from her self (Cavalcanti 1986; Barry 1979, 1995; Miura 1991). To accept this idea one needs to understand and share the assumed definition of self, not a universal notion.¹⁵ One must accept a specific, limited conception of love. One must comprehend a Western humanist view of the individual who makes rational decisions and always 'knows what she wants'.

¹⁵ The definition of 'self' is questionable, and some say non-existent in the same terms outside of Europe and the U.S. Arturo Escobar has said, in various conversations, that he believes the 'self' doesn't exist in Latin America. This has been my experience as well and is signalled by the usual reversion to the English word 'self' when talking of this concept, instead of the 'yo' or 'mi mismo' which might also be used. Barbara Harris writes of the need for feminists to look for new ways to think about sexuality since "In our culture . . . women's bodies are marked out as vulnerable, violable and possessable. . . Young women are said to 'lose' their virginity while prostitutes are seen to 'sell themselves.' This means that women are perceived to have a 'normal' lack of bodily integrity and, thus, bodily autonomy. In our culture and time this 'lack' is akin to a deficiency of selfhood." (1995)

This way of thinking is not at all new.

The cause of sexual disease is the subjection of women. It is due...to the doctrine that woman is sex and beyond that nothing...as the result of this belief the relation between man and woman has centred in the physical. What is more, the relation between man and woman has been that of an owner and his property--of a master and his slave--not the relation of two equals... From that evil has sprung another. The man is not satisfied to be in relation with only one slave; he must be in relation with many. That is to say, sex promiscuity has arisen, and from that has in its turn come disease. --Christabel Pankhurst, *Plain Facts About a Great Evil*, 1913: 30-31.

Such ideas do not allow for sex workers who profess to prefer their work to other options or who go so far as to talk about unionising. Using a marxian term, 'radical' feminists say these prostitutes suffer from 'false consciousness', since no one could possibly want to be alienated from her self. Clients' sex with prostitutes is defined as Rape and sex workers' alienation as Violence. The abolition of prostitution is demanded, or "the creation of means and resources tending to avoid the causes that lead to prostitution" ("*la creación de medidas y recursos tendentes a la evitación de las causas que llevan a la prostitución*") (Miura 1991).

Substantial tension exists between Western feminists who believe their perceptions of sexuality (and, indeed, everything else) to be universally applicable and non-Western/Third World feminists who view the former as colonisers. Kathleen Barry and

others tend to discuss the 'other' kind of woman as always poor, illiterate, oppressed by tradition and destined to live a narrow family-oriented life.

She is not yet a 'whole or developed' person, but instead resembles a minor needing guidance, assistance and help . . . contrasted with the Western woman who is believed to have (or at least has the potential to have) control over her income, body and sexuality: the emancipated, independent, postmodern woman. --Kempadoo 1998:11

Other feminists on sex work/prostitution Another group of feminists defend prostitutes' rights (Delacoste and Alexander 1987; Osborne 1991; MacIntock 1993; Pheterson 1989, 1996). These have sought an empowering vision of prostitutes which allows women to call themselves dancers, entertainers, artists and therapists or to say they accept gifts from friends or any other description. This vision allows the possibility that women could be in control both of the commercial and of the sexual situation during sex work. It accepts that the major motivation to do the work may be economic but allows the possibility that women may prefer prostitution to other available work¹⁶.

In Australia, Canada, Europe and the United States, prostitute activists and spokespeople provide active, audible alternative views of their own lives and work. Some of them travel and give performances (Annie Sprinkle); others write popular-style

¹⁶ A 1982 study female occupations in Thailand shows that housemaids, waitresses, construction labourers, and workers in factories, beauty salons, offices and the service sector earned between 150 baht at the bottom and 1500 baht at the top monthly, while prostitutes earned 10,000 baht plus bonuses (Muroi and Sasaki 1997).

books and newspaper columns (Xaviera Hollander, Dolores French) They have founded sexwork-education projects and unions and held international congresses. On the Internet, sites abound, among them of the Prostitutes' Education Network, the Lifeline Sexwork Project and the Network of Sex Work Projects. The tone of these sites seems to exist on another planet entirely: the voices of these women are strong and self-possessed. They are also sexual. There is overlap, as well, between 'commercial' websites--advertising sexual services--and 'educational', 'political', 'artistic' and 'self-expressive' ones. A sex worker may talk like a feminist and sell services or repudiate feminism while embodying female strength and independence. Everything is possible in these discourses, even high-class British prostitute Helen Buckingham:

I challenged the current supposition that men could have women when they felt like it, with no obligation, and that women enjoyed the sex, enjoyed giving themselves, enjoyed being walked over, enjoyed being used, enjoyed being disposed of. They thought that this is all part of the feminine personality: women are masochistic by nature and they like this. And to meet a woman who said, 'No, I'm not like that and I don't like it, but this is a bloody good way to earn a living' was terribly, terribly threatening. --Helen Buckingham, *The Girl in Scarlet Heels*, 1993, quoted in Scambler & Scambler 1997.

Some sexworker activists have moved to alliances with gay men and away from feminists, who continue to see them as victims (Overs 1994).

Many writers have shown that prostitution is not a single category with a single definition but a 'continuum' in many African and Asian countries (Tabet 1989; White

1990; Anarfi 1998; Oppermann 1998), which multiplies greatly the possibilities for interpretation and misinterpretation of migrant women in Europe. Prostitutes may consider themselves more city guides, translators, interpreters of local culture and prospective wives as well as dancers, artists, therapists and so on, which some will call resistance (Pile and Keith 1997). A growing literature demonstrates alternative constructions of the job or situation of prostitution, ranging from those of housewives who are 'making ends meet' and supplementing family incomes reduced by unemployment to those of Asian children who say they 'go out for fun with foreigners', 'catch foreigners' and 'have guests'. These constructions emphasise that workers are supporting families and being loyal and loving to their children or parents.

Montgomery points out forcing people to accept the title prostitute is

to deny the skillful way that they use what very small amount of control that they have. The search for victims of child abuse sometimes obscures the acknowledgement of children's agency. Neither prostitution nor sexuality is the focus of their identity, which is bound up in status, prestige and hierarchy. 1998:146-7

The continuum concept is not unique to Third World cultures, however. One example that surfaces over and over in the literature of the West concerns relations between women on shore and sailors. From the docks of Liverpool, UK, to the shores of New Zealand, women have long had serial relationships with sailors as their boats come in. It is always said that sailors "have a girl in every port", but many girls have a boy on every boat, as well (Hanson 1997; Walkowitz 1980).

Incredibly basic to these deconstructions of ‘prostitution’ as though it were one ‘thing’ are poststructuralist concepts of multiple, ambivalent, unfixed identities. If we subscribe to these concepts we don’t *have* to decide which is anyone’s ‘real’ or correct identity, and this is a frank relief when negotiating the word-battles of many feminists writing on prostitution/sex work. Writing on bar sex in the Philippines, Law proposes that

Within the language of advocacy, prostitute identity is metaphorically fixed within a rich-Western-male/poor-Filipina-female dichotomy, ultimately conveying a powerful subject/disempowered other. While this representation plays an important role in highlighting the economic, political and social bases of inequality, it simultaneously reinforces the hegemonically constructed identities of the ‘oppressor’ and the ‘victim’ through naturalising them as fixed identities and subject positions. In so doing, it offers little room to manoeuvre, to negotiate identity or to resist the complex power relations constructed at points where class, race and gender intersect. (1997:107)

‘Radical’ feminists on trafficking According to the dominant feminist discourse, anyone who assists women to migrate to work in prostitution may be called a ‘trafficker’ (Coalition Against Trafficking in Women 1991; Barry 1995). Trafficking abuses can include deceiving women about the nature of work offered; coercing the signing of papers that can’t be read or understood; taking personal documents away from their owners; charging too much for tickets, changing peoples’ destinations without consulting them; requiring repayment of loans through work (debt-bondage);

deducting exorbitant sums for rent, food or clothes; denying time off; requiring more than twelve hours of work a day; refusing to allow access to health care; enforcing abortions; prohibiting workers' freedom to choose or refuse clients and acts performed and to require use of condoms; withholding pay; confiscating personal belongings; providing inadequate food and sleeping arrangements; prohibiting communication with the outside world; bribing authorities who might protect workers; threatening workers or their families; isolating workers; locking workers in against their will.

The fact that many women have sought out traffickers is dismissed as male victimisation of women. Some take the position that a woman's original freely-made agreement to migrate for prostitution may be cancelled if she is subsequently deceived or exploited (Skrobanek et al 1997:42).

At first we didn't want to recognise the problem of traffic in women. If prostitution is labour, why shouldn't labour agencies be legal? But when we heard stories about women being beaten up and dying from asphyxiation in the containers they were smuggled in, we changed our point of view. --Helga from Hydra, a German women's group, quoted in S. Altink 1995: 33.

Other feminists on trafficking The terms traffic and trafficking are disputed by those conceding migrants agency in their choice to migrate to do sex work (Alexander 1996; Stichting Tegen Vrouwenhandel 1996; Sanghera 1997; Doezema 1998). This view focuses on women's overwhelming desire to migrate and points out that those who help women to travel and find work include family members, concerned friends and lovers,

tourists and embassy employees, as well as mafiosi and other criminal networks.

Proponents of this view distinguish between actions that generally facilitate women's migrations and abuses perpetrated against them. They would agree that the list above are abuses. They would call the following services that generally *facilitate* migration: advertising and offering work abroad, selling travel tickets, preparing documents both false and true, arranging guide services, explaining how to handle immigration interviews, loaning 'show money' and helping women in a variety of ways to settle and find their way in new places.

Feminist positions on imperialism and the exotic Many blame Structural Adjustment Policies, or financial imperialism, for sex tourism. According to this view,

These deep-rooted economic problems are the inevitable product of large-scale breakdowns in societies due to overpopulation, the erosion of basic infrastructures of clean water, functioning sewage and sanitation systems, and a working health care system--all mandated by the loan policies of the IMF. When a society stops being sustainable, people start to leave. This increases the number of people available for trafficking and results in widespread indentured servitude, sexual exploitation, and sexual slavery. --Brock and Thistlewaite 1996:123

For a long time many have put responsibility on the U.S. and other military establishments for the growth of sex tourism in various Asian sites, based on the institution of Rest & Recreation leaves in cities like Bangkok granted to soldiers on duty in war zones (and intended to pacify them) (Enloe 1989; Truong 1990; Sturdevant and Stolzhus 1993). There is much truth in this, and, obviously, huge numbers of sex

tourists are from First World countries, including Japan (Muroi and Sasaki 1997; Matsui 1987). Many sex tourists are also from the Middle East, however, including Fundamentalist Islamic countries (also major destinations for migrant domestic workers). Colonisation takes on different shades of meaning when brown men hire brown sex workers from other cultures.

Many writers refer to clients' desires for exotic women as explanation of the growing presence of Asian, Latina and African women working in sex outside their own countries (Brock and Thistlewaite 1996; Enloe 1989; Truong 1990). A Rosie Reizen travel advertisement aimed at German men going to Thailand could apply to their dreams of meeting Thai women in Germany:

Men will live like kings in Bangkok...with the most beautiful women of the east at their side. And their future Thai partners are not especially particular, so that no European need fear going to Bangkok for nothing. The man who has difficulty in establishing relationships here...in Bangkok can choose among hundreds of young women who for a tiny amount will make him feel like a great Don Juan. --ISIS 1979:9.

But many people close to sexwork zones think that clients looking to purchase sex consider multiple factors, and price is a major one, and lower prices are most often found among recently arrived foreigners. Moreover, clients in Holland, for example, have the choice of 'exotic' phenotypes among their own compatriots: Dutch women of Surinamese or Indonesian descent.

At other historical periods and places, exoticism resided in other phenotypes, as when white European women, perhaps especially Jewish women, travelled to work in Buenos Aires (Goldar 1971)¹⁷. The Japanese use of ‘comfort women’ from neighbouring countries such as Korea is well known (Lie 1995). For that matter, white Eastern Europeans are travelling to work as prostitutes in many parts of the world at this moment and Asian, African and Arab men put a high premium on Euramerican women (Hanson 1997).

Since many of the clients of Third World sex workers are Third World men, at home or abroad, all blame cannot be laid with a racist, imperialistic North. Those who argue that Third World men’s desires and customs have been distorted by the First World’s invasions are turning a blind eye to men’s ‘traditional’ or ‘indigenous’ relations with women nearly everywhere.¹⁸ Indian courtesans are said too have enjoyed “liberty and dignity” before being deprived of their rights by British-imposed laws intended to “fight prostitution” (Chatterjee 1992). Few studies have been done with and about clients of

¹⁷ “Es notable la enorme cantidad de prostitutas de ascendencia judía. ¿Por qué se prefería la extranjera? ...las meretrices importadas—rusas, polacas, húngaras, turcas, alemanas, luego las solicitadas francesas—que se introducían en el país desde 1885, eran las mas aptas porque se las consideraba ‘veteranas prácticas en el oficio’, acostumbradas—las turcas por ejemplo—al sistema de canje de una mujer por dinero u otro objeto. Venían en calidad de ‘esclavas blancas’, sometidas a la voluntad del caftén o mercader de carne humana. A diferencia de la prostituta criolla, tenían según los criminólogos ‘una psicología distinta’, por más que existiera una logia afinidad de ideas y sentimientos derivada de la semejanza profesional. Eusebio Gómez descubre en la criolla ‘rasgos de nobleza, que la otra parece ser incapaz de tener. La pasión por el amor verdadero (obsesionante en algunos casos) se presenta desprovista de esa fiebre de acumular dinero que caracteriza a la meretriz importada, y que se justifica perfectamente si se recuerda que su aspiración mayor es la de volver a su suelo natal para vivir allí una vida de descanso y de relativa honestidad’.”--Ernesto Goldar, *La mala vida*.

¹⁸ “Nopkesorn (1993) estimated that roughly three quarters of northern Thai men had at least one sexual experience with a prostitute; Shallat cites 4-6 million Thai men going to prostitutes at least once a month. McCaghy and Hou (1983) estimated that 42% of the Taipei male population had during their lifetime

prostitutes (except to explore condom behaviour), but a few ethnographies provide alternative glimpses to the monopolising view (Allison 1994; Murray 1991; Montgomery 1998).

Japanese and other Asian feminists have run public-awareness campaigns to raise consciousness that a problem exists: prostitution, trafficking, sex tourism. These campaigns, which may use television, radio and print media as well as physical demonstrations, “have challenged traditional marriage practices and religious beliefs, denounced sexist and racist airline advertisements and beauty contests, and organized demonstrations against tourist agencies, airlines and governments which promote sex tourism” (Lee 1991:93). The most well-known of these campaigns occurred when women met airplanes full of sex tourists in the Philippines, Thailand, Korea and Japan and organised protests everywhere Prime Minister Suzuki of Japan got off an airplane in his regional tour of 1981 (Matsui 1987; Muroi and Sasaki 1997).

This brief summary of varying and conflicting feminist positions on sex work applies to Spain as well.

The Media Contribution

visited a prostitute at least once, 82% . . . more than on occasion.” (Atchison et al 1997) Brothels in India operate openly 24 hours a day, 7 days a week (Nigam 1993).

News articles from recent years in the mainstream Spanish press reveal figures such as a million men visiting prostitutes daily (Hernández Velasco 1996). Opinion pieces by women generally treat this evident need as perverse and ask why 'normal' relations with women aren't enough (Casanova 1997). Spanish culture in general tolerates men having multiple relations, apart from any use of prostitutes, but this is rarely acknowledged. In another general cultural development of recent years, young Spaniards marry less and have children less than before; Spain with Italy is a country of almost negative population growth.

A *New York Times* article from 9 July 1997 was distributed widely on the Internet. Entitled "Exotic Imports Have Captured Italy's Sex Market", the article reported the presence of different nationality groups working in 'shifts' on 'commuter roads' outside Rome. Ghanaians, Albanians, Nigerians, Romanians, 'South Americans' and 'sub-Saharan' are mentioned; crime-experts and politicians are quoted. In *El País* of Madrid, on 9 August 1998, a similar article was published, "Jaque al comprador de sexo", this time in reaction to a new Swedish law that would penalise clients of prostitutes. Again, prostitutes cited and interviewed were available and visible on the streets.

Reporters of both situations, having easy access only to these sex workers, report what they find as though it is true for what can be called, in a huge generalisation, the Sex Industry. This peculiarity is emblematic of what was found in the course of the present study: When prostitution is addressed by outsiders, even by allies and rights advocates,

it is addressed in its 'visible' form: street prostitutes. The entire rest of the industry is ignored.

The Spanish media pay a lot of attention to migrants, in a way. With great regularity they publish stories of boat- or truckloads of migrants found (dead or alive) (Gómez Font: 1994; Ordaz 1998). They announce the breaking of 'trafficking rings' so often that the opposite message is understood: trafficking rings are unbreakable. They keep us up to date on wall-, fence- and tower-building at frontiers, to detect illegal crossings (Fuertes 1998). Occasionally they tell the tragic story of one migrant's experience and desire to go home (Barroso 1998). In a more jocular tone, they sometimes go out to ask prostitutes how they are doing, publishing always the same photo of a woman leaning into a car to negotiate with a client. There are never images or stories about migrant prostitutes at home, with their families or children, going to the grocery or engaging in any other 'normal' activity.

Stories about Cuban women seem to reside in a different category, one that connects Spanish men with them via their business-and-pleasure trips to the island. Many are the images of beaches and nightclubs full of young Cuban women doing sex work and old Spanish men getting involved with them. Some stories combine salaciousness and indignation: 'Sex tourism is awful, look at it!' they seem to say (Vicent 1998).

Cubans are the most beloved Latin Americans in Spain, Dominicans the least.

Although both islands are nowadays poor, largely black and mulato, as well as Spanish-

speaking, chances of history in the Caribbean have carried the governments of these two islands in different directions. While many Spanish will incline to view a Cuban woman, and even a Cuban prostitute, with compassion, as a victim--and as someone who needs saving--they will tend to look at a Dominican woman, even one who is not a prostitute, with condescension. Many Spanish families have members in Cuba, and many business interests have remained vibrant between Spain and Cuba since 1898, when the United States took over the island. This means there is a mitigating factor to the Spaniard's normal, conventional racism when it comes to dark Cubans: They are seen as Part of the Family. Solidarity with Cuba is a point of honour and pride with many Spaniards, while few would think of being solidary with Dominicana¹⁹. The difference is government and political location: Cuba's heroic and unique revolution is seen as being ruined by U.S. imperialism (the trade embargo) while Dominicana is seen as just another impossible-to-govern latin country, a banana republic. Stories about Cuba, both news and features, are daily fare in the media, while Dominicana rarely is mentioned.

✂ 'Unheard Voices': Clients and Traffickers

Free sex isn't really free. In order to get a woman to have free sex with you, you have to find someone who is attracted to you and wants to have sex with you. For most of us, this takes a lot of work. . . If you start a relationship, you run into one of the biggest

¹⁹ On political grounds, that is. Dominican children are among those often shown as victims of hunger, misery and hurricanes in fund-raising for NGO programmes.

problems with free sex: You both have to want it at the same time. You can't just get it when you want it. -- Marc Perkel, *How to Use an Escort Service, A Men's Guide*, 1997.

25 March 1763 . . . As I was coming home this night, I felt carnal inclinations raging through my frame. I determined to gratify them. I went to St. James Park and picked up a whore. For the first time did I engage in armour (a condom), which I found but a dull satisfaction. She who submitted to my lusty embraces was a young Shropshire girl, only 17, very well-looking, her name Elizabeth Parker. Poor being, she has a sad time of it!--James Boswell, *London Journal*, 1762-1763

Analysis of clients' and traffickers' talk lies outside the present work. Suffice it to say that there must be as many levels, subtleties, differences, confusions and contradictions here as on the 'other' side, and that I believe future work lies here. Obviously, there would be no 'problem' of migrant prostitutes, their safety and education, if there were no market for their labour. Questions of sexuality and male-female relations, from childhood and adolescent play through marriage and parenthood to male friendships and machismo need to be looked at with clearer eyes than has usually happened up to now.²⁰ Recent sociological and anthropological studies of sex tourism and prostitution lack the tension always evident in feminist publications on these subjects (Oppermann 1998).²¹

Outside sexwork venues, it's hard to get a man to admit he goes to prostitutes. Since clients' talk is supposed to be 'bad' or 'naughty', it doesn't usually get disseminated,

²⁰ Anne Allison's 1994 *Nightwork: sexuality, Pleasure and Corporate Masculinity in a Tokyo Hostess Club* (1994) is a model study in this regard.

published or heard in the press or other media. Many Internet websites provide glimpses of uncensored clients' talk (the *World Sex Guide* and *How to Use Escort Services*), and a few studies have addressed men's desires, often in order to understand why and when they refuse to use condoms (Atchison et al 1997; de Graaf 1995). Traffickers' talk, considered 'criminal', is also hard to hear²² but can be found on the WorldWideWeb in the form of madams, escort services, mail-order bride agencies and other sex entrepreneurs.²³

Consider the voice of *The Economist*, what shall we call that, the voice of the market?

The downmarket end of the industry, be it run-of-the-mill pronography or street prostitution, is a buyers' market, where prices are ratcheted downwards and only the cheapest supplier survives. A lorry driver going from Prague to Berlin sees hundreds if not thousands of prostitutes lining the E55 highway . . . The cheapest, typically Gypsies or Ukrainians, charge a pitiful \$10, or less.

Where does this leave the entrepreneur? For the ruthless ones, the road to riches is clear and brutal: cut costs by treating your workers abominably. Women and girls can be enticed (or kidnapped) from poor countries, smuggled into rich ones and worked as sex slaves. If they complain, they are warned, not only they but their families back home will suffer. . . There is still plenty of money to be made in this line of business. But in the longer term the future of cut-price prostitution looks bleak. Bruised, terrorised prostitutes in ugly surroundings attract only the least choosy, and worst-paying, customers.--14 February 1998.

²¹ The tension, of course, is the reason the subject is worth more study (and may be the reason for the phenomena of prostitution and sex tourism in the first place).

²² Gillian Caldwell of the Global Survival Network made a video of traffickers' talk (with a hidden camera) by posing as one herself, along with a colleague, and traveling to Russia to make deals.

The market voice, of course, doesn't understand the complexities and profundities of individual desire. Why else would a handsome white man in an expensive suit drive out of his way from Wall Street (in his Mercedes Benz equipped with baby seat, now empty) to an underpass in Upper Manhattan where he can have sex with a street hooker with tracks and sores on her arms?



²³ The voices sometimes filter through, as in this editorial about sex tourism in Havana: “. . . Noy hay que insistir en el espectáculo deprimente de las sucesivas levas de turistas en el aeropuerto vociferando sus récords genitales a los nuevos batallones que llegan en el siguiente avión.” (Vicent 1998)



My Life in Madrid: April-September 1998²⁴

My previous educational work, needs-assessment and ethnographies had happened with Latin American migrants, particularly in Dominicana, New York and Amsterdam. It was important for me to assess the Spanish situation, since at least one Latin American women's migration has been important in Spain for some years. Several people have studied the situation of Dominican domestic workers in Spain without however recognising that the same women often have a second job in prostitution or move into the sex industry from the domestic (Gallardo 1995; Gregorio Gil 1996a; Herranz Gómez 1997). I found that the anthropological point of view and the consciousness of doing ethnography as well as action research enabled my political and educational work substantially, and I would not now separate them from each other. The research aimed to assess education, service and communications needs of migrant women in Madrid²⁵.

Spain is at the other end of the spectrum from Holland, which I knew well. I was already interested in the world of the NGOs, in the discourses of solidarity. I knew it wouldn't be too big in Spain, and that it was a good chance to see into the development

²⁴ The more specific, ethnographic material presented here principally concerns Spain. Comparisons are occasionally made with Holland, the second country of research. In general, observations could apply to either country and to most others in Europe.

²⁵ I have deliberately conflated concepts of education, service and communication. Popular education believes that education is two-way; the learner learns by communicating his or her own experiences, thoughts and feelings. For marginalised people who are made invisible and mute by the dominant

of discourse which is already advanced (and has proliferated) in Holland. Spain has fewer social and educational programmes, with less experience over time, with migrant women than many other European countries. Spain has historically been a sending nation of migrants, but recently this has changed. While numbers of migrants into Spain still doesn't compare with those of long-time receiving countries like France or England, they have rapidly increased in recent years, provoking social upheaval. Migrants to Spain come particularly from Morocco, its close neighbour, and from Latin America, but also from many other African countries and from Eastern Europe.

In the case of migrant prostitutes, being in Spain may or may not be a more than fleeting condition. A woman who first migrates to Spain may later move to Holland or New York, or vice-versa. But there is no doubt that Madrid and other Spanish locations are among the standard destinations of women who migrate, both voluntarily and forcibly. For this reason, it was important to assess the educational situation here. I originally proposed to do action research, and, when possible, participatory action research. What I did combined various techniques, according to the possibilities of the moment. Sometimes the women were suggesting what direction I should take and I agreed with them; sometimes they suggested and I didn't agree. I won't call what I did PAR, especially since the World Bank now says that it does it. But the research was certainly open, collaborative, flexible, overdetermined. I didn't have a questionnaire and I let

society, the communication side of their education is as important as the side where they will 'receive' traditional kinds of education.

migrants and NGO workers guide the conversations. I shared my ideas with them on the subjects of education and communications.

But what I mostly did was talk about prostitution. This charged subject lay at the back of every conversation, whether the topic was ostensibly education, migration or health services. Whether people have direct experience or not of the subject, everyone has opinions. And although many like to think of Spain as 'Catholic' and therefore repressive about sex, many others are familiar with the instantaneous wild abandon with which Franco's puritanical censorship died when he did.²⁶

In Spain, where marriage and birth rates are both falling, mixed couples are beginning to be noticeable, particularly in popular barrios like Lavapiés, in Madrid. In the current stage of Spain's war between the sexes--with feminism, bullfighting and membership in the European Union all playing parts--many people point to the increase of marriages

²⁶ From a conversation between two Barcelona men in *La rosa de Alejandría*, by Manuel Vázquez Montalbán: "La prostitucion es una traducción exacta de esta sociedad. Estamos en pleno juego entre reconversión y sumergimiento. Reconversión industrial, economía sumergida. Pues bien, si clasificamos las putas presentes en el mercado se entera Ud de mas sociología que si se matricula en un curso en la U Aut... Para empezar: la puta tradicional de calle o bar de barrio putero, especie en decadencia biologica revitalizada ahora con sangre nueva de la generación del paro, la menos ilustrada y por lo tanto sofisticada para buscar niveles de puterío mejor cotizados. No obstante si se busca bien se encuentran auténticas gangas a precios increíbles, especialmente por la parte baja de las Ramblas o en el cruce de Hospital o Porta Ferrissa con las Ramblas. Luego estan especies tradicionales, que apenas han variado, como la puta de barra de cafetería cuyo origen historico hay que buscarlo en la carretera de Sarria, pero que esta sufriendo la competencia de la puta telefónica, ofrecida por las secciones de relax y contactos de La Vanguardi o de El Periodico. Ha leído Ud la literatura que respalda esa oferta? No se la pierda. A continuación la puta supuestamente ocasional ofrecida por alcahuetas, en clandestinidad, no vaya a enterarse el marido, porque están pasando una época difícil, el paro, ya se sabe, o porque las putea la droga o una secta religiosa, que de todo hay. Sería muy largo de contar, pero yo me inclino por las llamadas putas de relax, ofrecidas como masajistas, pero asegurese Ud bien antes de ir, porque no todo el mundo entiende la cosa igual. Lo mejor es ir a establecimientos con una cierta tradición en los que te hacen un completo clásico, desde la sauna hasta el polvo sin límites, pasando por un masaje bien hecho,

between Spaniards and latinos. Paloma, of Colectivo Hetaira, explained it to me: 'Spanish men are incapable of being affectionate. Spanish women are finding warm, caring men in Cubans.' When I asked Pablo, a barman who doesn't like feminists like Paloma, to explain the same phenomenon he said: 'Spanish women are cold and dominating. Spanish men are finding warm, caring women in Cubans.' No one seems to ask whether self-interest could ever play a part in the 'warmth' found in economically vulnerable people when they come into contact with those more secure than they. Which is not to say there are no cultural truths in the story about latino affectionateness; it's simply incomplete.

Apart from Cubans, who are treated more as family members, Dominicans were until recently the most numerous latino group in Spain; now Peruvian numbers have perhaps overtaken Dominican (Tornos et al 1997). In street prostitution, transsexual women from Ecuador stand out.²⁷ In club prostitution, there are many Colombians. No one knows how many of any of these nationalities there really are, since counting illegal workers is difficult and itinerant ones practically impossible. Nearly everyone has something questionable about their papers and can lie about anything they like, their own names at the head of the list.

seco o humedo, con algas japonesas o sin algas japoneas, whisky etiqueta negra y video, donde siempre sale el mismo negro con una polla larga y la misma rubia chupandosela." (1983: 75-6).

²⁷ This group merits a whole ethnography of its own, almost without exception being from the large coastal city of Guayaquil.

I can always talk to prostitutes in the street or in bars, and to domestics if I don't mind intruding on their private Sunday-afternoon gatherings in plazas like Aravaca. But to get 'inside'--if there is any inside--it's thought better to get to a 'group.' What does this mean with these isolated women? A 'group' for domestics could be said to be AMDE (the Asociación de Mujeres Dominicanas en España). The founders and still the heads are Dominican women who were not domestics themselves but who have long been supporters and friends of them (Gallardo 1995). They have support from IEPALA (Instituto de Estudios Políticos Para América Latina y Africa), which means they have nice space with computers, light, resources. They traditionally have Sundays for women to come to classes. It's a very small group that actually goes, though, and repeatedly, which means a study carried out with them could be seriously non-representative. Also, the IEPALA hegemony can be strongly felt in its offices.²⁸ Prostitutes themselves have no organised group.

But 'getting to a group' can also mean getting an 'in' with a group that has contacts with interesting people.' Researchers are always looking for this kind of in to make their work easier and give it the weight a freelance effort doesn't seem to have²⁹. So to find people who might know more people, I spoke with journalists, people in solidarity organisations, priests, sociologists, doctors, social workers and migrants themselves.

²⁸ IEPALA was perhaps the first 'solidarity' organisation in Spain, having come from Uruguay with its founder. It's known by other NGOs to be run in a strict patriarchal fashion by its founder and his second in command. It gets money from the Spanish state and from the European Union.

²⁹ Another problem with NGOs is that everyone acts too respectful of them, as though their letterhead on the paper conferred high quality on the work done by anyone associated with them. Researchers and educators who on their own might produce original work are forced to fit themselves into institutional boxes and NGOs are encouraged to believe they are the only actors worthy of speech.

Most of the people I talked with at any length are connected to NGOs or health services. Why should this be? Did I distort my own findings? What would have happened if I had asked for contacts with prostitutes and domestic workers in other venues? While I sometimes told the truth about what I was doing outside the NGO context, I always felt the subtle disbelief, disapproval, difficulty to believe me, and usually I didn't do it. Interest in these women is 'permitted' only in 'helping' spaces.

Many people I questioned sent me to associations of migrants or programmes for migrants run by the state, the city or unions. In-migration is recent to Spain but there are numerous associations of ethnic and national groups. I did not study these associations. The 'migrant' problematic is large and does not necessarily include the 'domestic/prostitute' problematic. I discovered this (again) early in the research. Interviewing migrant associations about prostitution is conflictive. In those contexts, prostitution is generally seen as a disgrace and its practitioners as victims. Associations dedicated to elevating the status of their migrant group are not anxious to talk about the situations of those who do sex work or who might choose to do it. Feminist groups also abound in Spain, but prostitution is an antagonistic subject. The debates I was already too familiar with in other parts of the world dominate the Spanish situation as well, and Director General of Women's prohibitions on free speech on the subject have probably had their impact. I did not study feminist groups as such, either.

For the first month of the research I lived with four women: two illegal domestic workers from Chile, one legal Dominican domestic worker and one British tourist

illegally earning money selling jewelry. The apartment was located in an unremarkable middle-class neighbourhood a bit far from the centre of Madrid (Campamento). There was no telephone in the house. One of the Chileans had a mobile phone for her use only. Calls were made from public phones in the streets.

After that, I lived with a legally employed teacher of English from Wales. The apartment was located in Lavapiés, a very old, central, working class neighbourhood of Madrid with the most varied population to be found anywhere in the city. Moroccans, Dominicans, Senegalese and Chinese mingled together in streets and cafes along with Spanish families and many elderly people. The apartment had a telephone.

I spent a lot of time walking the streets of any neighbourhood said to house migrants: Cuatro Caminos, Valdeacederas, La Chopera, Tetuán, Parque del Oeste, Dehesa de la Villa, Azca, Plaza de Castilla. I sat in cafes, perused signs, bulletin boards and products sold and I listened to a lot of different kinds of Spanish. I walked across town to see Latin American films on hot summer evenings and cheered Latin American teams during the World Cup finals. My senses were finely attuned to discourses of ‘multicultural’ and ‘migrations’; everywhere I looked there were articles and announcements of talks and meetings. I collected quite a lot of paper communications in those few months. A journalist at Spanish Television gave me access to conduct a search on a general Spanish media database. When I wasn’t wandering about absorbing atmosphere I was dutifully reading everything relevant in Colectivo Ioé’s migration

collection: sociological and other academic studies, conference papers and government documents.

My research focussed, when not on sex workers themselves, with individuals and groups who actually communicate with migrant prostitutes as health and education service providers. There are three of them in Madrid; I got to know one of them much more intimately than the others and found friends there.





What Three Groups Are Doing in Madrid

Three organised entities work directly with migrant prostitutes and are able to situate this work in a wider cultural context. These entities do not agree with each other about what they are doing, although in at least one of their tasks they all agree.

Médicos del Mundo: Doctors of the World

This international non-governmental organisation receives funds from the state as well as from the European Union. (Another international organisation has a similar name and does similar work: Médecins sans Frontières.) Médicos del Mundo has branches in many Spanish cities. To get to them, I first interviewed Dra Concha Colomo.

Near the park of María Eva Duarte de Perón there's a subterranean passageway where a man is playing tangos with an accordion, not a bandoneón. A short strong dark man with long hair, I longed to talk with him...and didn't. Evita's monument has had its plaque stolen. I sit near it watching Peruvian nannies chat while strolling their charges and watching out for people who might not want them to be doing it.

Later I wait in the gynecological clinic waiting room of Equipo Quirúrgico, walls covered with posters advertising AIDS counselling/Aids prevention programme [Don't Be in Doubt] and Support Groups for HIV Positives. Nine of us are seated on eleven seats while a pregnant women with two children waits outside in the patio. There are two African-looking women, one with a man; one couple looks Mexican, another black woman looks Dominican. The hospital is pretty on the outside, old, set back from the street with trees and two curved staircases to get above where the offices are. There's no sound from the two doors that give off the waiting room except the occasional unanswered ringing of a phone.

I liked Concha Colomo a lot right away, she has a kind of mulata face, really short hair dyed orange but very neat and with 'marcel'. She is the specialist in sexually transmitted disease for Madrid's public clinics, her own office now being located in a public hospital in Calle Montesa, in a middle-class neighbourhood. They used to be in the middle of Plaza de Callao, in the same red-light district as Médicos del Mundo, which was much better, she says, acknowledging the indisposition of prostitutes to venture out of their barrios. Concha founded Médicos del Mundo's programme with prostitutes and wrote its proposal for a mobile unit back in the 1980s, at first conceived as health education, giving out condoms and needles and information about use. Later they got a second mobile unit for doing AIDS and other medical tests. She says they began together with APRAMP (see below) but they separated because of 'disagreements' she doesn't specify. Concha lost her (volunteer) job last year after many years service, also because of 'disagreements' with the president, Pilar

Estébanez. But Concha is applying soon again for the post because she loves it and feels she can offer a lot. The 'Fourth World' problematic is her passion (Colomo 1998).

After listening to me, she called María José (Pepa) Barahona, the head of prostitutes' programmes at Médicos del Mundo, and suggested we meet and that Pepa take me on the van to one of the places most populated by the latinas. When she gave me the telephone, I added that I had spent a lot of time with some NGO bigwigs in Amsterdam, so she gave me an appointment for a couple of weeks in the future. I asked her as if naive if that day she would be going somewhere with latinas, and she replied that they are in clubs and Médicos del Mundo doesn't work in clubs, only in the street, so I already knew she wasn't going to take me on the van.

Back with Concha, I mentioned the Director General for Women. Of course she knows her, says the prostitutes hate her, that she tried to take their children away from them because they couldn't possibly be good mothers. 'She's terrible', Concha comments, twice. She tells me about an over-40 Ecuadorian woman she saw that morning with two months here as a prostitute in order to send money to her husband back home. When asked how many partners she'd had in the past month she answered, very ashamed, that she didn't know. When asked if they were more than 50, she said no, if more than 20, yes, and that's the way she knew the woman was a prostitute.

You just show up in these clinics, you don't need any card or to use your real name or anything, they give you a number and they ask you how long you've been in Spain, but

you don't even need an appointment, you just show up and they see you in order of arrival. This is one of the most progressive policies I've ever heard of and Concha explains that the city will allow the programme to exist but not to give any publicity to it so it's luck if you hear about it, you have to talk with other migrants. Not so progressive after all.

Concha has a positive reaction when I mention Hetaira (see below). She says that between the city's programme and Médicos del Mundo there's good cooperation and that between APRAMP and Médicos del Mundo there isn't. They alternate days, but APRAMP just gives out condoms and information without doing any actual health work. Concha is emphatic when she says this and her expression is irritated.

After a couple of weeks, I went to my appointment with the really important person, Pepa Barahona.

The office and non-mobile examining rooms of Médicos del Mundo are on the ground floor of Corredera Baja de San Pedro, near moviehouse Cines Luna, erotic restaurant La Olla Caliente, a soup kitchen connected with the landmark church San Antonio de los Alemanes and an expensive shop for buying jamón serrano, especially the coveted bellotas (raw cured country ham from pigs that eat only acorns, one of Spain's prized delicacies.) The streets of this central red-light district are being torn up and redone and dust and detours are everywhere, but I manage to arrive on time. Waiting for Pepa

to arrive, I read all the notes left on the bulletin boards several times. After a half hour, I leave.

Pepa Barahona is notorious for wanting to exclude others from her 'territory'. She doesn't want anyone else to even know about it. Although I had spoken with her on the phone and had personal introductions from people she respects (which I carefully mentioned in hopes she would pay more attention to me), she stood me up and never responded to messages after that. She was brazen about it, and I wasn't surprised. Another Latin American, Fanny Polanía of Fundación Esperanza, had found Pepa closed to the possibility of taking Fanny along sometime in the van. Pepa said, about Fanny's ideas, 'You are very young', 'You don't understand' and 'Spain is very dangerous'. To Fanny, who runs an anti-trafficking project in Bogotá! After a decent interval, I called Concha Colomo again.

She says she's heard about the problem with Pepa before, that it's possible to get her on a good day and then she'll even take you out on the van, if not, nothing. 'But we'll both go in the van one of these nights, don't worry, we'll go to the place where there are most latinas.' It would be easier to visit other locations of Médicos del Mundo, in Sevilla the people are great, really open, and in Canarias. But Concha agrees to tell me about Médicos del Mundo in Madrid, whose Fourth World programme began in 1984 with one mobile unit. There are two sections, for prostitutes and drug addicts. Now Pepa is in charge of both, but there ought to be a manager for each programme, as there was before..

In 1992, they got another bigger vehicle with a gynecological table, where they do tests for pregnancy and HIV, give out information on abortion clinics, give the 'morning after' pill to women that has to be taken in front of the doctor. The big unit has two educators and two to four volunteers. They don't have much in the way of educational materials. They don't do research to publish, they're into action. Friday they're all day in the Casa de Campo, in different points, also Tuesday nights. They also go to other points in the city like Azca, the Plaza de Castilla and Calle Camoes in the Parque del Oeste, all well-known streetwalker sites. Médicos del Mundo's aims are to take health services and information to prostitutes and does not proselytise or attempt to change their way of life.

Concha tells me all this sitting in her small office, with the telephone ringing often and her offering, in nearly every call, to do a favour or get together with someone. At least two people come for unscheduled check-ups, which I dimly hear in the other room as I wait surrounded by advertisements for skin treatments and AIDS warnings. At the end of the interview, I feel that Concha is truly interested in my work and would like to find a way to collaborate.

APRAMP: Asociación para la Prevención, Reinserción y Atención de la Mujer Prostituida (association for the prevention, reinsertion and attention for the prostituted woman).

APRAMP's offices are in the Plaza del Angel, next to Plaza Jacinto Benavente and the beginning of Calle de la Cruz, another red-light zone. At the beginning of the street, some of APRAMP's target group are standing around: older, chubbier, all Spanish workers looking like housewives with extra makeup. The area is extremely mixed and interesting, especially the side of the square with a very large religious bookstore on the corner (currently featuring a picturesque children's text from the 1940s that describes el Generalísimo (Franco) as Spain's saviour from the forces of evil. Farther down on the same side is the coffee store that grinds its own and puts it up in bags with a routinely folkloric (or racist) image of a black mammy with her head tied in a hanky and a stick across her shoulder with baskets at each end. Around the corner is an extremely chic jazz bar (Central) and farther on a natural products shop selling tofu and yoga books. Hotels are everywhere, from several starred to gloomy pensions, and, as in so many places, tourists politely step around prostitutes who don't move for them.

I met with Rocío Nieto, APRAMP's founder 15 years ago, in its offices above a jeweler's shop ('Don't knock,' she said, 'he's not very happy to have us here'). A framed photo on the wall of her paper-free office proclaims her winner of an international prize in 1996, with a photo from the Times of London. Blonde with a kind of 70s flip hairstyle, she wears pants and a blouse and cardigan in dull colours. She looks a bit over 50 and world-weary, like a cross between a Mother Superior and a Chief Executive Officer.

The locale consists of a series of rooms going off from an entry hall. There's a room with two beds, two baths with shower, a room with a television, several offices and the workshops. APRAM holds sewing and painting workshops twice a day. Reluctantly she shows me the one in session at the moment with about six to eight women bent over sewing projects, and whisks me away after one short glance, apologising to the participants by saying, 'Sorry, we've interrupted you twice now'. A transsexual catches my eye and winks over her embroidery hoop. The products of the workshops are sold in El Corte Inglés. Another project recycles containers of computer paper. To participate in any of these, women must agree to leave prostitution.

The room with beds is intended for emergency situations, medical or otherwise. I sense the same hybrid atmosphere in the offices as in Rocío herself: part sanctimony, part business. I think the rent on the place must be quite high.

Rocío doesn't mind talking about her own programme but she also has a lot to say about the other two. She is scandalised that Médicos del Mundo has a budget of 150 million pesetas (\$1,050,000), which includes money for Pepa Barahona to travel to conferences in other parts of Europe. Rocío tells me she has told Pepa as much. APRAMP has 40 million (\$280,000, from both city and private sources). Rocío doesn't travel, do research or publish, and implies that she works far harder than Pepa. Six ex prostitutes are among the ten who get an APRAMP salary; Rocío emphasises the importance of this along with her own desire to work with them. According to her, the participants decide themselves what do at APRAMP. Thirty women are there now,

more than a thousand since she began. She's very bothered by the proliferation of NGOs--says it's 'another Mafia'. She, too, could put 5 million in her budget for travel but she doesn't do it, Pepa's the one that does it. Pepa even invites the women out for whiskies!

She says she collaborates with Médicos del Mundo in the work done by her mobile unit (contradicting what Concha Colomo says). To use APRAMP services you have to sign up, they give you a number, then they keep track of you. If you approach without the card with your number you can't participate. They offer you possibilities and want to know what you've done, but you don't have to do anything. She admits 'there are women who want to be prostitutes' and even says she knows some of them 'like to screw' for a living. For some reason her vulgar language seems to me like bravado; I have the feeling that she has had to learn to say these words and also, probably, to think these thoughts. But that she has learned them I have no doubt. Her goal, she states, is to encourage the formation of associations among the women, and her attitude doesn't show much desire to gain followers (as I was led to expect).

APRAMP also visits the pensions where many women live, in order to make relationships with the owners, who are glad, she says, because they don't want problems with sick or addicted women. Emergency services are offered and everything is equally open to migrants. I realise it's hard for me to visualise Rocío herself going to these places in anything but the classic role of social worker, and that's how I imagine she would see herself, as well, if the concept weren't a bit fusty and outdated by now.

I managed to upset her by mentioning Hetaira, because she says they robbed the concept of their project from her, and why don't they do something else? She says that Hetaira has a subsidy and does research (but they say they don't; see below). She is very bothered by the concept of 'rights': 'We all have rights'. When a sex worker was murdered Rocío was annoyed at the many women's groups who joined the protest but never do anything else for prostitutes. She seems resentful that Cristina Garaizabal of Hetaira was before a paid counselor/psychologist with APRAMP. Rocío says the women make fun of Hetaira, call them bull-dykes and throw away their Trabajo y Salud booklet.

She's impatient with all the giving out of condoms. 'If we give them 15 condoms when they need 4 or 5 we're not doing them any favour, we're promoting more prostitution'. APRAMP gives out condoms, too, 'but it's part of a wider programme' (needle exchange, tests, follow-ups, workshops, job placement). Anyway, the women have plans to buy and sell their own condoms (pension owners sell them, also, expensively) and she says they joke about selling the ones that Hetaira gives out. She makes fun of Hetaira's car (why?), everything about Hetaira, she seems to feel wounded by them, betrayed, perhaps by Cristina. Later she says 'No, everything's fine, I haven't said anything, I only mention it because you have'.

The women are sick of studies and researchers, she says. Rocío dedicates two hours to me. She couldn't have intended to, didn't expect to learn anything from me, didn't ask

me anything, sees me as a researcher/student, was shocked by my insider comments about Hetaira's booklet, which I know was created in Dominicana. Suddenly she looks at me and wants to listen to me. She probably has to be interviewed a lot and has a set technique.

Hetaira: Colectivo en Defensa de los Derechos de Las Prostitutas (collective in defense of the rights of prostitutes)

The church of San Martín is on the corner of Calle del Desengaño. Before 09.00, they're cleaning the streets, raising a lot of dust, some whores in bluejeans, the remainders of many nights visible in their faces. The church is clean, simple, creams and yellows with light brown, empty walls, the floor of marble tiles in cream and yellow with squares of dark green. There's a very nice peace, the street seems far away. The only people in the church are elderly. An ill-conceived concrete 'park' or plaza is across the way but Corredera Baja de San Pedro, which can be followed up to the locale of Médicos del Mundo, begins at Cines Luna on the corner, as does Calle de la Luna. One of Madrid's only Chinese grocery stores is here. In Spain, 'barrio chino' (Chinatown) means red-light district.

Hetaira's office space is on Calle del Desengaño where Calle de la Ballesta begins, with its string of bars named Sisi, Bar Kiss, Skopios, Bar Picnic, Club Amante, Tú y yo, Party Room. Desengaño can mean deception and disappointment as well as truth and

clarity and strikes me as the perfect name for the main street in a sex zone. Hetaira's flat is in a building from the last century, very large with multiple rooms that they worked hard to clean and paint. The main room has a diamond-formation of tables with a space in the middle for formal meetings; another small room has an old computer, telephone, heater. The kitchen has salmon-pink tiles up to the ceiling. They have to pay a million pesetas in annual rent. They have no grant or subsidy.

Its members came out of the feminist movement and are oriented toward women's rights to decide what to do with their bodies and towards workers' rights in general. They were encouraged to form their group by visits from prostitutes' rights activists Gail Pheterson, Carla Corso and Pia Covre, having themselves realised the contradictions held among many feminists on the subjects of sexuality and prostitution. One of the women is a well-known founding members of Spain's feminist movement, the psychologist Cristina Garaizabal. Members participate in other social movements on the Left where they attempt to integrate the prostitution problematic. Members do not agree on all points but try to negotiate a common position among themselves.

Hetaira's fewer than 20 members are volunteers and offer no professional services directly to prostitutes. The only sex worker member is the one asked to speak to the press, or any other public, usually. The offices are really big, but few prostitutes come. In fact they have had to realise the uselessness of the place, though they feel they need some physical presence in the barrio. In their street visits they used to take the metro

and walk. Now that they have a car the work seems so easy to them. 'It's a luxury' they say. But they would like a van, such as APRAMP and Médicos del Mundo have.

Our best conversations take place in cars on Monday night trips to the Casa de Campo. They invite me to accompany them as soon as I introduce myself and my work. We usually meet at the bar Mesón Galego, Mamen, Ana, Aurora and sometimes Puri, the only working prostitute in the collective. Despite of its location in Ballestas this is a young lefties' bar with interesting t-shirts, brochures for various causes of the moment like that of an end to widespread unemployment (el paro) and that of insumisos (men refusing military service). There are also the usual icons of international solidarity: pictures of Che Guevara, invitations to parties to raise fund for las madres de la plaza de mayo (Argentinian mothers of the disappeared) and notices of demonstrations for the end to the trade embargo against Cuba. The draft beer and tapas in this bar are bad but the ambience is without equal. In a rainstorm I would come here to write my ethnographic fieldnotes every time.

After a couple of beers we drive to meet Paloma at the Lago metro station and then in one of the two cars we tour around the lengthy strolls of the Casa de Campo, an enormous park known as 'Madrid's lung' for the quantity of trees. It takes me several trips to sort out what I am seeing. The prostitution terrain of Casa de Campo is loosely divided into four different areas, for Africans, transsexuals (usually latinas), drugaddicts (usually Spanish) and just regular Spanish working women who may be housewives in need of extra money.

Hetaira stops and parks the car often, approaching women with plastic bags full of condoms and--I am very surprised to see--the booklet Trabajo y Salud (Work and Health) which originated in COIN (an NGO in Dominicana, where I worked). It has been sent them by De Rode Draad in Amsterdam (The Red Thread, a prostitutes' rights organisation). Picture-novela techniques and popular-education theory have been used to present the necessities of sex workers from their own point of view; the protagonist is a prostitute-health promoter among other prostitutes. Hetaira has edited the booklet specially for Spanish-speaking women here in Spain, putting in appropriate vocabulary and expressions, but everything else is the same. They say the women love and identify with the booklet. I recognise Hetaira's approach in their work: non-working women, they have no problem in approaching 'prostis'--their nickname--to talk to them and offer condoms and booklets.

I have a complicated reaction to seeing Hetaira women saying 'We've published this for you'; there is no reference to the origin of the booklet or to its being the product of popular education with sex and NGO workers in Dominicana. It turns out this was involuntary; De Rode Draad facilitated the booklet to Hetaira without giving such credit itself to the origins. I feel that 'credit' is due: Yet shouldn't I be glad that this helpfulness is going on? I am, of course yet . . .

Mamen, a journalist with Página Abierta, tells me that when they were beginning they didn't want to compete with the other programmes. Some of them were working with

Médicos del Mundo and Cristina was with APRAMP. Paloma says that Hetaira, APRAMP and Médicos del Mundo might sound the same, but APRAMP wants to get whores reintegrated into society while Hetaira demands their rights. She says that when the prostitute was killed they demonstrated but APRAMP didn't (see above). The little courses APRAMP give have nothing to do with serious work, with genuinely alternative work for women and the women have to pay for the courses. Paloma says that APRAMP demands they leave prostitution when they go to the courses but they don't. To her, Hetaira's analysis of the situation is the big difference. There were disagreements: it turns out that if you want to talk about rights and consciousness-raising and the others want to talk about something else, you can't be together, you go different ways.

Mamen's face looks so young and white against the dark green trees by the side of the path where we are talking. She wears no makeup but her hair is hennaed. She's from Mérida in Extremadura. Aurora is a small woman from Montilla, in Andalucía. A mail carrier with the city for the past five years, she was an agricultural day-labourer in the olive and grape fields. She is a lesbian who felt there was no way for her to express or find herself in her hometown and so came to Madrid at the age of 35. Paloma, who works in her family's photographic studio and shop, is more northern Spain, roots in Galicia, 45 years old. What these three have in common is their location as single, independent women, still not a very large group in Spain.

All our talks are surrounded by the endless cars passing us by in search of the right sex worker. While by day they might pass through the Casa de Campo to get from one part of Madrid to another, at night they can only be there to pick up or look at women. Sex service is performed in the cars. The area of the Casa de Campo where we spend time has many trees and not much underbrush, so cars can be pulled aside and into odd spaces. It's not a manicured park but where we are there are so many roads, signs and lights that it seems less park and more city. Behind us, however, are vast more 'natural' areas, and fewer prostitutes. It has been raining a lot and the mud is a mess to park in; I wonder about the workers' beautiful high-heeled shoes. Sometimes it takes us a while to find a place to park where we won't be trapped in a pothole. I like the earthy wet smell and the dusty one later in the season after the rains have ended.

We talk with a lot of women, some like Spanish María Carmen, older, round and pretty, with large natural breasts and a necklace that leaves a pendant right where you would like to put your fingers. She's worked for seven years in the Casa de Campo and talks about how it has changed: so many more women and many fewer clients. Or like a woman from Caracas who has spent a long time in Spain but little time in prostitution and never in Venezuela, only here. Or like the drugaddict whose next client got annoyed because she was talking to us instead of him and began beeping the horn of his little red truck. Everyone laughed. A blonde woman who says she won't work after dark no matter what they tell her. Many such women are dressed conventionally, as if for regular streets and jobs. One such is a simpática plump Spaniard who works from the

main parking lot near the Lago metro station and has the air of a businessperson running from one appointment to the next.

There are many transsexuals all from the same Ecuadorian city of Guayaquil, probably the single most interesting detail of all. I would like to know how this happened: is there a transsexual disposition in Guayaquil, or a tradition? Is this culture or nature? The whole continuum can be found, from those who have recently begun changing sex to those who seem more perfectly female and gorgeous than any born woman. They have big, hard breasts. And in general they are 'sweet', if not passive then latina in that way that does not stick its personality out at you but waits for you to ask. The non-transsexual latinas seem to mix easily with the trans. And then there are the Africans.

Mamen says, 'They are very funny, they are happy, they live together in flats in the centre or in Campamento, they are all very young It's an adventure for them.' I don't comment. The Africans are usually very animated when they see me, often jumping up to touch me because I have hundreds of tiny braids. Braids made by extensions attached to their own hair are the most prevalent style at the moment, not because the style is autochthonous to their own countries (Nigeria, Liberia, Sierra Leone) but because this has been an emblem of black women's high style for some ten years now in the West. (My own braids might in a way be more authentic than theirs, since I got the idea from rural women in the Western Sudan in 1970).

But there is more to explain this probably temporary enthusiasm: I can speak to them in English, which makes them happy (they complain that the Spanish don't know English, which they know many other nationalities do. For them, English must be a third or fourth language) and I wear certain other items which signal something to them, like buzios, a shell which has protective and other powers in Brasil and the Caribbean as in West Africa. The Africans' style is raucous, aggressive and theatrical: g-strings and jackets that show their scarified breasts, or tight brilliant white one-piece suits with lace that somehow suggest weddings, mesh stockings, big big high heeled shoes. Many work in crowds that stick together at a major intersection; others in smaller groups but few singly. There are wars in all their countries and I at least know about them. Some seem funny, it's true; others tougher, more opportunistic. There isn't any way to explain what I mean by these words. I think Hetaira needs to understand better what it means to be giving out condoms to these women; I'm sure I don't.

Sex workers in the Casa de Campo receive a lot of visits, they know APRAMP and Médicos del Mundo; in this place the field is crowded, like in Holland. When I ask an Ecuadorian now here three months how she knew about APRAMP she says 'Oh you hear about everything here' and points to other women. But what the migrants ask for most is 'someone to fix my papers'. Aurora says 'We can't give them what they really want', which reminds me of the comments of Lin Lap Chew as she retired from the anti-trafficking project she founded years ago in Holland³⁰: 'We don't help them, we don't give them what they want'. Even privileged doctors with sex workers in Asia say that

AIDS prevention isn't what the women need most, that there's much more to do but that the money is given only for the AIDS prevention.³¹ So while helpers realise they should be doing one thing, they have to do another. The helpers keep talking about valorising sex work and prostitutes' rights and protesting violence against women and men's perverted sexuality. The sex workers at the same time are talking about how to get their papers fixed so they can work without worrying about deportation all the time.

While I was in Madrid the film Cosas que dejé en La Habana was getting a lot of attention. Three sisters have been brought from Cuba to Madrid by their aunt, who's lived here for twenty years or so. One of the girls doesn't mind working in the aunt's shop and one marries a homosexual rich boy. The third is an actress and keeps being one in Madrid, though her own name can't appear on the billboard. At the end of the film she says to Igor, a document fixer she's in love with:

'I need papers.' [Necesito papeles]

'I'll get them for you.' [Te los consigo]

'But I need real papers, understand?' [Pero necesito papeles auténticos, ¿entiendes?]

'All papers are real, they're all made of paper.' [Todos los papeles son auténticos, todos son de papel]

Sometimes when I'm riding the metro in the direction of the Casa de Campo I wonder which women will be getting out at the Lago station to work. Sometimes when we

³⁰ Stichting Tegen Vrouwenhandel (Foundation Against Trafficking in Women), Utrecht.

³¹ Personal communication, Amsterdam, 1997.

arrive a bit earlier at the Africans' area they are still dressing and making up but women who don't wear 'special' clothes to do sex work could just be anyone on the train at the moment, could be oneself. A few women get off at Lago always, but it's understood that many women arrive in taxi or friends' cars--especially the migrants prefer to pay more for the security of a private taxi.

In mid-August the city does something they've been threatening: the rezoning of traffic in the Casa de Campo for the purpose of separating prostitution areas from other entertainment areas. There has been polemic because the zoo and the amusement park, seen as family and children's entertainment, are very close to the red-light area and made even closer by the network of roads that lead directly from one to the other. Some have argued that families entering the Casa de Campo to take their children to the zoo should not have to pass prostitutes on the way and this point of view has won. Sex workers are forced to seek new locations and find the change discriminatory and hypocritical, since it is the fathers of those same children who come to visit them, and why aren't both forms of entertainment seen the same way? Outside the sexwork world there are a lot of jokes about the parallels between going to the zoo to look at exotic animals and going to find foreign prostitutes nearby.

Later, I ask if Hetaira is doing something that could be called research, as Rocío of APRAMP contended, but they say no, they haven't done research because that means methodology but they have thought of putting something on paper of what they've heard with the women during four years with the women in clubs, talking many times with the

same person. They do advocacy, though, and have been able to help when women have taken the initiative. Once, for instance, the club owners in Calle Ballestas circulated something for the prostitutes to sign, supposedly against drug sales in the area. But Lina, an extremely successful Cape Verdian worker, took the petition to Hetaira, where it was discovered that it also said the street prostitutes should be gotten rid of. Some of the streetwalkers had already signed, because they didn't read it all.

Concha of Hetaira (a different Concha) would like the women to set up some kind of cooperative together. But she sees no hope in this as each little group wants to be separate from the others; they refer to each other as 'that black girl', 'those Polish', etc. There is no solidarity among them at all.

One day during office hours we are emptying boxes of condoms from the city in order to fill plastic bags that now have Hetaira's new sticker, which shows a big-breasted woman saying "I take care of my health, I use condoms. I take care of the city, I use trashcans'. I think it must be the first time that the prostitution discourse has been combined with ecological one. It's too bad no clients take the walk upstairs to get some.





Assessment of Services Offered by the Three Groups

Médicos del Mundo takes gynecological services out to migrant prostitutes. Medical interventions that are not performed are facilitated through information. Little written material is used. Direct counselling is offered. By following known regular routes, women who wish to stay in contact may do so. Médicos del Mundo has information on courses open to migrants such as Spanish and formation as caregivers for children and the elderly. In its office in a red-light district, there are bulletin boards and counsellors. It's at street level in one of the principle prostitution streets.

Médicos del Mundo is a progressive organisation with a lot of money; its mobile units are large, deluxe and well-equipped. Its magazines show photographs of its doctors all over the world helping-- villagers, slum dwellers. Belonging to Médicos del Mundo as a doctor carries cachet. At the same time, the person in charge at the moment is overworked and volunteers are used on the mobile units, which leaves education and service wide open to the whims of the moment--a serious weakness when the population is prostitutes. The emphasis seems to be on hardware, not surprising in a medical operation. It must be excellent medical service for those it reaches, who happen to work in the targeted zones and who have the kind of personality to enter the van.

APRAMP offers alternative activities to women who want them, though I doubt they often lead to serious other careers. Although their system of signing people up and keeping track of them could function as ‘research’, they don’t publish anything, so the counting must just exist to show their funders. It could indicate inappropriate vigilance, too. Médicos del Mundo and Hetaira refer to APRAMP in a certain tone... When Concha Colomo says that there is no ‘cooperation’ between APRAMP and Médicos del Mundo I am given to understand that it is the opposite of cooperation.

Nevertheless, Rocío is not stupid. She understands some women may like the work and doesn’t seem to care about that. Of course, she’s older and maybe when younger was more fanatical about it. Her description of the contact with the owners of pensiones where the women live sounds constructive; this is the first time since I lived in Santo Domingo that someone realises it is important to deal with the people that own the real estate. There’s another opportunity here for meddling, however.

My feeling is they probably try to coerce women into giving up prostitution, offering goodies. This will inevitably appeal to some prostitutes, and they probably get something out of it, whether they give up the work or not. The workshops are in typically ‘female’ crafts, but transsexuals can now go (and were there when I visited), and they were starting a more business-like venture in recycling in a nearby location.

Hetaira, being a collective, lacks a fixed identity. Whereas Pepa Barahona and Rocío Nieto run their ships with an iron hand, Hetaira runs itself, according to whoever’s on

duty at any given time. Their experiment with having office space should be decreed a failure. Safer sex and self-protection are the values promoted, as well as a spirit of cooperation among women, laudable values. With so few services seeking out prostitutes, even one volunteer once a week is a great deal, and in fact Hetaira seems to reach more migrants than Spanish citizens. Without any funding, they are free to volunteer to do whatever they like.

Hetaira's politics are different, but they don't do anything very different from the other two groups, besides not having doctors and funds and more things to offer. Their talk with the women is their offer--their attitude; and this may be very valuable to some. But the Casa de Campo is saturated with people bringing things and I would like to see them use their limited energies elsewhere, in another way. They're talking about getting a van, and this just seems to repeat what the others are doing. The best part of what they do is the act of going, as non-working women (and non-doctors and non-social workers), to talk 'normally' to prostitutes. They aren't afraid and they don't disapprove. I don't imagine they will do this better in a van.

✂ What These Groups Have in Common

Although their politics and policies differ, these three groups have in common: 1--their desire to reach street prostitutes with services and their disposition to go out to find them; 2--their technique of giving out free condoms; 3--their understanding that

prostitution is a complicated social and economic theme; 4--their unwillingness to condemn prostitutes or to dismiss them out of hand as pathetic 'victims'; 5--considerable experience in working with and listening to the problems of sex workers; 6--offices located in red-light zones.

✂ What These Groups Do Not Have in Common

Despite their extensive common ground, these three entities do not collaborate among themselves. On the surface, this seems unimportant, as Madrid is a big city and there is surely room for many programmes aimed in different ways at marginalised populations who, despite their large numbers, are excluded from most social services. What is worrying about this lack of cooperation is not that too many condoms may be arriving at certain points (an almost funny side-effect although not to APRAMP) but that all three groups believe in and would like to foment cooperation and collaboration among the women they service. In their separate ways they believe that these isolated populations need to help each other. Yet while their 'feminist' or 'solidarity' discourses reflect this value it is not to be found among them themselves. Instead, many of them are bitchy or emphatic about the others and there seems to be a competition over who gets to 'speak for' the women. While there is nothing to stop them continuing to preach what they don't practice, it does taint the messages sent to the women serviced and outsiders, who can't fail to be aware of the competition.



Back in 'The Moment': What Went Wrong?

The day after the incident in the Casa de Campo (see 'The Moment', p. 2), I was scheduled to make a presentation to Hetaira members at their last meeting before a long summer break. I talked about the situation of migrants in general, as usual with pictures. Mamen Briz asked me to explain my disagreement with her about the 'happiness' of the African migrants. She also asked me for my comments on Hetaira's work in general, including any criticism I might have. I answered in part, but felt unprepared to answer well, so wrote and gave them the following in the next few days (here translated.)

✂ Why I suggest Hetaira rethink the work in the Casa de Campo

Problematic of the Africans

--It's already been learned in other countries that there is no educational technique which works with all populations, including inside prostitution

--The problematic experience is happening with the African women, whose cultures are more different from the Spanish than that of the other workers in this place

--The African women are not even from only one country but various; thinking of them as one unit isn't useful. There must be many different levels and little groups among them.

--It's a migrant problematic, another as complex as prostitution. Hetaira as an entity hasn't worked/thought it through yet.

--Twice something disagreeable has started. I've never seen this before in these programmes, which makes me think that we should be looking for other solutions with these people. It's obvious to me that repeating over and over the reasons why Hetaira can't give more than x condoms to each women doesn't work at all.

--It's not about language in itself. I've been able to talk with them in English and, although there are some who speak it much better than they speak Spanish, it's their second, third or fourth language. Several times it's been evident that they don't understand me either. Twice they've said quite strong/disagreeable things to me too, which I didn't repeat to you.

--We don't know what the problem is about. It might have nothing to do with condoms. It might be that solidarity is a value they don't have, or that they understand it another way but not in this work, or that the value exists between them but not with women from other countries. Another possibility is that they are using the situation more to demonstrate the force or the leadership of someone, or to demonstrate that they can dominate white women.

Problematic of all the workers

--The politics of Hetaira is that prostitution is a job like any other, so those that work in it have the same rights as any other worker. Logically then they have the same responsibilities (as you are suggesting in the new sticker). The most basic tool of their trade nowadays is the condom; so they're the ones that should buy them, choosing moreover among the many style those they like best. Which they are doing.

--If the idea is to collaborate with them by giving them something necessary but costly, there are other options. They spend much more money on clothes, hairdos, nails and makeup than on condoms.

--One supposition, which has continued the same during for at least a decade in these programmes of giving out condoms (apart from their health function) has been that this way people from outside can foment solidarity and cooperation among them. There are two reasons to question this supposition:

--No programme has been able to demonstrate this result, as far as I know, even among women native to the country having the programme. I have visited or studied programmes in Europe and the Americas, some in smaller towns, others in big cities.

--It's curious that the desire among all those that create programmes is that the sex workers show more solidarity with each other. However, among the programmes this solidarity almost doesn't exist: each follows its politics

without collaborating with the other programmes (equally sad, because what is encouraged this way is competition for scarce resources between programmes).

--In Madrid there are at least three programmes which give out condoms in the Casa de Campo. It makes sense to distinguish the Hetaira project from the others, which also have more resources.

Possible different techniques which could be used instead of condoms, to change the dynamic: a list of techniques without comments on their ease, difficulty or recommendability.

--park in another place farther away, so it won't be easy for them to appear twice.

--arrive much later; when they are already working they don't want to waste time.

--arrive earlier in order to eat with them and do the distribution in a more social way.

--use as an 'entrance' something different: matches, flowers, food, anything else; if the condom is only an entrance then it can be changed for something else.

--arrive with empty hands but with the idea of bringing something through conversation.

--study the possibilities of using popular education: look for animators among the women in order to train them so that afterward it will be they who give out or educate.

--give the condoms to one of them to give out, with or without commission.

--throw the condoms out the window.

Later, I had more extended thoughts about the whole situation, beginning with the object:

☞ The Magic Sheath

The condom is the object used by people the world over to ‘get access’ to the women, to symbolise solidarity, to show non-judgemental attitudes about sex and sex work. There are even Catholic nuns and priests who give them out.

Prophylactically, the condom is seen as the only realistic way to prevent sexually-transmitted diseases, AIDS and unwanted pregnancies. Ship-containers of condoms are sent by USAID to health projects all over the world. Prostitutes have long been stigmatised as ‘vectors’ of disease and ‘pools of contagion’, or, in a more recent version, as ‘high risk groups’ (EUROPAP 1998); focusing condom-giving on them is justified as necessary to prevent the plagues they are responsible for. Vectors of disease, however, such as mosquitoes who carry malaria, don’t get sick. Prostitutes do.

Condoms are given out all over the world by people who exhibit no judgement about their use and for whom *exhibiting no judgement* is itself a value: “What you do with this condom makes no difference to me”. There is a kind of bravado in giving out condoms or bleach kits to whores and junkies; the people who do it are seen as more accepting than others of sex and other physical pleasures. I have seen a Dutch nun pull out

Later, I had more extended thoughts about the whole situation, beginning with the object:

The Magic Sheath

The condom is the object used by people the world over to ‘get access’ to the women, to symbolise solidarity, to show non-judgemental attitudes about sex and sex work. There are even Catholic nuns and priests who give them out.

Prophylactically, the condom is seen as the only realistic way to prevent sexually-transmitted diseases, AIDS and unwanted pregnancies. Ship-containers of condoms are sent by USAID to health projects all over the world. Prostitutes have long been stigmatised as ‘vectors’ of disease and ‘pools of contagion’, or, in a more recent version, as ‘high risk groups’ (EUROPAP 1998); focusing condom-giving on them is justified as necessary to prevent the plagues they are responsible for. Vectors of disease, however, such as mosquitoes who carry malaria, don’t get sick. Prostitutes do.

Condoms are given out all over the world by people who exhibit no judgement about their use and for whom *exhibiting no judgement* is itself a value: “What you do with this condom makes no difference to me”. There is a kind of bravado in giving out condoms or bleach kits to whores and junkies; the people who do it are seen as more accepting than others of sex and other physical pleasures. I have seen a Dutch nun pull out

prostitutes' education material from a Dominican organisation in the middle of mass in Amsterdam, in order to show solidarity with Dominican sex workers in the congregation.

An analysis of the rhetoric of this bravado would include the subtleties of tolerance, pity, envy, the desire to own or take over, vicarious pleasure, voyeurism. In 1998, everyone agrees that women of all cultures understand why and how to use condoms, unless it's their first night on the job. The problem is the very high proportion of clients who pay as much as double the normal price for sex without condoms or who simply refuse to use them.

One Hetaira member, Concha (another Concha), who is also a member of the leftist association Liberación, tells me that she agrees with me more or less about condoms. It has simply been the way in. She has a story of a woman who came every day to the offices for condoms, until one day there weren't any, they hadn't arrived from the city. Concha was surprised that the woman was so annoyed; then it came out that this prostitute hadn't bought a single condom since she knew about Hetaira. Her driver brought her every day past the Hetaira office in a Mercedes. Concha suggested to me that she thought--but didn't say to the woman--they she could have bought a little less cocaine and paid for her own condoms.

Another complication arises from the widespread non-use of condoms by prostitutes with their boyfriends/husbands, a source of frustration and even anguish by AIDS

outreach workers and doctors. Lisa Law writes of the Philippine context what others have said of many other nationalities:

While it is true that bar women tend not to use condoms with their regular boyfriends in order to separate work from pleasure, to equate the non-use of condoms with general disempowerment distorts the issue. The non-use of condoms, in what would appear to be unreasonable circumstances according to middle-class sensibilities, has more to do with Filipino conceptions of *bahala na*--translated by Enriquez as 'risk-taking in the face of the proverbial cloud of uncertainty and the possibility of failure---than with disempowerment or a lack of negotiating skills. Many women employed in these establishments are looking for a future husband, and the use of condoms in these instances--that is, with a prospective husband--is seen to impede the achievement of intimacy, and ultimately, an opportunity to exit the industry. (1997: 115)

In the incident in the Casa de Campo, the condom is the icon of solidarity, also the material object of dispute. Yet I believe without the condom this incident would occur identically at some point. Which leads me to

Multiculturalism

The Hetaira women, coming out of the Spanish feminist movement, mostly have no or little direct experience which could allow them to understand women from dramatically different cultures. Spain still has very little in-migration compared with neighbours like France and Portugal, although it's now fast increasing and everyone is talking about it. Concepts of multiculturalism, or interculturalism (the French model) are new; they

haven't been lived yet. Addressing only Mamen's idea that the Africans look *graciosa*, those who work with migrants know that "people who migrate find themselves obliged to keep up a pretense that they are happy and prosperous. This is the unwritten duty of those who depart." (Skrobanek et al 1997:26)

My contribution to the rather combative conversations which followed The Moment was to say that I know little more than the Hetaira people about women from Nigeria, Liberia and Sierra Leone. But I know when I don't know and am unlikely to impose a value on them. I suggested that the Africans may indeed have or believe in solidarity concepts but it is possible that they are defined so differently that Hetaira can't see them. I suggested to Hetaira that the argument in the Casa de Campo had nothing to do with condoms. Given the large sums the women spend on clothes, nails, shoes, hairstyles, make-up and taxis it is absurd to imagine that it is a hardship to buy prophylactics. We can't know what the scene was about but there are a number of interesting possibilities, among them a demonstration of power by the woman on the car. She might be a leader, the girlfriend of a trafficker, or using the incident to show her superiority to white people or white women. Her attempt to dominate the scene might be a reflection of something happening between ethnic groups at home. She might be trying to usurp a leadership position from another woman, either present or not that night.

It might take many 'moments' for Hetaira to draw the conclusion that something is wrong. The worse case is they may not have to, particularly if they follow the fund-

raising, van-buying road. There is a kind of inertia that sets in with more settled organisations. Still, it would help if they learned more about other cultures, so I suggested they get together with one of the migrants' associations to exchange information and impressions. I continued to wonder, however, what is going on with these Allies who are not allied even among themselves. It is not enough to intend to help nor to intend solidarity. The importance of both help and solidarity are in the perceptions of the receivers--or no?





The Magic Word: Solidarity

Solidarity can be defined as a feeling that impels people to help others or a mutual dependency in which people can't be happy if others are not. Stated this way, Solidarity seems like an indisputable good. One rationale of Solidarity is that we all have certain things in common. And this would seem to be obvious when we consider values such as wanting enough to eat, a roof, to be able to speak one's feelings and not be sick. After those, we're guessing. If the world is full of so much variety (still), one reason is that people do *not* share many values.³²

In the world of Solidarity, no one questions the Red Cross when it appears at the site where a hurricane has passed. But in social problems, who defines when people need help and what kind of help they need? Both anti- prostitution and pro-prostitutes' rights proponents want to help, collaborate, cooperate and/or empower migrant sex workers, but, since their analyses of the situation are so different, their concepts of how to help are, too.³³

³² People are always offering me chocolate and surprised I don't want it, for example.

³³ The same contradiction has been seen in many arenas. In Latin American armed struggles, there have always been those who *didn't* want the help of outsiders. In Solidarity circles, it is usually assumed that people who went to El Salvador or Nicaragua during their civil wars have done something heroic, devotional, generous to counteract U.S. imperialism. This is the dominant discourse. Yet there are always voices that don't desire the presence of these helpers, even while sharing the same goals. This discourse has consistently failed to be recognised.

Belief in solidarity is basic to NGOs and other allies. It is why they do what they do, in a way, for less money than they would get doing similar work inside institutions or businesses. Solidarity remains a principle discourse of all three groups as they talk about their ‘targets’--sex workers. *They* are perceived as needing solidarity among themselves. “If we don’t manage that, we are lost,” says one Hetaira member. Médicos del Mundo’s Fourth World Programme speaks of solidarity between and among marginalised groups, including migrants; APRAMP promotes *asociacionismo* (the building of organised groups or associations) among prostitutes; Hetaira seeks to show sex workers how they will have more power through group identity across ethnic groups and individuals’ circumstances. Yet despite their belief in solidarity, allies don’t manifest it among themselves either socially or in terms of work. It must *not* further their ends. Why is this?

In one sense they ‘compete’ for the same clients in the same field. Yet they don’t sell directly but *give* free services to their clients, and their figures on clients contacted, which they probably submit to funders, are unlikely to be diminished by each other’s existence. Sex workers may make joking remarks about one service to another (about APRAMP because Rocío wants to ‘save’ them, about Hetaira because they have no services or because they look like ‘dykes’ or ‘feminists’). But a free service is a free service, and all give out good-quality condoms. In their home countries, migrant sex workers may already have had contact with AIDS outreach projects and the style will not have been radically different (though they may not have heard Hetaira’s discourse on ‘rights’ before in some places.)

The three groups nevertheless don't work together. Although the only three groups with experience necessary to talk in public about prostitution, when Hetaira held a *jornada* (public debate, conference day) a couple of years ago, APRAMP didn't show up. For Paloma of Hetaira it's a sufficient explanation that they have different values. Yet they share one value--solidarity--which could supersede such differences if they wished it to, even more since they all have one action in common: the giving out of condoms. It would seem, therefore, that *not* collaborating, not 'showing solidarity' with each other, must serve an essential function. Their differences need to be preserved and not only preserved but displayed publicly. Though they don't attack each other or actively undermine each other's work, the manifestation of their ideological differences is important to them. Thus Médicos del Mundo are doctors saving the world with European Union backing, APRAMP/Rocío Nieto offers an alternative life to prostitution and Hetaira are directly interested in women's liberation and sexuality and the rights that make these possible to acquire.

Talking about values is of primary importance to all three groups. The activity of manifesting individual thinking is primary, which makes sense in the context of Occidental values on the freedom of the individual, freedom of speech and the development of Self. The question that arises then is how did such a value as solidarity come to be important, since it is in conflict with individualism? Solidarity can bring people/groups together when there is a clear common enemy, for example during a dictatorship or invasion by outsiders. One could say that the common enemy of these

three groups is AIDS, or a society that doesn't recognise prostitution as work, or that the common enemy are men. But, clearly, none of these is *felt* to be the common enemy here and now in Spain.

The NGO by definition is *non* governmental. It is *not* supposed to be a number of things, among them, in today's world of monolithic governments: overwhelming, heartless and bureaucratic. Being non-governmental *might* mean not receiving money from governments, but this is not the case of these three groups, though they may receive from private sources as well. Médicos del Mundo is rich, APRAMP is middle class and Hetaira is poor. But they all receive, or have received--and seek--funding from government entities. The condoms they all give out come from government agencies, if not the Spanish then the city's.

Although many people were tired of or angry with Felipe González's social-democratic government after 18 years, Alfredo Aznar's is seen by many as wanting to turn government into a capitalist business. If a programme 'works', it may be kept. Social programmes are marginalised because they don't 'pay'; it's government that has to pay. Therefore anyone *not* in the government or the owner of a successful capitalist business is in the same boat and can talk about the cruelty of government with assurance of everyone's agreement who happens to be around. The common enemy, therefore, is Government itself, and the solidarity that plays such an important role in the NGO discourse is a solidarity of people--individual human beings with bodies that can have sex for money--against the State which threatens to starve or crush those bodies.

The apparently contradictory behaviour of the NGO allies is thus explained, at least in part. Despite the extremely quarrelsome and obvious conflict among feminists on the issues involved, these differences don't play a great role in this particular case of non-solidarity. In the three groups' minds, they are in solidarity with the prostitutes. If poor women migrate, it's at least partly because their governments have failed them. In that way, both migrants and allies are 'together'.

At the same time, allies are members of a society ever more oriented toward individualism and the development of the self. Their own feelings and thoughts are primary to them, and thus drawing lines between them and those who think differently causes them to sacrifice solidarity among themselves.

The implications for the groups' other goals--education, health services--are obvious: NGOs compete for funds and miss opportunities to share resources. Focussed on the enemy, influencing/changing government is seen as the most important goal. Hetaira, still poor and therefore both relatively marginalised and relatively free, tries less to influence government and more society in general. In all three cases, contact with the other groups and with the 'targets' themselves, is minimised.





Other Educational and Health Services That Might Reach Migrants

Theoretically, migrant prostitutes and domestics can take advantage of an array of programmes and products aimed at migrants in general. The following are the general possibilities.

Associations of immigrant nationality or culture groups These are usually formed by and for people who are definitely trying to settle in their new country and people who are 'legal' (including official 'refugees'). In Madrid there are at least three for Dominicans, two primarily for women. When migrants arrive and are looking for help, they may be sent to such groups. If prostitutes go they will probably not tell the truth about their work, which may limit the usefulness of the information they receive. Some groups specialise in making legal information available; in Spain one has the actual official forms available to download from their Internet website (Centro de Trabajadores Emigrantes of Comisiones Obreras, Zaragoza, Spain).³⁴

Language classes Municipalities almost always offer classes open to anyone. Bulletin boards in Médicos del Mundo and Cruz Roja, where prostitutes and domestics might

³⁴In the United Kingdom, The Greater Manchester Immigration Aid Unit, sells simple, inexpensive pamphlets and has an Internet website.

see them, list these possibilities. Latin Americans in Spain don't need them, but other migrant women from Africa, Asia and the Caribbean do.

Classes in 'Home Care' In Madrid at the moment it is possible to sign up for classes in how to take care of the elderly and children and even how to be a domestic worker. These classes are widely agreed to mask widespread unemployment. There is no reason why women currently in prostitution or domestic work could not take advantage of these classes, but they are not free and it is questionable whether they will increase their chances of employment by taking them, as these are the poorly-paid jobs they usually find anyway.

Classes in literacy, basic education, computers, etc. If given by the migrants' associations or the municipality, domestics and prostitutes can register and some of these are free.

Municipal health and Red Cross clinics Illegal migrants and prostitutes are accepted without documents and uncomfortable questions but they must enter 'official' kinds of buildings to use the services. There are some mobile services to specific, targeted barrios and following strict schedules. Prostitutes in those places will definitely at least see the services vehicle; not all will investigate it.

Imagining migrant sex workers taking advantage of the above opportunities is difficult, and live-in domestics will scarcely have time for them. There is one kind of programme they may well run into, however: AIDS prevention and education.

⌘ AIDS Outreach to Prostitutes

Prostitution in the towns is like the cesspool in the palace: take away the cesspool and the palace will become an unclean and evil-smelling place.--Thomas Aquinas

HIV transmission requires the active participation of two persons.--The World Health Organization *Progress Report*, 1998.

AIDS outreach programmes in general, as education, as health service, as information, are too large a subject to be evaluated here. It's important to note, though, that such projects have traditionally been the only way to get funding for NGOs who propose to work with prostitutes³⁵. The only visibility that sex workers have had is as the 'pools of contagion' and 'vectors of disease' that now, after nearly fifteen years of AIDS research, it is clear that they are not: "Unprotected sex, rather than a particular type of relationship. . . is what puts people at risk." (B. Schoepf of AIDS prevention in Zaire, 1994). Many writers continue with a blame-the-prostitute point of view, however, and

³⁵ Chile's peer education for AIDS outreach is financed by the Pan-American Health Organisation (PAHO) and the Dutch government, for example (Instituto de la Mujer 1992).

often even projects with prostitutes are evaluated in terms of men's health, not their own (Overs 1994).

For some time it has been considered a basic truth that work with prostitutes, drug addicts, street people and the Fourth World in general works best through peer education, a technique that trains members of the 'target group' to be educators/promoters of messages already prepared. Such titles as *Women Resisting AIDS: Feminist Strategies of Empowerment* (Schneider and Stoller 1995) reflect a complex discourse that combines health, sexuality, resistance and feminism and, as such, has learned to value subjects--in the form of drug users or sex workers, or those retired from these activities--as educators of themselves.

Outreach workers must identify on *some* level with the target population. . .

The object is to empower women at risk. . .

We work with women to achieve their self-defined goals. . .--Reback 1995: 171-3

Such truths are typical of many projects and many writers, and they came to be accepted in many places through the dramatic failure of early AIDS prevention programmes with street populations, which used conventional educational techniques--what popular educators call 'banking education'.³⁶ Gloria Lockett, a black prostitute in San Francisco, was one of the founders of one of these programmes, CAL-PEP. She has written about

³⁶ Banking in the sense that a supposedly fully knowledgeable educator, usually from a higher class and level of formal education, attempts to fill the head of the learner, from a lower class, as though he were banking knowledge, storing it up for later use.

the language issue, the ability of peers to “talk in a way people can hear” (Lockett 1995: 213) and about how they found that peer education wasn’t enough if the target population couldn’t be reached.

We realized pretty early that it was very hard to get prostitutes to come to our office. We needed to go to them. . . The biggest scare was injection drug-using prostitutes, and they were the hardest to reach. Those were the women who would not go far from their friends and their connections. They were not going far from where they bought their drugs or wherever their friends could find them. And so we got the idea, “Let’s find somebody to buy an RV so we can go down and give them a safe place to talk.” With an RV, they can look out the window and see if their connection is out there and not be so worried about losing out on something. --Gloria Lockett 1995: 213

In Spain, Médicos del Mundo also learned the location lesson, among others:

. . . health programmes for prostitutes. . . must keep in mind the networks that exploit prostitutes . . . who depend heavily on their ‘protectors’. . . When the important personal relationships are scarcely differentiated through the necessity of maintaining clandestinity---foreigners in illegal situations, sporadic prostitution parallel to normal family life. . . --*collectives marginalised in these ways from general social life are usually marginalised as well from public social and health services*, which they hardly use--when they exist--and if they do use them, it is without expressing openly their personal circumstances, which means that the attention [they receive] is necessarily deficient. . . *The social and health services must themselves approach these collectives*, eliminating as much as possible the barriers that exist, in order to be used: in prostitution ghettos...they must be located in the same neighbourhood; *the services they offer shouldn’t be destined exclusively to women*. . . since it has been proved that in many cases the

first visit stems from a request for assistance for children; *administrative requirements must be flexible*, since in many cases documents are missing or clients wish to maintain clandestinity; . . . *emergency visits seem to be more effective than requiring appointments* at specific times; *the techniques used must be adapted to the cultural characteristics of the population*, more conducive to intensive therapeutic relationships than to regular, long-term therapeutic work. . . . *In place of placidly waiting for demand to be produced according to the manner convenient to the service's requirements. . . in this case the technicians try to facilitate the capture of people at risk.* --Amparo Comas and Felipe Reyero 1985: 63-64 (my translation, editing and italics)

Outreach workers in Bangkok bars have discovered that

The programme should not only engage the bar workers but should include others in the bars as well (such as owners or managers, captains or mamas, cashiers, waiters and waitresses, doormen, janitors and clients). ...attempts to reach clients must be made through the above core groups together with using appropriate media and other strategies. The aim of this comprehensive approach is to set up a network of education, encouragement and reinforcement in a bar.--Werasit Sittitrai 1993

In June of 1998, Ivan Wolffers, a doctor who works in AIDS prevention with sex workers in Indonesia, published *Research for Sex Work* through Amsterdam's Vrije Universiteit. He explains: "It appears that many action groups, research institutes, public health facilities and NGOs active in the field of research of STDs/HIV/AIDS among sex workers and their clients in developing countries, are facing the same problems." According to many testimonies from Asia and Africa, peer education is seen to be

problematical. But also problematical has been the relationship of doctor-directed projects with sex workers who believe they should be running their own projects³⁷.

With all these problems, little AIDS education, even for prostitutes, manages to reach migrant women.

TAMPEP (Transnational AIDS/STD Prevention among Migrant Prostitutes in Europe) receives significant funds from the European Union for what is called prostitutes' education.³⁸ These projects are located in a few particular, targeted places (Hamburg, Pordenone (northeastern Italy), Amsterdam), none in Spain. They are directed at street prostitutes only and health is the main or only subject of education. TAMPEP produces workshops for women (Brussa 1994) but, ultimately, small numbers of women know about or attend them. It is also common for the same quasi-settled, quasi-legal or legal women to attend over and over. Licia Brussa, the TAMPEP director since its inception in 1993, has written extensively (and repetitively) about the project, but rarely about its specifics (Brussa 1989, 1994, 1996, 1998). The programme produces many written materials, which have been translated to 12 languages, largely on prevention of AIDS and STD (sexually transmitted diseases). TAMPEP uses 'cultural mediators' to bridge the gap between migrant women and European doctors. The cultural mediator is a person who not only speaks both languages but is thought to understand both cultures

³⁷ Cheryl Overs in many private conversations; Metzenrath 1998.

³⁸ EUROPAP (European Intervention Projects AIDS Prevention for Prostitutes), the other prostitute-oriented programme, is one of the funders of Médicos del Mundo.

accompanies the migrant to doctors' visits.³⁹ Among other techniques, TAMPEP also uses peer education.

The focus on streetwalkers only is usually justified by the idea that street workers have higher rates of HIV infection (Estébanez Estébanez 1990). Studies that would include migrant women working in closed clubs such as those found on highways and outskirts of cities are scarce or nonexistent, however. My own feeling is that these programmes partake of the usual NGO squeamishness to get close to danger. Gloria Lockett writes about CAL-PEP of the importance of outreach workers' not feeling afraid: "We realized we had to hire people who were comfortable going inside projects and crack houses. . . and being out late at night." (1995). Most workers with migrant prostitutes refer to the clubs as if they were impossible to reach. There may well be danger involved in attempting to reach these women, but there may also be techniques and attitudes that to overcome this problem. In bars that can be entered, educators or service-providers are severely limited in their contact with workers. To have private communications with them, their time must be paid for; most bar-owners will allow only potential sexual clients such communications. For this reason, outreach to bar and brothel owners is an obvious necessity.⁴⁰

³⁹ I and others are extremely skeptical about this technique. The idea is that migrant women, coming from other cultures, may not take advantage of European health services without the encouragement and accompaniment of someone familiar with both cultures, who can interpret between the two parties. I cannot stop hearing a patronising tone in this idea and note, along with Fanny Polanía who worked with TAMPEP in Amsterdam, that salaries are paid to Europeans to do these jobs. And, obviously, with one cultural mediator per project, they can't possibly accompany everyone who would like it.

⁴⁰ However there are few such programmes that include or target owners of sex establishments themselves. In Santo Domingo, some bars allow COIN's participatory theatre to enter and become part of the offered entertainment; also see Sittitrai (1993).

‘Anti-trafficking’ programmes are located in various European locations (La Strada, Czech Republic; AGISRA, Germany; Anti-Slavery International, UK). Disputes abound about how to define trafficking and therefore how to run an anti-trafficking programme, among themselves and between NGOs and governments. Stichting Tegen Vrouwenhandel (Foundation Against Trafficking in Women), the biggest and wealthiest trafficking project, in Utrecht, Holland, is trapped in its own contradictions: they don’t go out into the red-light districts to talk to women because they are afraid of ‘endangering’ them. Therefore they wait inside their building for police or clients to bring them women who have decided to ‘denounce’ a situation, and who have escaped; in the end their work affects small numbers of even those who would like to be helped by them.⁴¹ There are no such programmes in Spain yet, but Fanny Polanía of Fundación Esperanza (Bogotá and Amsterdam) is about to start one.

The educational goals of anti-trafficking include informing women of their rights as migrants, helping them to get out of prostitution if they want to and making it possible for women to avoid abuse and exploitation if they stay in sex work. Anti-trafficking work at a minimum teaches women not to give their documents over to anyone else, to give their addresses to someone, not to sign papers they can’t read or understand and to have some addresses and telephones of friendly organisations located in the place they’re going to.





New Techniques are Needed for Migrants

With all of the above conventional services and educational possibilities, no matter how liberal, generous and undemanding they may seem, the question is: How will isolated migrants find out about them? And if they do find out, how do they know they will be safe there? How do they know they won't be asked for certain difficult documents? How do they know they won't be reported to the police? Will they have schedules flexible enough to allow them to attend classes at fixed times? Priscilla Alexander has written of the need for service providers to develop better thinking about what kind of education could work for migrants, given their hidden/hiding/marginalised/ghettoised and moving condition (1993).

When learning and service opportunities for migrants are referred to at all in the education literature, they refer almost one hundred per cent of the time to schooling necessities of children of migrant workers such as latino farmworkers in the United States (Bell et al 1994; Miller 1995). Mobile units that will take computer and science laboratories to rural areas are mentioned (Nommensen 1994; NHSA Journal 1994). Public libraries have a history of taking services out to communities, again, primarily rural, and Internet access is now being included in proposals throughout the world

⁴¹ Private conversations with Marcia Albrecht and Lin Lap Chew of STV.

(Drumm and Groom 1997; Doyle 1995). These projects are located in school districts with considerable financing power.

Again, always addressing the needs of children, various studies have showed that different attitudes to schooling are held by migrant populations. Molander has written about travellers' children in the United Kingdom (1991); the Bernard van Leer Foundation has documented mobility's effects on children's health and education in India, Kenya, Greece, Ireland, Malaysia, Thailand and Israel (1994); Blanc and Chiozzi studies children of 'foreign parentage' in The Netherlands, France, the United Kingdom and Italy (1992). All agree that completely different techniques are necessary to educate the children of migrants. Khurana reports on an Indian effort to reach 'slum children' by taking lessons into their neighbourhoods (1992). And there are even fascinating studies of the children of Australian 'showmen'. Only the World Council of Churches mentions first the need for 'protection' of migrant workers--and then their families (Danaher 1991).

Writing of their educational needs, Chimah Ezeomah defines nomads as one of three categories: (1) hunter/food gatherers, such as the Hadzabe of Tanzania (2) itinerant workers, such as gypsies and (3) pastoralists, such as the Masai in Africa, the Sami in Scandinavia and the Inuits in Canada ("Educating Nomads for Self-Actualization and Development" 1990). Nomads are defended as important and valuable and extremely disadvantaged in terms of educational and welfare services and suggestions to help have

included boarding schools, mobile school teachers, radio and correspondence schools.

Adult nomads are mentioned as needing 'practical skills'.

Although he doesn't say it, migrant prostitutes would not seem to belong to his concept of nomad, nor, for that matter, would migrant Mexican farmworkers in the United States. This is because he is focussing on 'ethnic' nomads, not on people who have to migrate to work, and who may keep moving around in the same way as his classic tribes. It has seemed strange to me to be looking so very far from the reality I've studied, a reality which involves all the nations of the world here and now and people who, far from being an endangered species, are ever more numerous. Ideas that have been used with slum and circus children are extremely interesting; it is usually a great leap to see how these techniques might work with migrant prostitutes. It's unnerving, too, to see how nomads need 'self-actualization': why is that? Why don't they just need reading, writing and arithmetic?

Researchers who have studied migrant social patterns and networking in Madrid⁴² explain how Dominican women find employment and other services and information:

⁴² Many writers have addressed the particular educational situations of Third World migrants through discussion of their contrasting values with the dominant society. Migrants feel inferior, coming from the 'underdeveloped' world. They are considered 'black', with none of the shades of distinction present in their home countries. The feminine values traditional to their cultures are in conflict with their new situation, even when the subjects are Latin American women in Spain: "Feeling 'low' stimulates the need to reinforce certain values of their own culture as a mechanism of defense. This causes them to form groups among themselves, intensifying the development of social networks. Although to the outside world, the Spanish, they adopt a defensive posture, among themselves they reproduce the social differences of their own country. The maintenance of identity is carried out, principally, with the establishment and strengthening of social networks. The focuses of social communication (Aravaca, etc.) act as centres of consolidation of values, to the extent that they suppose the domination of space and

...Dominican women don't use employment agencies, or at least not the majority...This is due, on the one hand, to the Spanish....as employer and as agent who prefers other foreign women because of clear racial prejudice. . . on the other hand....*dominicans have their own mechanisms for looking for work. 'They usually get work through the nuns'. 'They find work through friends'* . . . in the networks of work information within the collective, in which a fundamental role is the concentration in the Plaza de Aravacathe group interaction which happens in Aravaca fulfills an important social function in the transmission of information. On the one hand, the plaza is a centre for sending and receiving news about Dominicana and, more concretely, about the places of origin of the migrants. . .On the other hand, *the personal contact which this concentration permits among the women allows the exchange of information about work*: the jobs that are being left are communicated to the unemployed, to recent arrivals and to their family members. -

-Yolanda Herranz Gómez 1997: 96 (my translation, editing and italics)

There is a difficulty with outsiders--including those who offer education and services--utilising this concept, however. Such a 'foreigner' attempting to communicate with a domestic worker, for example, would have to go to known places of congregation on days off, such as the Plaza de Aravaca in Madrid. She will stand out dramatically, for one thing; for another she is to some degree invading the only 'private' time these women have. So the tables are turned and such a foreigner becomes the 'invisible' one, the Other--a status usually not conducive to useful communications.

permit the reproduction of cultural norms." (Oso Casas and Machín Herranz 1993: 197-198 my translation)

European service providers wishing to help migrant women--NGOs, solidarity workers, church people--all acknowledge and worry about the difficulty of their work, starting with the difficulty of even being in contact with the women. Entrepreneurs and clients, however, easily communicate with the women. This means that those who know how to take advantage of illegal workers' vulnerable situation contact them easily (and are usually men) while those who would like to educate, inform, offer different options to the women are too far away to do anything (and are usually other women).

The problem can be thought of as a question of access: outsiders' access to the women and women's access to outside. I say it *can* be thought of this way, because I *propose* that it be thought of this way instead of as a problem of prostitution, trafficking, imperialism, immigration law, police control, Structural Adjustment policies or male chauvinism. To understand the access problem, I studied the communications behaviours of service providers, facilitators and migrants themselves.

NGO Communication Style

By and large, NGOs all over the world reproduce the infrastructure and bureaucracy of institutions, acquiring office space, telephones, fax machines and computers. This requires a lot of money, and a good part of paid time necessarily is spent fund-raising.

Most NGOs working with migrant women focus on influencing States and the United Nations on immigration law, prostitution statutes, abolition of prostituting, prevention of trafficking, defining rights to health care, privacy, residence and better working conditions.

The preamble of the United Nations Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others (1949) states that “. . .prostitution [is] incompatible with the dignity and worth of the human person. . . “ and there have been repeated calls to amend this Convention to define all prostitution as a violation of human rights.

However, the Convention and other international and local sanctions have not taken account of the social and economic realities of prostitution. Such sanctions have not been effective in eliminating either the flow of women into the sex industry, nor in curtailing abuses within it. --

Anti-Slavery International, 1997

To keep themselves in business and attempt to influence policy, NGOs spend most of their time communicating with levels above their own, or at the same level. When they go to communicate with the people for whom they exist, they often do so in writing.

NGOs involved in education usually produce a lot of written materials. While many migrants are capable of reading/parsing simple texts (i.e., ‘functionally literate’), reading is not part of their everyday culture⁴³. Printed materials are alien and associated with schoolteachers and social workers, not always the best memory for undereducated people and prostitutes. Nowadays most AIDS outreach materials are written in a

colloquial style, illustrated with cartoons and photographs and embody grassroots/popular attitudes and techniques. This is a definite advance over the dull reading that was published before, and undoubtedly has a better chance to be read and understood. But migrants often don't associate reading with enjoyment or leisure as they do television, music or films. Moreover, holding onto and keeping track of written materials is an impractical idea for people on the move. In the case of semi-hidden and illegal people such materials can be dangerous⁴⁴. NGOs spend a lot of money writing these materials (and duplicating others for want of collaboration among similar agencies) and then translating them (Brussa 1994)⁴⁵, but distribution is usually limited to their own projects only. This means that another project located perhaps not far away but not part of TAMPEP but with the same idea for AIDS education will spend the time, energy and money to produce something substantially similar, and this happens often.

To give a pamphlet to or have a conversation with migrants, NGOs have to be with them, yet this has proved to be a difficult problem. Waiting for migrants to come to offices, even shop locations, has not worked in many places; so outreach programmes have come to be the accepted method. Either educators on foot or mobile units have been accepted as the only way to reach marginalised populations such as intravenous drug users and sex workers, whose vulnerability to HIV infection has been linked to their failure to receive traditional services (Lockett 1995; Narimani et al 1996). But

⁴³ Vast segments of both Third and First World nations read little more than signs and headlines on a daily basis. Information and diversion are acquired through other media.

³⁷ The cover of one TAMPEP leaflet on 'security tips' warns: 'Hide this leaflet in a safe place. It could be dangerous to you if found by the wrong people.'

these programmes are usually limited to needle-exchange, condom-delivery and medical tests. While there are some programmes of accompaniment and some street education, in general, NGOs are afraid of traffickers, both for themselves and on behalf of women they could endanger by directly approaching them. This fear also limits their efforts.

All in all, the NGO communication style is cumbersome and formal.

✂ Facilitators' Communication Style

Facilitators and entrepreneurs (and what some call traffickers), in stark contrast to the NGOs, go directly out to migrants, with the clothes, jewelry and other products that interest them. They take mobile phones into convenient places and sell long-distance calls. They use mobile phones and pagers to run their businesses. They directly inform and/or misinform women about jobs. They offer transport to new work sites. And, finally, they sell women the fraudulent birth certificates, passports, carnets, work permits they need for these jobs, often making the documents themselves on sophisticated machinery. This communication style is lean and informal.

✂ Migrants' Communication Style

⁴⁵ TAMPEP translates its *novelas* into Spanish, French, Italian, English, Portuguese, German, Polish, Czech and Russian and various Asian and African languages as necessary.

Migrants with any freedom to go out on their own have their own methods of getting information and communications.

*They use phone-call shops (*locutorios*), a fixture of immigrant neighbourhoods everywhere. Recently, phone calls via Internet with camera provide talking and pictures at the same time. Faxes are little used.

*Long-distance phone service via mobile phones brought in to them by entrepreneurs are a great service for those not able easily to get to a locutorio.

*Pagers and mobile phones for migrants themselves can be a lifeline, when they can afford them and are free to use them. The phones are not useful when identity documents or bank accounts must be shown to get them.

*Messenger services provide a fast way to send documents and money back and forth from countries without secure postal services but are very expensive and not always secure. Postal services are too slow and unreliable.

*International wire services like Western Union or American Express are the safest and fastest way to send money.

*Streetside cash machines are largely unusable by migrants, who don't open bank accounts if identity papers must be shown.

*Flyers and other 'portable' advertisements for services and products handed out on the street, taped to phone booths, on sugar packets, napkins, matchbooks are accessible to everyone. These often advertise legal advice on securing residency, conversions of one kind of videotape to another, inexpensive hostels, making copies of compact discs, cheap air tickets, etc.

*Community newspapers often provide free classified advertisements and are important to migrants for finding out about housing, furniture and basic services.

What do the women's and the entrepreneurs' methods have in common? They are mobile, direct, discreet, rapid, flexible and anonymous--the opposite of the institutional style of most NGOs. This goes some way toward explaining why NGO education and services has little effect while others' do.

My own have focussed on the question of access, the NGOs major failure, and on those words: mobile, direct, discreet, rapid, flexible and anonymous, which to me spell Internet.





Migrant Communications in Cyberspace

Migrant movements, like many marginalised, harassed or prohibited in the 'real' world, have taken off in cyberspace. These tend to cross national boundaries, the politics of migrant activists being, exactly, to question policies of nationalism and exclusion.

Migrants Against HIV/AIDS (based in Geneva) Les Sans-Papiers de St.-Ambroise (based in Paris) and others are organising 'illegal' migrants, that is, those who may be summarily deported. The entity 'No One is Illegal' questions the very concept of human beings being labelled as legal or not. They are pan-European (Ilegalen Bestaan Niet, Kein Mensch ist Illegal, Non C'É Ilegali, Personne est ilegal, Ninguna Persona es Ilegal).

As outsiders, these groups are taking advantage of the openness of the Internet to diffuse their ideas and to aid in organising demonstrations and disseminating stories and current cases. They also actively aid and hide people in danger of being deported. So far these groups are composed largely of Third World men and probably do not approach migrant prostitutes (but I can't be sure of this). Other migrant/ally groups on the Internet include United for Intercultural Action, World Association of Christian Communications, Refugiados Lisboa, CARF, National Coalition of Anti-Deportation Campaigns, Razzismo Stop!, SOS Racismo and Travellers Ireland.

In borderless cyberspace, the nationality of groups is blurred, as they copy, translate and link sites in deliberate acts of solidarity. In Spain, SOS Racismo is part of another pan-European effort, although until recently their only address was in the Basque Country (San Sebastián). Using the Internet and the APC⁴⁶ server Nodo50, other 'locations' of SOS Racismo have appeared, 'in' Madrid and other places where they don't have geographical street addresses.

On the web, migrants diffuse their principles, demands, hopes and strategies as well as specific case-histories and documents, sometimes with photos and e-mail to write to people. On the Internet, images and ideas about migrants appear that appear nowhere else. Here it is the migrants who educate the natives, as their faces jump out at us along with the usually outrageous details of their efforts to become non-migrants.

Using e-mail lists as well as webpages, they are able to organise cross-border demonstrations, particularly effective within the European Union. For example, when Belgian police suffocated a woman being forcibly deported to Togo, supporters of 'No One is Illegal' organised simultaneous demonstrations at Belgian Embassies across Europe. And when France won the World Cup this summer and politicians immediately bragged about the multicultural team, the Sans-Papiers appeared in the middle of celebrating Champs-Élysées crowds to say 'We're multicultural, and we're being

⁴⁶ Association of Progressive Communications, international solidarity group for Internet servers and members.

deported'. Well-coordinated demonstrations like these usually then get press coverage they might not otherwise.

Ally projects are putting practical and legal information on the web for migrants to find. The Greater Manchester Immigration Aid Unit in Great Britain has a large number of inexpensive informational pamphlets, and CITE, Centro de Información para Trabajadores Emigrantes, in Zaragoza, Spain, has put the actual official forms migrants need for so many processes onto the web so they can be downloaded. There are also e-mail lists for people to exchange information on how to get around/comply with Immigration laws in any country imaginable.

A diversity of relevant texts can be found at sites such as The Coyote as a Needed Businessman, Guide des droits sociaux des séropositifs, Conference Migrants & the Right to Communicate, Partenia(virtual parish of migrant supporter Jacques Gaillot, Droit télématique and Technologies to the People.

Of course, those that actually put texts on and improve websites are a technical few. But within social movements there are always those more 'technical' than others, as some are writers. When the writers and technicians put their talents at the disposal of the group at large, we observe another form of solidarity.

Networking is basic to popular social movements, which by definition don't get the funding to get and equip those nice offices the NGOs tend towards. Among the more

interesting suggestions that have been made to ameliorate the dismally limited situation of migrant women in Europe is the emphasis on networking proposed by Narimani, Gallé and Tovar (1996). Among their reasons are:

--It is important to find as many sources of pressure as possible, as monitoring the human rights situation, with well-documented examples of practices against policy, are very important for developing strategies of action to counter abuses.

--Sharing information. . . A variety of European publications and NGO newsletters provide valuable information on the issues surrounding AIDS and migrants. Human-rights violations can be monitored through these reports, and calls for support and appeals published. Through different media it is possible to compare the different approaches followed in specific countries or in different communities. Events can be announced, reports on workshops, meetings and conferences given, contact addresses published, ideas shared and problems stated. Exchanges of information material, posters and videos can be arranged, saving time and money, and helping people feel better in knowing that other groups in others countries share their ideas.

--Networking . . . can assist emerging NGOs to gain official and public recognition and respectability. 210-211.

These authors don't mention the Internet, and it's hard to know how they propose to do all that sharing without it. Since it now exists, it's worth questioning how migrants might get access to it.





Questions of Access

Those who get irritated by paeans to cyberspace will jump to point out how useless all such activity is to marginalised, untechnologised people from the Third World. In the traditional 'development' discourse, backward people are condemned to trudge through all the stages of 'progress' the First World has already lived through. According to this idea, it is absurd to talk about migrants using Internet when they don't have houses, telephones and bank accounts. Migrants will not be able to get access to the Internet, they will not have computers, they aren't socialised to sit in front of screens, etc, etc. The only concession I have heard in this line is the concept of 'friendly access', in which solidary groups/NGOs/individuals might offer time and access on their own computers. Unfortunately, even I can't get this when I travel, so I imagine how it might be for a sex worker with ten minutes to spare. And why should access to communication be a favour?

In my view, this is a stifling and patronising discourse. Many participatory researchers have already shown how quickly people with no technological experience at all can learn and relate to video and sound recording devices. The fact that the Internet is still in its clumsy babyhood should not obscure the possibilities for the future--and, as we know, the future is tomorrow in the world of computers. There are already mobile phones that receive limited e-mail messages and notebook computers that function with

mobile phones. It won't be long before we have portable devices on watches, in purses, etc. At the same time, there are infinite possibilities for public Internet access. Already this exists on posts in the street in Holland, with full web and e-mail access as well as printing, and cheaply. Literacy questions are being addressed through new uses of sound, image and virtual reality.

The following is the proposal I have written for the pilot project

✂ Communicating with Migrant Women.

Abstract: Techniques are needed for communicating with and among migrant women and their allies in Europe that will have the kind of success that entrepreneurs have with this group. Research has shown that services need to be mobile, direct, discreet, rapid, flexible and anonymous. These needs are in contradiction to the institutional nature and style of work of most NGOs working with migrants. Non-institutional programmes or efforts must not be rooted in buildings nor be dependent on expensive producing of written materials and must be focused on migrants as participant subjects of work (rather than on maintaining the importance of and dependence on outside organisations).

Justification: European media, governments and NGOs predominantly refer to migrant prostitutes only as illegals, victims of trafficking and potential vectors of HIV, when they mention them at all. Third World women working in domestic service are ignored

even more. Immigrants are often referred to as a group or collective, but these women don't fit that concept. In the international debate on how to help migrant women labourers, different versions of feminism are in conflict.

- * Domestic workers often live six days inside houses where they have no privacy, no free time and no right to leave or to make phone calls. Someone wanting to contact them must visit one of the large gathering-places they use on their Sunday afternoons off.

- * Sex workers are often controlled/protected by entrepreneurs, are sometimes unable to leave clubs where they work to pay off heavy debts, are fearful of being harassed by police and are suspicious of outsiders. Someone wanting to directly contact them may be asking them to take time off from work or even endangering them.

- * Most important, large numbers of prostitutes are in constant movement. Living a short while in many places, they move on to avoid becoming known and targeted by police, or they are moved on by entrepreneurs/traffickers. Many migrants in Europe have worked in multiple countries, crossing borders frequently. Yet they avoid contact with most people outside their own milieus and live in an isolation where even making a phone call to the outside world may be very difficult.

Europeans wishing to help migrant women--NGOs, solidarity workers, church people--all acknowledge and worry about the difficulty of their work, starting with the difficulty of even establishing contact with the women. Entrepreneurs and clients, however, have direct access to these women. The result: those who know how to take advantage of

illegal workers' vulnerable situation contact them easily (and are usually men) while those who would like to educate, inform, offer different options to migrants find themselves too far away to do much (and are usually women). How does this come about? The problem can be thought of as a question of access: outsiders' access to the women and women's access to outside.

* Most European NGOs working with domestics, prostitutes and mail-order brides focus on influencing States and the United Nation on immigration and prostitution policy, on abolition and prevention of trafficking and on defining rights to health care, privacy and fairer immigration laws. Some lobby for better working conditions for domestics, dancers and prostitutes. Their work-style is usually institutional, involving acquisition of office space and computers and producing written information. While there are health-only services in some places that go out in vehicles to migrants, and some projects for accompaniment and street education, the greater emphasis on influencing levels above NGOs results in relatively little actual contact with women migrants.

* Facilitators/entrepreneurs (known to some as traffickers), on the other hand use multiple kinds of vehicles to go out to migrants and physically move them around; they use mobile phones and pagers to run their businesses; they directly sell migrants the clothes, jewelry and other goods they want; they sell them mobile-phone long-distance calls; they directly inform and/or mislead them about jobs; and, finally, they

sell them the fraudulent birth certificates, passports, carnets, work permits they need to keep working.

Short-term Objectives:

- * Gathering of migrant-centred data on the meanings of communication linked to the potential of new technologies;
- * Development of a website (based at SID if possible) through which migrants can exchange this information and perspectives on it to develop communications priorities of their own;
- * Publish the results of the research in the form of project report/storysheets/academic paper/journal article;
- * Initial development of links with migrant organizations.

The project's approach will begin enabling migrants to:

- * Get information anonymously, without entering buildings
- * Participate in discussions about themselves
- * Inform the world about their lives and needs (life-stories, testimonies, petitions)
- * Organise actions
- * Keep in touch with friends and families and with each other
- * Denounce abuses
- * Have options besides those offered by people hoping to make money off them

Long-term Goals:

- * Contribute to diminishing of migrant womens' isolation and exploitation.
- * Empower migrant women to make informed decisions about their lives and work.
- * Include non-traditional population in ICT projects (i.e., these women have varying levels of literacy, speak languages different from the one where they are working and have mobile lifestyles).
- * Work against traditional development discourse that assumes all Third-World and marginalised populations must pass through the same stages of progress the First World has: acquisition of literacy, basic education, computer education and English as well as electricity- and telephone-equipped private buildings.

Beneficiaries:

- * Women from Third World countries who have travelled to Europe to work and who are working as domestics, prostitutes, pieceworkers, street vendors and any other poorly paid/quasi-legal/informal-sector job, with or without legal working papers.
- * Migrants' organisations that currently exclude or are ignorant of the situation of these women.
- * Third World women's networking projects that current exclude or are ignorant of the situation of these women.

The following are organisations/groups who have expressed interest in this project.

Actual partners will depend on timing and the existence of support.

In Spain:

Conexiones Para Migrantes/Connexions for Migrants, virtual association based in Madrid

Mujeres en Red (Network Women), cybernetic women's networking based in Madrid

Nodo50, APC member, part of NGO Solidaridad y Paz

Centro de Información para Trabajadores Migrantes (Information Centre for Migrant Workers) of Comisiones Obreras (a national union), Zaragoza

Hetaira, Collective in Defense of Prostitutes' Rights, Madrid

Somos Iglesia (We Are Church)

Concha Colomo, Doctor with migrants/Fourth World advocate, Madrid

In France:

Les Sans-Papiers de St.-Ambroise, based in Paris

In Switzerland:

Migrants Against HIV/AIDS, based in Geneva

In Great Britain:

National Coalition of Anti-Deportation Campaigns

In Latin America and Europe:

Fundación Esperanza, anti-trafficking project in Bogotá, Colombia,
Amsterdam and Madrid

In Latin America:

REPEM (Red de Educación Popular Entre Mujeres), based in Montevideo, Uruguay

Tertulia, women's international networking in Spanish based in Guatemala

Methodology will include:

- * Cybernetic networking
 - * Popular education; in initial stage seeking promoters among subjects of project
 - * Action research
 - * Participatory techniques with technology and in general throughout research
-

This is the first proposal; the next will address some of these ideas:

✂E-mail that is Mail

The goal should be for e-mail to have the kind of service that regular mail has: letter-carriers, or, at least, poste restante. For migrants we should aim at pick-up points in sympathetic places like estancos/corner groceries, and the corners need to be in the areas where women work and which they can get to in minutes). There could be a small charge to pickup mail, like for faxes. As well as notes to friends and family, a private e-mail discussion list for migrants should be promoted. Here migrants could exchange information on who's going where, changing working conditions or police policy, 'bad trick' or dangerous trafficker lists, weather reports, shopping possibilities, with the goal of helping avoid dependence on opportunistic outsiders. The list, Migrafem, already exists, created with the help of the Distributed Knowledge Project at York University. The project should use multiple languages, pidgins and cyberspace; if everyone doesn't understand every conversation, it doesn't matter.

Mobile Units

Mine would combine communications services with the usual health-related ones. I'd like to see a comfortable, feminine, technologised atmosphere: telephone, fax, toilet, shower, sandwiches, coffee, condoms, pregnancy test, asylum forms, needle exchange, counsellor, useful addresses, e-mail and web access with ability to print. Good educational materials put on the web would be downloaded when necessary. But the key to my mobile units would be their ability and disposition to cross borders with migrants and not remain stuck to one geography. Instead of watching migrants leave and wondering what happens to them in the next place, allies and educators would have the opportunity to share and know something of that future.



I have tried to understand why NGO programmes with migrant prostitutes have little effect, not simply to criticise another form of institutionalised power but to help justify changing gears and going another direction. NGOs spend much of their energy worrying about the power of traffickers, yet their own behaviour actually gives more room for entrepreneurs to do what they like.

From the emblematic event in the Casa de Campo, when a sex worker staged a kind of showdown with a solidarity worker, to the analysis of what such a kind of solidarity might mean, I have tried to unite narrative and discourse analysis alike as means to see into a dense problematic. The particulars have often applied to Spain, the site of my most recent field research, but the general trends can be seen all over Europe.





Appendix I

Thanks to migrants interviewed:

Among the men:

from Chile: Hernán

from Argentina: Walter, Eduardo, Jorge

from Perú: Edwin, Willy

from Dominicana: Nelson, David

from Brasil: Adison

Among the Latin American women:

from Dominicana: Yeni, Marta, Merce, Isabel, Altagracia

from Cuba: Inez, Dalia, Gladis

from Chile: Susana, Leopoldina

from México: Magaly

from Colombia: María, Nancy, Olga, Lourdes, Elena

from Ecuador: Soledad, Nuria, Luisa, Celia, Rosa, Irene

from Perú: Isabel, María Elena,

from Argentina: Carolina, Silvia

from Venezuela: Cecilia

from Brasil: Nayra

Among the African women: many whose names I never knew from Nigeria, Liberia and Sierra Leone.

Thanks to Others Interviewed

Montse Boix, journalist, Televisión Española, creator of 'Mujeres en Red' Internet women's news service, Madrid

Leonor Taboada, editor of MYS, women's health magazine, Palma de Mallorca

Sofía Valdivielso Gómez, educator with adult women, Las Palmas de Gran Canaria

Javier Malagón, Director of ECOE, Equipo de Comunicación Educativa, Madrid

Emilia Robles, of ECOE

Carlos Pereda, member of Colectivo Ioé, Madrid

Walter Actis, Ioé

Berta López, Ioé

María-Jose Barahona, Director of Fourth Worldprogramme, Médicos del Mundo, Madrid

Rocío Nieto, Director of APRAMP, Madrid

Dra Concha Colomo, specialist in Sexually Transmitted Diseases for City of Madrid at

Hospital Equipo Quirúrgico Montesa
 Dra Raquel Martín, doctor/specialist in women with HIV for City of Madrid at
 Hospital
 Equipo Quirúrgico Montesa
 Carmen Briz, journalist with Página Abierta, Madrid
 Concha García, member of Liberación
 Colectivo Hetaira, Madrid: Aurora, Ana, Merche, Toñi, Angeles, Puri, Mamen, Paloma,
 Concha, Cristina, Josune
 Kim, of Selene, transsexual group, Granada
 Julián Añover, director of Nodo50, APC Internet services for Sodepaz, Madrid
 Pepe Lázaro and members of the parish assembly of San Carlos Borromeo in Entrevías
 Fanny Polanía, Fundación Esperanza, Bogotá, Amsterdam
 Gina Gallardo, AMDE, Association of Dominican Women in Spain, Madrid
 María Paredes, AMDE
 Aldumena, volunteer with AMDE, Madrid
 María Pilar of IEPALA, Madrid
 Mari Luz Córdoba Vico, nun, of Hiedra, Córdoba; before with Cáritas Española, Madrid
 Paquita of Association of Women of the Night Looking for the Day, Alicante
 Isabel of CITE of Comisiones Obreras, Women's Programmes, Valencia
 Vicente of CITE of Comisiones Obreras, Migrants' Programme, Zaragoza
 Dra. Concha Colomer, women's health, Valencia
 Celia, Argentine outreach worker with women drug-users, Barcelona
 Pepa Franco, journalist, Madrid
 Angustias Bertomen Martínez, women's documentation centre/literacy, Castellón
 Dris of Cooperacci, Barcelona
 Librería de Mujeres, Madrid
 Dra Paula Tremiño, Valencia
 Juan González, Pamplona
 Julio Lois, priest in Vallecas, lived in Bolivia
 Julio Garcia, priest in Vallecas, lived in Argentina
 Julio Pinillas, married priest, Vallecas
 Sebastián, Spanish priest living in DF, México
 Mariano Ruíz, homeopath, Colombia/Madrid
 Sira, secretary to naturopath/acupuncturist, Madrid
 Concha, nurse, Madrid
 Félix, amigo





Appendix II

The methodology of this project was Action Research, and sometimes Participatory Action Research. I received two foundation grants for proposals that included community action and organising. My work is overtly political, and the actions resulting from it are, for me, of primary importance. The following is a short list of the results accomplished:

* Hetaira will evolve a position on migrant prostitution and I am part of their process. The Spanish scene is not crowded with NGOs talking about this. Hetaira is sometimes consulted by the press and has a chance to talk more creatively, more realistically, more progressively about this problematic, if they like and understand anything of what I say. For me, therefore, it's both a satisfaction and a challenge to be asked to influence them. Since I'm certain that my way of seeing migrant prostitutes is truer, kinder, better than other ways they might hear, I don't have any doubt about talking about it. I also know I am not alone in my vision.

* I struggled for over a month in cyberspace, on the e-mail discussion list of Women on the Net (cyborg list), lobbying for the creation of a 'virtual association' of migrants--Connexions for Migrants. This innovative concept in organising was finally granted status by SID, Society for International Development, in Rome.

* With this status I requested group membership in Nodo50, the Madrid Internet service provider and member of the APC (Association for Progressive Communications) network. This group identity's e-mail account can be accessed from anywhere in the world and forms part of my longer-range planning for education with migrants. I created a primitive website for the association.

* Dr Gillian Youngs, of the Centre for Mass Communications of the University of Leicester, England, offered to collaborate with me in writing proposals for funding Connexions for Migrants.

* Montse Boix, journalist with Spanish Television and founder of Mujeres en Red, a cybernetic networking project, Reda Sadki of Migrants Against HIV/AIDS (Paris and Geneva) and Fanny Polanía of Fundación Esperanza (Bogotá and Amsterdam) have all expressed interest in the migrants project.

* I travelled to participate in the Know How Conference organised by IIAV in Amsterdam in August 1998, where I was able to meet with cybernetic friends who have also expressed interest in the project: Marcela Ballara of the Office of International Migrations in Geneva and Alejandra Scampini from REPEM, a UNESCO-funded Latin American network.





Bibliography

- Acton, William. 1856. *Prostitution: Considered in its Moral, Social and Sanitary Aspects, in London and other Large Cities: with Proposals for the Mitigation and Prevention of its Attendant Evils*. London: J. Churchill.
- Aguilera, Manuel. "La casa de 'Pandora'." *El Mundo* año ix núm 87 [Crónica 14] 15 junio 1997.
- Aguirre, Begoña. "Mamá en la pantalla." *El País*. [Madrid 5] 22 septiembre 1996.
- Agustín, Laura. 1998. "They Speak But Who Listens?" In *Women@Internet: Creating New Cultures in Cyberspace*, ed. Wendy Harcourt. London: Zed Books.
- ALAI (Agencia Latinoamericana de Información). 1994. *Desilusión en la tierra prometida: Latinoamericanas en Europa*. Quito EC: ALAI/Red Aquí Nosotras.
- Alexander, Priscilla. 1993. *Making Sex Work Safer: A Guide to HIV/AIDS Prevention Interventions*. Geneva: World Health Organisation Programme on AIDS.
- _____. 1996a. *Trafficking v. Sex Migration*. New York: North American Task Force on Prostitution.
- _____. [no date]. *Prostitution is Sex Work: Occupational Safety and Health*. New York: North American Task Force on Prostitution.
- _____. 1996b. *Who counts the women? Prostitution and Homelessness*. New York: North American Task Force on Prostitution.
- _____. 1996c. *And they Always Seem to be Wearing Red!: Prostitutes, AIDS, Ideologies, and Ethics in a Clinical Trial of Nonoxynol-9 in Nairobi, Kenya*. New York: North American Task Force on Prostitution.
- _____. 1987. "Prostitution: A Difficult Issue for Feminists." In *Sex Work: Writings by women in the sex industry*, F. Delacoste and P. Alexander, eds, 184-214. San Francisco: Cleis Press.
- _____. 1996d. "Making a Living: Women Who Go Out." In *Women's Experiences with HIV/AIDS*, E.M. Andrah and L. Long, eds. New York: Columbia University Press.
- _____. 1995. "Sex Workers Fight Against AIDS: An International Perspective." In *Women Resisting AIDS: Feminist Strategies of Empowerment*, B. Schneider and N. Stoller, eds, 99-123. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Allison, Anne. 1994. *Nightwork: sexuality, Pleasure and Corporate Masculinity in a Tokyo Hostess Club*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Altink, Sietske. 1995. *Stolen Lives: Trading Women into Sex and Slavery*. London: Scarlet Press.
- AMDE (Asociación de Mujeres Dominicanas en España). 1993. *Tres mujeres dominicanas en Madrid: Sus historias contadas por ellas mismas*. Madrid: AMDE/Comisiones Obreras.
- _____. 1993. *Cuadernos*. Madrid: Instituto de la Mujer.

- Anarfi, John K. 1998. "Migrations and tourism. Ghanaian women and prostitution in Cote d'Ivoire." In *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York: Routledge.
- Anti-Slavery International. 1996. *Redefining Prostitution as Sex Work on the International Agenda*. London: Anti-Slavery International.
- Antrobus, P. 1997. *Reproduction Crisis: Women and Structural Adjustment in the Caribbean*. Telecommons Development Group, University of Guelph Department of Rural Extension Studies. URL <http://www.tdg.uoguelph.ca> [Accessed 10 May 1997]
- Anzaldúa, Gloria. 1987. *Borderlands: La Frontera*. San Francisco: Spinster/Aunt Lute Book Company.
- Asia Watch Women's Rights Project. 1993. *A Modern Form of Slavery: Trafficking of Burmese women and girls into brothels in Thailand*. New York: Human Rights Watch/Asia Watch Women's Rights Project.
- Asociación Pro Derechos Humanos en España. [no date] *Declaración Universal de Derechos Humanos*. Madrid: APDH.
- Atchison, Chris, Fraser, Laura and Lowman, John. 1997. *Men Who Buy Sex: Preliminary Findings of an Exploratory Study*. Northridge CA: Center for Sex Research.
- Aymer, Paula L. 1997. *Uprooted Women: Migrant Domestic in the Caribbean*. Westport: Praeger.
- Azize-Vargas, Yamila, Kempadoo, Kamala and Cordero, Tatiana. 1996. *International Report Project on Trafficking in Women: Latin American and Caribbean Region*. Utrecht NL: Stichting Tegen Vrouwenhandel.
- Bhabha, Homi. 1994. *The Location of Culture*. London: Routledge.
- _____, ed. 1990. *Nation and Narration*. London: Routledge.
- Bakan, Abigail and Stasiulis, Daiva. [nd] *Not One of the Family: Foreign Domestic Workers in Canada*. Toronto CA: University of Toronto Press.
- Barroso, F. Javier. "Una deuda de horror." *El País*. [Madrid 4] 21 agosto 1998.
- Barry, Kathleen. 1979. *Female Sexual Slavery*. Englewood Cliffs NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- _____. 1995. *The Prostitution of Sexuality: The Global Exploitation of Women*. New York: New York University Press.
- Bell, David et al. "The Nation's Invisible Families: Living in the Stream." In *Rural Educator*, v15 n3, spr 1994, 27-30.
- Bernard van Leer Foundation. "Mobility and Young Children." In *Bernard van Leer Foundation Newsletter*, n76 Oct 1994, The Hague NL.
- Bishop, Ryan and Robinson, Lillian S. 1998. *Night Market: Sexual Cultures and the Thai Economic Miracle*. New York: Routledge.
- Blanc, Cristina S. and Chiozzi, Paolo. "Children of Migrants and Ethnic Minorities: An Overview and Conceptual Framework." In *Innocenti Occasional Papers, The Urban Child Series*, num 5, 1992.
- Bohlen, Celestine. "Journal: Exotic Imports Have Captured Italy's Sex Market." *The New York Times*. URL <http://www.nytimes.com/97/7/9/news/world/italy-prostitution.html> [Accessed 10 July 1997]

- Boix Storage, Alberto. 1988. "La inmigración uruguaya en España, 1970-1985". In *Inmigración, integración e imagen de los latinoamericanos en España 1931-1987*, ed. Alberto Boix Storage. Madrid: Organización de Estados Iberoamericanos para la Educación, la Ciencia y la Cultura.
- Bourgois, Philip. 1995. *In search of respect: Selling crack in El Barrio*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Brah, Avtar. 1996. *Cartographies of Diaspora*. London: Routledge.
- Brock, Rita Nakashima and Thistlethwaite, Susan Brooks. 1996. *Casting Stones: Prostitution and Liberation in Asia and the United States*. Minneapolis MN: Fortress Press.
- Brussa, Licia. 1994. *Transnational AIDS/STD Prevention Among Migrant Prostitutes in Europe/Project TAMPEP: Final Report*. Amsterdam: Mr. A. de Graaf Stichting.
- _____. 1996. *TAMPEP: Migrant Prostitution*. Amsterdam: Mr. A. de Graaf Stichting.
- _____. 1998. "Some problems concerning peer education." In *Research for Sex Work*. Amsterdam: Vrije Universiteit.
- _____. 1989. "Migrant Prostitutes in the Netherlands." In *A Vindication of the Rights of Whores*, G. Pheterson, ed., 204-226.
- Bullough, Vern and Bullough, Bonnie. 1978. *Women and Prostitution: A Social History*. Buffalo NY: Prometheus Books.
- Butler, Josephine Elizabeth. 1896. *Personal Reminiscences of a Great Crusade*. London: Horace Marshall.
- CAAAV Voice: Newsletter of the Committee Against Anti-Asian Violence. Vol. 9, Num 1, Winter 1997. New York.
- Cabello, Encarna. 1994. "Mujeres emigrantes marroquíes: un caso de 2a generación" en *II Jornadas sobre fuentes orales y gráficas para el estudio de las migraciones: El desafío de la inmigración africana en España*. Madrid: Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia
- Calvo Buezas, Tomás. 1994. "Diversidad cultural y educación: un reto para el siglo xxi." *Documentación Social* num 97.
- Cámara de Comercio de Bogotá. 1991. *La prostitución en el centro de Bogotá: Censo de establecimientos y personas: Análisis socioeconómico*. Bogotá: Cámara de Comercio.
- _____. 1995. "Pirobos": *Trabajadores sexuales en el centro de Santafe de Bogotá*. Corporación para el desarrollo integral de Bogotá y Cundinamarca.
- Campuzano Medina, Carmen. 1994. "Los inmigrantes africanos en la fotografía de Prensa Espanola: el diario <El Pais>" *II Jornadas sobre fuentes orales y gráficas para el estudio de las migraciones: El desafío de la inmigración africana en España*. Madrid: Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia
- Carbajal, Alejandro. "La Chopera: 'zona liberada'." *Página 20* [el latinoamericano] octubre 1995.
- Carretero, Andrés. 1995. *Prostitución en Buenos Aires*. Buenos Aires: Ediciones Corregidor.

- Casanova, Pilar. 1997. "Por qué se van a las prostitutas?" *Dunia* [448] 1 junio 1997, 38-41.
- Casas, María, Cordero, Tatiana and Foderingham, C. 1989. *Here One Gives One's Life*. Den Haag: Project Empowerment.
- Castañeda, Xochitl, Ortiz, Victor, Allen, Betania, García, Cecilia and Hernández-Avila, Mauricio. "Máscaras sexuales: La doble vida de las sexoservidoras del D.F." In *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry*, 1996, 20/2, junio, 229-247.
- Cavalcanti, Carla. 1985. *Prostitución: Esclavitud sexual femenina*. Santo Domingo: CIPAF.
- Chant, Sylvia and McIlwaine, Cathy. 1995. *Women of a Lesser Cost: Female Labour, Foreign Exchange and Philippine Development*. London: Pluto Press.
- Chapkis, Wendy. 1997. *Live Sex Acts*. New York: Routledge.
- _____ and Enloe, Cynthia Eds. 1983 *Of common cloth: Women in the global textile industry*. Amsterdam: Transnational Institute.
- Chatterjee, Ratnabali. "The Indian prostitute as a colonial subject: Bengal 1864-1883." In *Canadian Women's Studies*, 13, 1, 151-155, Fall 1992.
- Cheng, Shu Ju Ada. "Migrant Women Domestic Workers in Hong Kong, Singapore and Taiway: A Comparative Analysis." In *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal*, 1996, 5/1, 139-152.
- Coalition Against Trafficking Against Women. 1991. *Report of the Meeting of Experts on the International Action in the Struggle Against Sexual Exploitation and Prostitution*. State College PA: Coalition Against Trafficking Against Women.
- COIN (Centro de Orientación e Investigación Integral). 1992. *Trabajo y Salud*. Santo Domingo RD: COIN.
- _____ 1990. *Los triunfos de Maritza*. Santo Domingo RD: COIN.
- _____ 1994a. *Los viajes de Maritza*. Santo Domingo RD: COIN.
- _____ 1994b. *Viajes al Exterior: Ilusiones y Mentiras*. Santo Domingo RD: COIN.
- _____ 1995-97. *La nueva historia: Periódico de la Noche*. Santo Domingo RD: COIN.
- _____ 1996. *La industria del sexo por dentro*. Santo Domingo RD: COIN.
- _____ 1996. *Juntarnos: Memorias 1º Congreso Dominicano de Trabajadoras Sexuales*. Santo Domingo RD: COIN.
- Colectivo Ioé, coordinador. 1993. *Inmigración y mercado de trabajo: Encuentro de trabajo del proyecto europeo sobre nuevas dinámicas migratorias en Europa y sus efectos sobre los procesos de inserción-exclusión*. Madrid: Ioé.
- _____ y Martínez, Antonio y Sánchez, María Leticia. 1994. *La inmigración*. Madrid: Editorial Popular.
- _____ y Martínez, Antonio y Sánchez, María Leticia. 1994. "La inmigración en España: Principales Tendencias." In *La inmigración*, Colectivo Ioé, ed. Madrid: Editorial Popular.
- _____ (Actis, Walter, de Prada, Miguel Angel y Pereda, Carlos). 1996. *Procesos de inserción y exclusión social de las mujeres inmigrantes no comunitarias: informe de investigación*. Madrid: Ioé.
- _____ 1994. "La inmigración en España: Principales Tendencias." In *La inmigración*, Colectivo Ioé, ed. Madrid: Editorial Popular.

- Colomo, Concha, Cuadros, Alfonso and Mammar, Fadhila. 1998. *Salud y cooperación para el desarrollo*. Madrid: Médicos del Mundo.
- Comas, Amparo. 1991. "El adcentamiento del centro de Madrid y la prostitución." In *Prostitución: Mesa Redonda*. Madrid: Forum de Política Feminista.
- _____ and Reyero, Felipe. 1985. "Atención social y sanitaria a las personas relacionadas con la prostitución femenina en Madrid." In *Marginación social*, IRES, ed. Madrid: Consejería de Sanidad.
- Comisión Anti-Agresiones y Coordinadora de Grupos de Mujeres de Barrios y Pueblos de Madrid. 1990. *Debates feministas*. Madrid: Comisión Anti-Agresiones del Movimiento Feminista.
- Commission of the European Communities. 1996. *Communication from the Commission to the Council and the European Parliament on trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation*. Brussels: Commission of the European Communities.
- Congreso sobre la inmigración en España: 16-18 de octubre de 1997. Madrid: Fundació "la Caixa" e Instituto Universitario Ortega y Gasset.
- Corso, Carla. and Landi, S. 1991. *Ritratto a Tinte Forti*. Florence: Giunti Gruppo Editoriale.
- Costa, Xavier Besalú. 1994. "Educación intercultural en Europa." *Documentos Sociales* num 97 oct-dic 1994, 91-100.
- Criado, María Jesús. 1997. "Historias de vida: El valor del recuerdo, el poder de la palabra". *Migraciones Núm. 1*. Madrid: Instituto Universitario de Estudios sobre Migraciones.
- Cuadros Riobó, Alfonso 1997. "Salud e inmigraciones: La experiencia del programa de atención sociosanitaria a inmigrantes de Médicos del Mundo de Madrid." *Migraciones Núm 2*. 1997. Madrid: Instituto Universitario de Estudios sobre Migraciones, Universidad Pontificia Comillas.
- Danaher, P.A. "Marginalised Identities, Communications Technologies, and the Politics of Research: Issues in Interpreting the Educational Opportunities of the Children of the Showmen's Guild of Australasia." Paper presented at *Signs and Power: The Politics of Communication* seminar, Rockhampton, Queensland, Australia, 21 September 1993.
- Dangerous Bedfellows. 1996. *Policing Public Sex*. Boston: South End Press.
- de Graaf, R. 1995. *Prostitutes and Their Clients: Sexual Networks and Determinants of Condom Use*. Den Haag NL: CIP-Gegevens Koninklijke Bibliotheek.
- De La Fuente, Inmaculada and Moreno, Ricardo. "Jaqué al comprador de sexo." *El País*, [Domingo 10], 9 agosto 1998.
- De Vega, Carlos. "Los flujos de inmigrantes apuntalan la caída de la población autóctona en toda Europa." *El País [Sociedad 29]*. 14 julio 1997.
- Díaz, Beatriz. 1997. *Todo negro no igual--voces de emigrantes*. Barcelona: Virus Editorial.
- Directorate of Human Rights. 1994. *Final report of the Group of Specialists on action against traffic in women and forced prostitution*. Strasbourg: Council of Europe.

- Documentación Social* núm 97 oct-dic 1994: *Interculturalidad*. Madrid: Cáritas Española.
- Doezema, Jo. 1998. "Forced to choose: beyond the voluntary v. forced prostitution dichotomy". In *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York: Routledge.
- Dorronsoro, Alvarez. 1994. "Los retos de la inmigración." In *Los retos de la inmigración*, compiled by J. Contreras, 25-57. Madrid: Talasa Ediciones.
- Drumm, John E and Groom, Frank M. "The Cybermobile: A Gateway for Public Access to Network-Based Information." *Computers in Libraries*, v17 n1, Jan 1997, 29-33.
- Dutch Ministry of Social Affairs. 1997. *Notraf: Results of the questionnaire on Trafficking in Women*. Amsterdam: Mr. A. de Graaf Stichting.
- ECOE (Equipo de Comunicación Educativa). 1998. *Manifiesto de la iniciativa Papeles Para Todos*. Madrid: ECOE.
- El Saadawi, Nawal. 1975. *Woman at Point Zero*. London: Zed Books.
- Elordi Cué, C. and Núñez, E. "La inmigración ilegal invade las costas del sur de España en los meses de verano". *El País*. [España: 13] 9 agosto 1998.
- _____. 1998. "Legislar contra la desesperación". *El País*. [España: 15] 9 agosto 1998.
- Embarak López, Malika. 1994 "Mujeres emigrantes marroquíes en Madrid: historia de vida" In *II Jornadas sobre fuentes orales y gráficas para el estudio de las migraciones: El desafío de la inmigración africana en España*. Madrid: Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia
- Enloe, Cynthia. 1989. *Bananas, Beaches & Bases: Making Feminist Sense of International Politics*. London: Pandora Press.
- _____. 1983. *Does Khaki Become You? The Militarisation of Women's Lives*. Boston: South End Press.
- Escobar, Arturo. 1995. *Encountering Development*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Estébanez Estébanez, Pilar. 1998. "Un compromiso con la solidaridad." *Trabajadora* 6-7.
- _____. 1990. "Prostitution and AIDS in Spain." In *AIDS, drugs, and prostitution*, M. Plant, ed, 186-197. London: Routledge.
- EUROPAP/TAMPEP. 1998. *Hustling for Health: Developing Health Services for Sex Workers*. Brussels: European Commission.
- Exotic Dancers Alliance [nd]. *Community Building, Empowerment and Social Change for Sex Industry Workers*. San Francisco CA: EDA.
- Ezeomah, Chimah. 1990. *Educating Nomads for Self-Actualization and Development*. Geneva: International Bureau of Education.
- Fairclough, Gordon. "Doing the dirty work: Asia's brothels thrive on migrant labour." In *Far Eastern Economic Review*, Dec. 14, 1995, v158 n50, 27.
- Fanon, Frantz. 1952. *Peau Noire Masques Blanches*. Paris: Editions du Seuil.
- Farley, Melissa. "Prostitution: oldest use and abuse of women." In *Off Our Backs*, 24, n5, 14-15, May 1994.

- Ferguson, Ann. 1998. "Prostitution as a Morally Risky Practice from the Point of View of Feminist Radical Pragmatism". In *Daring to be good : essays in feminist ethico-politics*, ed B. Bar On and A. Ferguson, 199-207. New York: Routledge.
- _____. 1989. *Blood at the Root: Motherhood, Sexuality and Male Dominance*. London: Pandora.
- Fernández, Milena. 1996. "Un 'locutorio móvil' bajo los árboles." *El País*. [Madrid 4] 22 septiembre 1996.
- Fisher, Trevor. 1997. *Prostitution and the Victorians*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Forestier, Patrick. "Bangkok et Manille 'C'est fini': Saint-Domingue Nouveau rendez-vous du 'sex tourism'." In *ParisMatch*, 1994, 4-6.
- Foucault, Michel. 1978. *History of Sexuality Volume I: An Introduction: The Will to Know*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- _____. 1985. *History of Sexuality Volume II: The Use of Pleasure*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- _____. 1986. *History of Sexuality Volume III: The care of the self*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Freeman, Ashley. "The Travelling Schools of New South Wales: 1908-1949." In *Education in Rural Australia*, v.3 n1, 1993, 7-18.
- Fuentes, Santiago. "El Gobierno asegura que Melilla será en octubre 'infranqueable' para los inmigrantes ilegales." *El País* [España 17]. 12 agosto 1998.
- Fundación Dolores Ibárruri. [nd] "Esclavas del fin de siglo XX: El Tráfico de mujeres extranjeras se ha duplicado en España." *Mujeres en Acción*. Verano 1998 Núm 23.
- Gallardo, Gina. 1995. *Buscando la vida*. Santo Domingo: CIPAF.
- Gálvez, T. and Todaro, R. 1985. *Yo trabajo así...en casa particular*. Santiago de Chile: Ediciones CEM.
- Gamburd, Michele Ruth. "Sri Lanka's 'Army of Housemaids': Control of Remittances and Gender Transformations." In *Anthropologica*, 1995, 37/1, 49-88.
- Garaizabal, Cristina. 1991. "La prostitución: un debate abierto." In *Prostitución: Mesa Redonda*. Madrid: Forum de Política Feminista.
- García-Moreno, Claudia. 1997. "AIDS: Women are Not Just Transmitters." In *The Women, Gender and Development Reader*, ed. N. Visvanathan et al, 302-309. London: Zed Books.
- Género y Sociedad*. vol 4 núm 1 mayo-agosto 1996. Número sobre migraciones. Santo Domingo RD: INTEC/Iepala.
- Georges, Eugenia. 1990. *The Making of a Transnational Community: migration, development, and cultural change in the Dominican Republic*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Gibson-Graham, J. 1996. *The End of Capitalism (as we knew it)*. Cambridge: Blackwell.
- Giménez Romero, Carlos (director del equipo). 1992. *Primeros resultados del Proyecto de Investigación "La segunda generación: Estudio demográfico y sociocultural de los hijos de los inmigrantes extranjeros en Madrid."* Madrid: Universidad Autónoma de Madrid.
- Goldman, Emma. 1917. *The Traffic in Women, Marriage and Love and Women Suffrage*. New York: Mother Earth Publishing Association.

- Goldar, Ernesto. 1971. *La "mala vida"*. Buenos Aires: Centro Editor de America Latina.
- Gómez Font, Alberto. 1994. "El archivo fotográfico de la Agencia EFE: el caso de las migraciones." In *II Jornadas sobre fuentes orales y gráficas para el estudio de las migraciones: El desafío de la inmigración africana en España*. Madrid: Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia
- Grasmuck, Sherri & Pessar, Patricia R. 1991. *Between Two Islands: Dominican International Migration*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Gregorio Gil, Carmen 1996a. *Estudio de la red migratoria del colectivo dominicano en Madrid*. Madrid: Dirección General de Migraciones.
- _____. 1996b. *Sistemas de género y migración internacional. La emigración dominicana a la comunidad de Madrid*. Madrid: Universidad Autónoma de Madrid. Tesis de doctorado.
- _____. 1997. "El estudio de las migraciones internacionales desde una perspectiva del género" *Migraciones Núm.1*. Madrid: Instituto Universitario de Estudios sobre Migraciones.
- Guarnizo, Luís Eduardo. 1992. *One country in two: Dominican-owned firms in New York and in the Dominican Republic*. Doctoral dissertation, Johns Hopkins University.
- _____. 1994. "Los dominicanoyorks: The Making of a Binational Society." In *Annals, AAPSS*, 533, May 1994.
- Guy, Donna. 1991. *Sex and Danger in Buenos Aires*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.
- Hanson, Jody. "Sex Tourism as Work in New Zealand: A Discussion with Kiwi Prostitutes." In *Pacific Rim Tourism*, M. Oppermann, ed. Oxon UK: CAB International.
- Hart, Angie. 1998. *Buying and Selling Power: Anthropological Reflections on Prostitution in Spain*. Boulder CO: Westview Press.
- Hartmann, Betsy. 1987. [1995] *Reproductive Rights and Wrongs*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Haour-Knipe, Mary and Rector, Richard. Eds. 1996. *Crossing Borders: Migration, Ethnicity and AIDS*. London: Taylor & Francis.
- Harcourt, Wendy, ed. 1994. *Feminist perspectives on sustainable development*. London: Zed Books in association with Society for International Development Rome.
- _____, ed. 1998. *Women@Internet: Creating New Cultures in Cyberspace*. London: Zed Books.
- _____, ed. 1997. *Women working on the Net*. UNESCO.
- Harris, Barbara. 1995. "Rethinking Prostitution." In *Transitions: New Australian feminisms*, B. Caine and R. Pringle, eds., 184-197. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Hernández Velasco, Irene. 1996. "Un millón de hombres al día va de prostitutas." *El Mundo*. [Sociedad 26]. 27 diciembre 1996.

- Herranz Gómez, Yolanda. 1996. *Formas de incorporación laboral de la inmigración latinoamericana de Madrid. Importancia del contexto de recepción*. Madrid: Universidad Autónoma de Madrid. Tesis de doctorado.
- _____. 1992. "Trabajadores latinoamericanos en Madrid." *Economía y Sociedad*. Madrid: Consejería de Economía CAM.
- _____. 1997. "Mujeres dominicanas en el servicio doméstico de Pozuelo-Aravaca." In *Cuadernos de Relaciones Laborales* num 10. Madrid: Escuela de Relaciones Laborales, Universidad Complutense de Madrid.
- Hershatter, Gail. 1997. *Dangerous Pleasures: Prostitution and Modernity in Twentieth-Century Shanghai*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- hooks, bell. 1992. *Black Looks: Race and Representation*. Boston: South End Press.
- _____. 1984. *Feminist Theory from Margin to Center*. Boston: South End Press.
- Huguet Santos, Montserrat. 1988. "El concepto de la hispanidad en el franquismo de la inmediata postguerra 1939-1945". In *Inmigración, integración e imagen de los latinoamericanos en España 1931-1987*, ed. Alberto Boix Storace. Madrid: Organización de Estados Iberoamericanos para la Educación, la Ciencia y la Cultura.
- IEPALA (Instituto de Estudios Políticos Para América Latina y Africa). 1986. *Jornadas sobre "Emigración, exilio y mujer"*. Madrid: Iepala Editorial.
- Instituto de la Mujer (Chile). "Peer group AIDS prevention among prostitutes." In *Isis Women's Health Journal*, 4, 67-72, Oct-Dec 1992.
- International Committee for Prostitutes' Rights World Charter. 1985. Amsterdam NL.
- IOM (International Office for Migration). 1996. *Trafficking in women from the Dominican Republic for sexual exploitation: migration information programme*. Geneva: IOM.
- _____. 1996. *Trafficking in women for sexual exploitation to Italy: migration information programme*. Geneva: IOM.
- ISIS (Inter-Cultural Studies Information Service). 1979. "Tourism and Prostitution". In special issue of *ISIS International Bulletin*, 13.
- Izquierdo, Antonio. 1996. *La inmigración inesperada: la población extranjera en España 1991-95*. Madrid: Editorial Trotta.
- Juliano, Dolores. 1994. "Migración extracomunitaria y sistema educativo: el caso latinoamericano." In *Los retos de la inmigración*, compiled by J. Contreras, 147-160. Madrid: Talasa Ediciones.
- _____. 1993. *Educación intercultural: Escuela y minorías étnicas*. Madrid: EUEDEMA.
- _____. 1993. "Las experiencias interculturales." In *Educación intercultural: Escuela y minorías étnicas*, ed. D. Juliano, 63-72. Madrid: EUEDEMA.
- _____. 1994. "Un lugar en el mundo: identidad, espacio e inmigración."
- Kempadoo, Kamala. 1995. *State pimpage: regulating prostitution in the Dutch Caribbean*. Boulder: University of Colorado.
- _____. and Doezeema, Jo. 1998. *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York: Routledge.

- Khurana, Inderjit. "Taking the School to the Child: An Experiment by Ruchika School Service Wing." In *International Journal of Early Childhood*, v.24 n2, 1992, 59-61.
- Kirman, Mubina and Munyakho, D. 1996. "The Impact of Structural Adjustment Programs on Women and AIDS". In *Women's Experiences with HIV/AIDS*, L. Long and E.M. Ankrah, eds., 160-178. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kootstra, Trijntje. 1996. *Background Study on Basic Principles for a Code of Conduct withing the Member States of the European Union to Prevent and Combat Traffic in Women*. Utrecht NL: STV.
- _____. 1997. *La Strada Program: Prevention of Traffic in Women in Central and Eastern Europe*. Utrecht NL: STV.
- Kulick, Don. 1998. *Travesti: Sex, Gender and Culture among Brazilian Transgendered Prostitutes*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Lane, Barbara. "Filipina Domestic Workers in Hong Kong." In *Asian-Migrant*, 1992, 5/1, Jan-Mar, 24-32.
- Latorre, José María. 1997. "Cómo operan las mafias de la prostitución africana en España." *Tribuna*. 29 julio 1997.
- Law, Lisa. 1997. "Dancing on the Bar: Sex, money and the uneasy politics of third space." In *Geographies of Resistance*, S. Pile and M. Keith, eds. London: Routledge.
- Lee, Wendy. 1991. "Prostitution and tourism in South-East Asia." In *Working women: International perspectives on labour and gender ideology*, ed. N. Redclift and M.T. Sinclair, 79-103. New York: Routledge.
- Leigh, Carol. 1997. "Trafficking and the Distinction Between Forced and Voluntary Prostitution." *Prostitutes' Education Network*
<http://www.bayswan.org/penet.html>
- Liao, Su-su. 1998. "Lack of motivation of restaurant girls from drop-in activities to outreach work." In *Research for Sex Work*. Amsterdam: Vrije Universiteit.
- Licitra, Alejandro. 1988. "Españoles en Argentina y Argentinos en España: un estudio comparativo". In *Inmigración, integración e imagen de los latinoamericanos en España 1931-1987*, ed. Alberto Boix Storace. Madrid: Organización de Estados Iberoamericanos para la Educación, la Ciencia y la Cultura.
- Lie, John. "The transformation of sexual work in 20th century Korea." In *Gender & Society*, 9 n3, 310-327, Jan 1995.
- Lockett, Gloria. 1995. "The Struggle to Survive." In *Women Resisting AIDS: Feminist Strategies of Empowerment*, B. Schneider and N. Stoller, eds., 208-218. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Logan, William 1871. *The Great Social Evil: its causes, extent, results, and remedies*. London: Hodder & Stoughton.
- Longo, Paulo Henrique. 1998. "AIDS information, prevention, and empowerment of young male sex workers in Rio de Janeiro." In *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York: Routledge.
- Mak, Rudolf. 1996. *EUROPAP: European Intervention Projects AIDS Prevention for Prostitutes*. Gent: Europap.

- Marchand, Marianne. 1995. "Latin American Women Speak on Development: Are We Listening Yet?" In *Feminism/Postmodernism/Development*, M. Marchand and J. Parpart, eds., 56-72. London: Routledge.
- Marrodán, M.D., David, Ivonne et al. 1991. *Mujeres del Tercer Mundo en España: Modelo Migratorio y Caracterización Sociodemográfica*. Madrid: Fundación CIPIE (Centro de Información y Orientación para la Mujer Inmigrante, Refugiada o Asilada de la Fundación).
- _____, Herranz, Yolanda y García Ruíz, C.M. 1991 *El asociacionismo iberoamericano en Madrid*. Madrid: Cátedra de Antropología, Facultad de Ciencias Biológicas, Universidad Complutense de Madrid.
- Matsui, Yayori. 1987. *Women's Asia*. London: Zed Books.
- Matthews, Lyn. 1990. "Female prostitutes in Liverpool." In *AIDS, drugs, and prostitution*, M. Plant, ed, 76-87. London: Routledge.
- McClintock, Anne, ed. *Social Text* Winter 1993, [37] Special section explores the sex trade.
- Metzenrath, Sue. 1998. "In touch with the needs of sex workers." In *Research for Sex Work*. Amsterdam: Vrije Universiteit.
- Migraciones Núm 1*. 1997. Instituto Universitario de Estudios sobre Migraciones. Madrid: Universidad Pontificia Comillas.
- Migraciones Núm 2*. 1997. Madrid: Instituto Universitario de Estudios sobre Migraciones, Universidad Pontificia Comillas.
- Migrants against HIV/AIDS. 1997. *French Report Recommends Mandatory HIV Testing for Pregnant Women*. Geneva: MAHA.
- Miller, Laura. "Private Schools, Goin' Mobile." In *Teacher Magazine*, v6 n8, May-Jun 1995, 16-17.
- Ministerial Conference. 1997. *The Hague Ministerial Declaration on European Guidelines for Effective Measures to Prevent and Combat Trafficking in Women for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation*. The Hague: Ministry of Social Affairs.
- Minu Pal, Sadhana Mukherji, Madhabi Jaiswal and Bachhu Dutta. 1998. "The wind of change is whispering at your door: the Mahila Samanwaya committee." In *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. New York: Routledge.
- Miura, Asunción. 1991. "Abolicionismo, integración y propuestas sobre prostitución." In *Prostitución: Mesa Redonda*. Madrid: Forum de Política Feminista.
- Mohanty, Chandra Talpade. 1991. "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses." In *Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism*, C.T. Mohanty, A. Russo and L. Torres, 51-80. Bloomington IN: Indiana University Press.
- Molander, Elizabeth R. "Travellers' Children in a Junior School in Norfolk." Master's of Arts Dissertation, University of East Anglia, 1991.
- Montgomery, Heather. 1998. "Children, prostitution, and identity: a case study from a tourist resort in Thailand." In *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition..* New York: Routledge.
- Moraga, Cherrie and Anzaldúa, Gloria, eds. 1983. *This Bridge Called My Back: Writings by Radical Women of Color*. New York: Kitchen Table Press.

- Morales Lezcano, Victor (ed.). 1994. *II Jornadas sobre fuentes orales y gráficas para el estudio de las migraciones: El desafío de la inmigración africana en España*. Madrid: Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia
- Morokvasic, Mirjana. "Birds of Passage are also Women." In *IMR* vol 18 n4, invierno 1984, 886-907.
- _____. "Fortress Europe and migrant women." In *Feminist Review*, Autumn 1991 n39, 69.
- Mukherjee, K.K. 1989. *Flesh Trade A Report*. Uttar Pradesh: The Gram Niyojan Kendra.
- Munn, Alan. *Pimps 'R' US Goes to the Dominican Republic*.
URL <http://www.ajmunn.com/alan/a/esDR.html> [Accessed 22 September 1996]
- Muroi, Hisae and Sasaki, Naoko. 1997. "Tourism and prostitution in Japan." In *Gender, Work and Tourism*, T. Sinclair, ed., 180-219. London: Routledge.
- Murray, Alison. 1991. *No Money, No Honey: A Study of Street Traders and Prostitutes in Jakarta*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- _____. 1995. "Trafficking Sex Slaves Horror: Time to Challenge the Anti-Prostitution Lobby." *The Professional June-August 1995*.
- Nagle, Jill, ed. 1997. *Whores and Other Feminists*. New York: Routledge.
- Narimani, Petra, Gallé, Felix and Tovar, Jaime. 1996. "International Networking: Building Migrants' Networks across Europe." In *Crossing Border: Migration, Ethnicity and AIDS*, M. Haour-Knipe and R. Rector, eds., 207-221.
- Navarro, Mayka. "Dólares húmedos." *el Periódico* [cosas de la vida 16] 29 diciembre 1997.
- Nead, Lynda. 1988. *Myths of sexuality: representations of women in Victorian Britain*. Oxford: B. Blackwell.
- NHSA Journal*, v13 n1, Sum 1994, 39-41. "Computers, Collaboration Take to the Road."
- Nigam, Nikhil. "Sex slavery: From the hills of Nepal to the brothels of Delhi." In *MANUSHI*, 77:23, 5, July-August 1993.
- Nodo50 et al. "Telemática Solidaria." *de Sur a Sur: Revista Andaluza de Solidaridad, Paz y Cooperación*. num 14. marzo 1998.
- Nommensen, Elisabeth. "A Rural and Remote Children's Mobile Service--Wanaaring." In *Issues Affecting Rural Communities*. Proceedings of an International Conference Held by the Rural Education Research and Development Centre (Townsville, Queensland, Australia) July 1994.
- Núñez-Roldán, Francisco. 1995. *Mujeres públicas: Historia de la prostitución en España*. Madrid: Ediciones Temas de Hoy.
- Nuqui, Carmelita. "The plight of women entertainers in Japan." In *ISIS in Action*, 2-3, 48-52, 1993.
- Odzer, Cleo. 1994. *Patpong Sisters: An American Woman's View of the Bangkok Sex World*. New York: Arcade Publishing and Blue Moon Books.
- Olabe, Fernando and Piqueres, Begoña. "Sólo veinte minutos por cliente." *El Mundo*. año ix núm 101, [Crónica 12], 21 septiembre 1997.

- O'Neill, Maggie. "Women at work: prostitution and feminism in the context of late modernity." In *Phoebe: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Feminist Scholarship*, 4, 1, 25-36, Spring 1992.
- Oppermann, Martin, ed. 1998. *Sex Tourism and Prostitution: Aspects of Leisure, Recreation, and Work*. Cammeray NSW: Cognizant Communication Corporation.
- Ordaz, Pablo. "Ir a faenar en pateras azules". *El País*. [España 18]. 6 julio 1998.
- Osborne, Raquel. 1991a. *Las prostitutas: Una voz propia (Crónica de un encuentro)*. Barcelona: ICARIA Editorial.
- _____. 1991b. "Del estigma a la solidaridad feminista y social." In *Prostitución: Mesa Redonda*. Madrid: Forum de Política Feminista.
- Oso Casas, Laura and Machín, Sonia. 1993. "Choque de culturas: El caso de los inmigrantes dominicanos en la CAM." In *Sociedad y Utopía*, num 1. marzo 1993, 193-199. Madrid: Facultad de Ciencias Políticas y Sociología, Universidad Pontificia de Salamanca.
- _____. and Catarino, Christine. 1997. "Les effets de la migration sur le statut des femmes: Le cas des Dominicaines et des Marocaines à Madrid et des Cap-Verdiennes à Lisbonne." In *Migrations: Société*. vol ix, num 52, juillet-aout 1997. Paris: CIEMI.
- Overs, Cheryl. "Sex work, HIV and the state: an interview with Nel Druce." In *Feminist Review*, Autumn 1994 n48, 114-8.
- Pankhurst, Christabel. 1913 *Plain Facts About A Great Evil*. New York: The Medical Review of Reviews.
- Parent-Duchatelet, Alexandre-Jean-Baptiste. 1836. *De la prostitution dans la ville de Paris, considérée sous le rapport de l'hygiène publique, de la morale et de l'administration*. Brussels BE: Hauman, Cattoir et cie.
- Pascual, Ana María. "Una colombiana que evitó la trampa de los proxenetas." *Diario 16* [Sociedad 28]. 16 agosto 1997.
- Passar Kaner, L. 1995. Daw Passar: Her Point of View. Prostitutes' Education Network. URL <http://www.bayswan.org/Dawn.html>
- Pheterson, Gail. 1996. *The Prostitution Prism*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- _____. , ed. 1989. *A Vindication of the Rights of Whores*. Seattle WN: Seal Press.
- Pile, Steve and Keith, Michael, eds. 1997. *Geographies of Resistance*. London: Routledge
- Plant, Martin, ed. 1990. *AIDS, drugs, and prostitution*. London: Routledge.
- Polanía Molina, Fanny. "Tráfico internacional de mujeres: Nuevas alternativas frente a un antiguo problema." In *Ofrim/Suplementos*, dic 1997, 141-150. Madrid: Dirección General de Servicios Sociales, Consejería de Sanidad y Servicios Sociales.
- ProFem. [nd]. *Central European Consulting Centre for Women's Projects*. Prague CR: ProFem.
- Prostituiertenprojekkt Hydra. 1991. *Freier: Das Heimliche Treiben der Männer*. Hamburg: Galgenberg.

- Prostitution Information Centre. 1997. *Who, What, Where, Why, PIC*. Amsterdam: PIC.
- Rama, Angel. 1984. *La ciudad letrada*. Hanover NH: Ediciones del Norte.
- Reback, Cathy. 1994. "Constructing the Outreach Moment: Street Interventions to Women at Risk." In *Women Resisting AIDS: Feminist Strategies of Empowerment*, B. Schneider and N. Stoller, eds., 170-191. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Red de Apoyo a la Mujer. [nd]. *Críticas a la Propuesta de Ley que Regula el Sexoservicio en el D.F.* Distrito Federal MX: Red de Apoyo a la Mujer.
- Reiter, Rayna. Ed. 1975. *Toward an Anthropology of Women*. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Rivas Niña, Myrna. 1997. *El análisis de los 'problemas sociales' y el desarrollo de políticas públicas desde una perspectiva psico-sociológica: la inmigración en la Comunidad Autónoma de Madrid entre 1989 y 1994*. Madrid: Universidad Complutense de Madrid. Tesis doctoral.
- _____. 1992. "Entre la realidad y el sueño: el caso de la inmigración de la mujer dominicana en España." In *Cuadernos Africa/América Latina*. Num 9 jun-sep 1992. Madrid: SODEPAZ.
- Roberts, Nickie. 1992. *Whores in History: Prostitution in Western Society*. London: HarperCollins.
- Rossell, Oriol. 1998. "Latinos." *Ajoblanco*, 38-43. 1 febrero 1998.
- Rubin, Gayle. 1975. "The Traffic in Women: Notes on the 'Political Economy' of Sex." In *Toward an Anthropology of Women*, ed. R. Reiter, 157-210. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- _____. 1984. "Thinking Sex: Notes for a Radical Theory of the Politics of Sexuality." In *Pleasure and Danger* p. 267-319.
- _____. and Butler, Judith. 1994. "Sexual Traffic". *differences: a journal of feminist cultural studies*. 6.2+3.
- Saez, Flora. "Buscando a 'Claude'." *El Mundo*, año ix, núm 80, 27 abril 1997.
- Said, Edward. 1978. *Orientalism*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Salt, J. & Clout, H. 1976. *Migration in Post-War Europe*. London: Oxford University Press.
- Sánchez Hernández, M. Leticia. 1994. "La inmigración femenina en España." In *La inmigración*, Colectivo IOE, ed. Madrid: Editorial Popular.
- Sanghera, Jyoti. 1997. *In the Belly of the Beast: Sex Trade, Prostitution and Globalization*. Victoria BC: GAATW.
- Sax, Marjan. 1987. "The Pink Thread." In *Sex Work: Writings by women in the sex industry*, F. Delacoste and P. Alexander, eds., 301-304. San Francisco: Cleis Press.
- Scambler, Graham & Scambler, Annette, eds. 1997. *Rethinking prostitution: purchasing sex in the 1990s*. London: Routledge.
- Schneider, Beth and Stoller, Nancy, eds. 1995. *Women Resisting AIDS: Feminist Strategies of Empowerment*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Schoepf, Brooke. 1994. "Action Research, Empowerment in Africa." In *Women Resisting AIDS: Feminist Strategies of Empowerment*, B. Schneider and N. Stoller, eds., 246-269. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

- Segal, Lynne and McIntosh, Mary. 1993. *Sex exposed: sexuality and the pornography debate*. London: Virago Press.
- Sen, Gita and Snow, R.C. 1994. *Power and Decision: The Social Control of Reproduction*. Boston: Harvard School of Public Health.
- _____ and Germain, A. and Chen, L. 1994 *Population Policies Reconsidered: Health, Empowerment, and Rights* Boston: Harvard School of Public Health.
- Shallat, Lezah. "Thai sex workers and EMPOWER: Power to the bar girls." *ISIS Women's Health Journal*, 1:67, 9, Jan-Mar 1994.
- Shelton, Lois. 1995. *Silence Doesn't Mean 'Yes': What Live-in Caregivers & Domestic Workers should know about harassment and sexual assault*. Vancouver BC: West Coast Domestic Workers Association.
- Sherry, Andrew, Lee, Matthew and Vatikiotis, Michael. "For lust or money: commercial sex industry in Asia." In *Far Eastern Economic Review*, Dec. 14, 1995, v158 n50, 22.
- Shields, Rob. 1991. *Places on the Margin*. London: Routledge.
- Sibley, David. 1981. *Outsiders in Urban Societies*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- _____ 1995. *Geographies of Exclusion*. London: Routledge.
- Simmons, Melanie J. "Hookers, Hustlers and Round-Trip Vacationers: The Gender Dynamics of Sex and Romance Tourism." In *Society for the Study of Social Problems* paper 1996.
- Sinclair, Thea, ed. 1997. *Gender, Work, Tourism*. London: Routledge
- Sittitrai, Werasit. 1993. "Outreach to bar workers in Bangkok." In *Women and HIV/AIDS An International Resource Book*, M. Berer and S. Ray, eds., London: Pandora Press.
- Skrobanek, Siriporn. 1994. *The Diary of Prang*. Bangkok: Women Press.
- _____, Boonpakdee, Nataya and Jantateero, Chutima. 1997. *The Traffic in Women: Human Realities of the International Sex Trade*. London: Zed Books.
- Slamah, Khartini. 1998. "Transgenders and sex work in Malaysia." In *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition..* New York: Routledge.
- Sleightholme, Carolyn and Sinha, Indrani. 1996. *Guilty without Trial: Women in the Sex Trade in Calcutta*. New Brunswick NJ: Rutgers University Press
- Solé, Carlota. 1994. *La mujer inmigrante*. Madrid: Instituto de la Mujer Ministerio de Asuntos Sociales.
- Sordo, Julien. "Por fin vemos la luz del día: 8 ex prostitutas que han salido del infierno." *Marie-Claire* [112] mayo 1997.
- Stallybrass, Peter & White, Allon 1986 *The Politics and Poetics of Transgression*. Ithaca NY: Cornell University Press.
- Stichting SOA-Bestrijding. 1997. *Trabajar Seguro*. Utrecht NL: SOA.
- Stichting Tegen Vrouwenhandel. 1996. *Tráfico de mujeres para prostitución, trabajo doméstico y matrimonio: América Latina y el Caribe*. Utrecht: STV.
- _____. [nd] *Trafficking and Standard Minimum Rules*. Draft. Utrecht NL: STV.
- Street, Brian. 1995. *Social literacies: critical approaches to literacy in development, ethnography and education*. London: Longman.

- Sturdevant, Sandra and Stolzhus, Brenda. 1992. *Let the Good Times Roll: Prostitution and the U.S. Military in Asia*. New York: The New Press
- Tabet, Paola. 1989. "I'm the Meat, I'm the Knife: Sexual Service, Migration and Repression in Some African Societies." In *A Vindication of the Rights of Whores*. Seattle WN: Seal Press.
- TAMPEP (Transnational AIDS/STD Prevention Among Migrant Prostitutes in Europe/Project). 1994. *dicas & jeitinhos*. Utrecht NL: SOA.
- _____. (nd). *Consejos de seguridad en el trabajo*. Utrecht NL: SOA.
- _____. 1994. *TAMPEP Manual*. Amsterdam: Mr. A. de Graaf Stichting.
- Tamzali, Wassyla. 1997. *Prostitución*. Madrid: Dirección General de la Mujer.
- The Middle East*, April 1995, n244, 8. "Waiting for the boat."
- Tornos, A., Aparicio, R. Labrador, J., García, M., Muñoz, H. 1997. *Los peruanos que vienen*. Madrid: Universidad Pontificia Comillas.
- Torres, Paco. "Inmigración: el contingente hipócrita." *Página Abierta*. n 84, 8-9, 1998.
- Trinh T. Minh-ha. 1989. *Women, Native, Other*. Bloomington IN: Indiana University Press.
- _____. 1991. *When the Moon Waxes Red: Representation, Gender and Cultural Politics*. New York: Routledge.
- Tristan, Rosa M. "La vida en el 'malecón' de Cuatro Caminos." *El Mundo*. [Madrid 4]. 25 enero 1996.
- Truong, Thanh-Dam. 1990. *Sex, Money and Morality: Prostitution and Tourism in Southeast Asia*. London: Zed Books.
- Tyner, James A. "Constructions of Filipina Migrant Entertainers." In *Gender, Place and Culture*, 1996, 3/1, Mar, 77-93.
- United for Intercultural Action. 1997. *Legalise them! Papers for All in Europe!* Amsterdam: United.
- Urrea-Giraldo, Fernando. "Principales tendencias de los procesos migratorios en Colombia y la internacionalización de la economía." In *Estudios Migratorios Latinoamericanos*, 1993, 8/23. abr, 5-17.
- Urry, John. 1990. *The tourist gaze: Leisure and travel in contemporary societies*. London: Sage Publications.
- _____. 1995. *Consuming Places*. London: Routledge.
- Vance, Carole S. 1984. *Pleasure and Danger: Exploring Female Sexuality*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Van Der Veen, Marjo. 1998. *Rethinking Prostitution: Beyond Commodification*. Draft manuscript, University of Massachusetts, Amherst
- Vázquez Montalbán, Manuel. 1983. *La rosa de Alejandría*. Madrid: Booket.
- Velasco, Peggy. *I Am a Global Commodity: Women Domestic Workers, Structural Adjustment and Global Solidarity*. Telecommons Development Group, University of Guelph Rural Extension Studies. URL <http://www.tdg.uoguelph.ca> [Accessed 10 May 1997].
- Venema, Petrien Uniken and Visser, Jan. 1990. "Safer prostitution in Holland." In *AIDS, drugs, and prostitution*, M. Plant, ed. 41-60. London: Routledge.

- Verbeek, Hensje and van der Zijden, Terry. 1987. "The Red Thread: Whores' Movements in Holland." In *Sex Work: Writings by women in the sex industry*, F. Delacoste and P. Alexander, eds., 297-300. San Francisco: Cleis Press.
- Vicent, Manuel. "Mulatas." *El País* 3 mayo 1998.
- Vidal, Jose Antonio y Gascón, Nieves. 1996 "Estudio de la situación de los inmigrantes sin recursos en los municipios de la mancomunidad del suroeste de la CAM. Vol I. Madrid: Médicos del Mundo.
- Walkowitz, Judith. 1980. *Prostitution and Victorian Society*. London: Cambridge University Press.
- Waring, Marilyn. 1988. *If Women Counted*. San Francisco CA: Harper & Row.
- White, Luise. 1990. *The Comforts of Home: Prostitution in Colonial Nairobi*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Wijers, Marjan and Lap-Chew, Lin. *Trafficking in Women, Forced Labour and Slavery-like Practices in Marriage, Domestic Labour and Prostitution*. Utrecht: 1996.
- Wilson, Elizabeth. 1992. "Feminist fundamentalism: the shifting politics of sex and censorship". In *Sex exposed: sexuality and the pornography debate* ed. Lynne Segal and Mary McIntosh, London: Virago Press.
- Wolffers, Ivan. "Why this initiative is important." *Research for Sex Work*. June 1998. Amsterdam: Vrije Universiteit.
- Working Party on Women Migrants. 1978. *Migrant Women Speak*. London: Search Press.
- World Council of Churches. "Proclaiming Migrants' Rights: The New International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families." In *Churches' Committee for Migrants in Europe Briefing Papers No. 3*, 1991, Geneva.
- World Sex Guide. "A travel report from Boca Chica, Dominican Republic--It's True!" URL <http://spunky.paranoia.com/prostitution> Accessed March 1997]
- World Whores' Congress Statement. 1986. Brussels BE.
- Wynter, Sarah. 1987. "Whisper: Women Hurt in Systems of Prostitution Engaged in Revolt." In *Sex Work: Writings by Women in the Sex Industry*, 266-270, ed. F. Delacoste and P. Alexander. San Francisco CA: Cleis Press.
- Yagüe, Antonio M. "El turismo español a Cuba se dispara." *el Periódico* [cosas de la vida 16] 29 diciembre 1997.
- Younis Hernández, Julio. 1994. "Los que se fueron: emigración y consecuencias: El dilema de la diferencia." In *Cultura, Psicología y Problemas Sociales*, José Younis, comp. Las Palmas (Gran Canaria): Librería Nogal Ediciones/Universidad de Las Palmas de Gran Canarias.
- Zapata de la Vega, Javier. 1992. "La 2a generación latinoamericana en la CAM." In C. Giménez Romero, ed. *Primeros resultados del Proyecto de Investigación "La segunda generación: Estudio demográfico y sociocultural de los hijos de los inmigrantes extranjeros en Madrid"*. Madrid: Universidad Autónoma de Madrid.

Selected electronic websites: prostitution-related

The Magick of Sex <http://www.realm-of-shade.com/forums/meretrix/>
Prostitutes' Education Network <http://www.bayswan.org/penet.html>
Clarity for Sensuous Encounters in Texas <http://members.aol.com/clarit/index.htm>
Erótico Carolina <http://www.erotico-carolina.com/>
ISWFACE/COYOTE <http://www.freedomusa.org/>
Lifeline Sex Work Project <http://www.lifeline.demon.co.uk/sex/intro.html>
The Black Rose <http://www.black-rose.com/index.html>
Network of Sex Work Projects <http://www.walnet.org/csis/groups/nswp/index.html>
PONY <http://www.walnet.org/csis/groups/pony.html>
Prostitución es un trabajo http://www.geocities.com/WestHollywood/7258/pag_es.htm
SWOP Australia <http://www.rainbow.net.au/~swop/>
How to Use Escort Services--A Men's Guide <http://www.perkel.com/sex/escort/>
WISE <http://www.bayswan.org/wise.html>
Whore Activist Network <http://www.bayswan.org/wise.html>
Xaviera Hollander <http://www.xs4all.nl/~xaviera/>
Exotic Dancers Alliance <http://www.bayswan.org/EDAindex.html>
World Sex Guide <http://www.worldsexguide.org/#this>
Cibeles Trans Página de Transgénero <http://personales.mundivia.es/trans/index.htm>
Feminists Against Censorship <http://www.fiawol.demon.co.uk>
Calcutta Manifesto of Sex Workers' Rights <http://www.bayswan.org/manifest.html>
Commercial Sex Information Service <http://www.walnet.org/csis/index.html#top>

